Chapter 2

An Overview of Evaluation Results
Chapter 2: An Overview of Evaluation Results

2.1 Results of ODA Evaluations by MOFA

2.1.1 An Overview of FY2005 Evaluation

As mentioned in Chapter 1, ODA evaluation of MOFA is composed of three levels: policy-level evaluations, program-level evaluations and project-level evaluations. (Evaluation of grant aid projects was introduced in FY2005). In FY2005, 13 policy- and program-level evaluations, and 52 project-level evaluations were carried out.

In terms of policy-level evaluations, MOFA carried out four country policy evaluations (Cambodia, Kenya, Tanzania and Senegal), which examined Japanese country assistance policies to the respective countries, and two priority issue evaluations (Evaluation of Japanese ODA Contribution to Poverty Reduction and Evaluation of Japan’s Peacebuilding Assistance Policy), to assess Japanese assistance policies on specific priority issues.

Program-level evaluations included four sector program evaluations (evaluation on infrastructure sector in Bangladesh and in Vietnam, evaluation on educational sector in the Philippines and in Mongolia) which essentially examined all ODA activities undertaken in a specific sector of a given country. Three aid modality evaluations (evaluation on Grassroots Human Security Grant Aid, Review of General Budget Support Programs and Evaluation on Non-Project Grant Aid Program in Zambia) were also conducted, assessing the performance of the aid modalities of Japan.

Ex-post evaluation on grant aid projects was introduced in FY2005 as part of project-level evaluations. On a trial basis, each embassy selected one to two of the 113 projects that had been completed three to five years ago.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Category</th>
<th>Evaluation Study (country / sector)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy-level Evaluation</td>
<td>Country Assistance Evaluation of Cambodia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country Assistance Evaluation of Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country Assistance Evaluation of Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country Assistance Evaluation of Senegal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority Issue Evaluation</td>
<td>Evaluation on Japan’s ODA Contribution to Poverty Reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of Japan’s Peacebuilding Assistance Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program-level Evaluation</td>
<td>GOJ-GOB Programme Level Evaluation : Japanese Assistance to LGED Related Sectors (Japan-Bangladesh Joint Evaluation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vietnam-Japan Joint Evaluation on the Japanese ODA program for the Transport Infrastructure Development in the Red River Delta Area of Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation study on Japan’s ODA to the Education Sector in the Philippines (Joint evaluation with NGOs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report of Assessment on Project “to Construct General Education School Buildings” and Program “Grass Roots”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aid Modality Evaluation</td>
<td>Evaluation of Japan’s Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Review of General Budget Support (PRBS in Tanzania and PRSC in Vietnam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of the Non-Project Grant Aid Program in Zambia (Evaluation by aid recipient country and agencies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project-level Evaluation</td>
<td>Grant Aid Evaluation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ago, worth over 1 billion yen and conducted evaluations on a total of 52 projects.

This section summarizes the ODA evaluation results or the progress of ODA evaluations conducted by MOFA in FY2005. Note that recommendations derived from the various evaluation findings are based on the condition at the time of evaluation. (The full text of each evaluation is available at: http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/gaiko/oda/kaikaku/hyoka.html).

### 2.1.2 Policy-level Evaluation

#### Country Policy Evaluation

**1) Country Assistance Evaluation of Cambodia (Third-party evaluation)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chief Evaluator:</td>
<td>Hiroko Hashimoto, Professor, Faculty of Social and Information Science, Jumonji University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisors:</td>
<td>Nobuo Hirohata, Director, Department for International Affairs, Development Bank of Japan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Naoko Amakawa, Current Affairs Department, Institute of Developing Economies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultants:</td>
<td>Naonobu Minato, Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Keiko Watanabe, Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ayako Nomoto, Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Evaluation objectives

As a mid-term evaluation of the Country Assistance Program for Cambodia, Japan’s assistance policy to the country is reviewed to make recommendations toward more effective and efficient implementation of ODA aid in the future, to draw useful lessons, to fulfill accountability and to promote an understanding of the people by releasing the results of the survey to the general public.

### Evaluation scope

The evaluation reviews the Country Assistance Program for Cambodia of February 2002 and covers the period from 2002 until August 2005. Past or future socioeconomic condition and assistance policies are referred to as necessary.
development needs of Cambodia, and relevance of the objectives of the assistance program was confirmed. However, issues such as population policies and the reinforcement of the private sector were not covered as part of the priority issues of the Country Assistance Program, and no reason was stated. The reinforcement of private sectors has long been implemented in our aid activities but there are some areas which are not covered by the current Country Assistance Program. A revision to the Assistance Program is required to better reflect Cambodia’s current needs. Furthermore, in order to implement effective and efficient aid, more specific indicators for the prioritization of issues in the Assistance Program and on the approaches to accomplishing goals are needed. In regard to indicators, the Cambodia Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs)—which serves as an indicator of NSDP, the current Cambodian development program—should be consulted and the creation of an Assistance Program that would contribute toward the goals should be considered.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Japanese aid is considered to be well-balanced between economic growth and poverty reduction (reducing disparities in living and social contexts). In particular, infrastructure improvement seems to be contributing in removing development constraints such as high costs and lack of access to infrastructure, and has been praised for giving a significant impact on the development of Cambodia. Assistance for the development and promotion of trade as well as distribution infrastructure development in the private sector are concentrated in Sihanoukville and the effects of such aid concentration are expected to emerge in the future. In the area of reducing living and social disparities, contribution is made to improve access to healthcare, education and clean water supplies. Yet Japanese assistance is mainly concentrated around urban areas such as Phnom Penh and Siem Reap, and the degree of contributions toward reducing disparities between urban and rural areas is limited. In the past, Japanese assistance concentrated on urban areas to stabilize security but now with improved security, developments in rural areas to reduce disparities should be considered as well.

In addition, Japan’s response to aid coordination is being recognized as proactive and welcomed by other donors and NGOs. Japanese assistance also involves policy advice on the private investment environment through supporting PRSO and loan assistance to the telecommunication sector, with the reform of the Ministry of Post and Telecommunications as a package. Such assistance not only improves aid effectiveness but is also influencing the policies of Cambodia.

(c) Evaluation of process

In the process of developing the Assistance Program, discussions with various stakeholders are being held, ensuring transparency of the process. Since the development of the Country Assistance Program, Cambodia has undergone rapid changes including membership in the WTO, general elections, announcement of quadrilateral strategies and advancement of aid coordination. Although aid for private sector development has not been clearly stated in the Country Assistance Program, the reality of aid is responding to the changes in Cambodia. Presently, a country-based ODA task force has been established indicating more field-oriented direction, but in regards to formulating the future Country Assistance Program, the priority areas and sector strategies, there are calls for Japan, as “All Japan,” to promptly respond to the changes of needs and address measures.

In formulating and implementing projects, embassies and implementing agencies consult closely with Cambodia, and apply processes to adapt to Cambodia’s project formulation capabilities. In addition, Japan works toward effective and efficient aid implementation through cooperation between the different modalities, collaboration with donors and NGOs. Such cooperation efforts are effective in adapting to the changing needs of the Cambodian government and implementing program approaches which go beyond the modalities.
Chapter 2  An Overview of Evaluation Results

■ Recommendations

<Recommendation 1: Alignment with the NSDP>

The next Country Assistance Program needs to be established so that it follows Cambodia’s National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP). It will need to consider the possibility of implementing a system to reach the targets of NSDP in particular, working toward achieving the CMDG goals as overall goals.

<Recommendation 2: Clarification of the Country Assistance Program and a prompt revision of Assistance Programs>

Future assistance program is advised to emphasize systematic and logical structure to clarify aid effectiveness. In order to eliminate any obscurities in development and interim goals, indicators should be stated clearly. At the same time, timely and prompt revision of the program may be needed in accordance to the changes in the socioeconomic condition of Cambodia.

<Recommendation 3: Prioritization of sectors targeted under assistance>

Japan currently offers assistance in almost all sectors. In order to implement even more assistance in the future, prioritization of sub-sectors within those may be necessary. The standards for prioritization may include, for instance, Japan’s comparative advantages in experience and knowledge, activities to enhance collaboration with other donors and information on sub-sectors where achievement of CMDGs is deemed difficult.

<Recommendation 4: Japan’s areas of contribution for governance improvement, and administrative and fiscal reform>

Regarding governance improvement, enhanced efforts in such areas as judicial reforms, national tax, tariffs and gender mainstreaming where assistance has hitherto been provided should continue. As support to fiscal policy is increasingly important in terms of revenue, further improvement in accounting and tax inspections will be beneficial for human resource development.

<Recommendation 5: The effects of concentrating assistance in Phnom Penh and Sihanouk Ville>

The area between Phnom Penh of Cambodia and Sihanouk Ville is expected to be a driving force behind the economic growth of Cambodia. Japanese aid is expected to bring about “concentration effects” leading to private sector development such as expansion of Sihanouk Ville Port, laying of fiber-optic cables and establishment of free-trade zones, which provides reference for future assistance. In addition, almost all of these projects lead to the development of the Mekong region. In order to eliminate gaps among ASEAN countries, Japan undertakes initiatives concerning regional cooperation, which is an issue to be remembered as cross-sectional perspectives or points to keep in mind in assisting Cambodia.

(2) Country Assistance Evaluation of Kenya (Third-party evaluation)

Chief Evaluator: Yasunaga Takachiho, Professor, Department of International Business Administration, Faculty of Business Administration, Tamagawa University
Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation
Advisor: Yuichi Sasaoka, Professor, National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies
Consultants: Jun Arakawa, Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting Co., Ltd.
Yoichi Hara, Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting Co., Ltd.
Taichi Sakano, Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting Co., Ltd.
Yasuhiro Sakon, Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting Co., Ltd.

Water tank constructed with grant aid (Siem Reap water supply)
■ Evaluation objectives

This evaluation aims to review Japan’s assistance policies to Kenya, to draw useful lessons and make recommendations, as well as to fulfill accountability to the general public.

■ Evaluation scope

Country Assistance Program of Kenya (implemented August 2000).

■ Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

The Country Assistance Program of Kenya is essentially found to be consistent with the priority policies in Japan and Kenya, as well as with the international trend of aid. As there are no items directly specifying the goals and objectives of the Country Assistance Program, it is a little difficult to clarify them.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

[Input] In comparison to other donors, Japanese ODA amount to Kenya in priority areas (or sub priority areas) under the Country Assistance Program ranks the highest or nearly the highest. From the viewpoint of attaining Assistance Program goals, the coverage and the number of projects in implementation during evaluation is not completely sufficient. This is unavoidable taking into account the partner country’s circumstances and Japan’s own financial situation.

[Output] Individual projects implemented based on the Country Assistance Program have been producing expected levels of output but as several of these are ongoing projects, outputs cannot be confirmed at this point.

[Outcome] Despite some discrepancies between the priority areas, the indicator of outcome on the socio-economic conditions in Kenya as a whole shows improvement, although there are still some important development issues left.

[Awareness of the Kenyan side] The Kenyan people highly evaluate the Japanese ODA, in that there are many sustainable projects, technical expertise is high, and the Japanese ODA carried out assistance valuable to Kenya in sectors such as education and healthcare. On the other hand, there is room for improvement as the effects of some projects are limited and have not caused nationwide impact.

[Assistance policy objectives] In general, results in most policy areas are only starting to show and the Country Assistance Program has produced effect which will greatly contribute to attaining goals.

(c) Evaluation of process

[Program formation process] The formulation process of the Country Assistance Program has produced effect which will greatly continue to attaining goals.

[Program implementation process] The overall framework of the implementation process is considered appropriate. However, some problems were cited by the Kenyan side relating to the quality and lack of communication (such as uncoordinated priority issues, lack of understanding of Kenyan mindsets, needs and baselines).

[Coordination with other donors] Although Japan holds dialogues with the donor community, it has been pointed out that Japan’s attitude is unclear toward Sector Wide Approaches (SWAPs), which the Kenyan government has started to recognize as important.
Chapter 2  An Overview of Evaluation Results

[Inspection systems] As Japan’s Country Assistance Programs do not include inspection system, it is difficult for them to flexibly respond to external variances such as administrative changes.

■ Recommendations

<Objectives and priority areas>

(1) Clarify objectives and goals, and define realistic goals

From the perspective of mutual benefits to both countries, the Country Assistance Program should further clarify the objectives and goals in assisting Kenya by asking questions such as, “Why should Japan provide assistance to Kenya? What are concrete goals? How should Japan select and focus on priority areas?”

(2) “Selection and concentration” as a strategic plan

In order to improve the effectiveness of Japanese Assistance Program, strictly addressing Japanese priority issues, it is necessary to establish a method to create “a result framework” clarifying the correlations between development issues and their means for solution at formulation stage, and to set cross-sector priority issues.

(3) Policy formulation in response to Kenyan emphasis on the East African region

In formulating Japanese policy, it is essential to consider the ripple effects within the region, especially in light of Kenya’s recent emphasis on the East African region.

(4) Emphasis on fostering domestic industries

The development policy for fostering domestic industries (especially small and medium-sized enterprises) is vital to Kenya’s continued economic growth. As its direction and strategies are not necessarily clarified in the Country Assistance Program, it is necessary to clarify them.

<Aid modality and approaches>

(5) Establishing a system to spread the impact of ODA nationwide

While Japan’s assistance emphasizes Kenyan ownership and self-reliance efforts, it is possible to spread the impact of ODA nationwide in alignment with these principles. In this regard, the following measures may be considered: diversifying aid modality (programmed assistance, SWAPs, aid coordination, etc.); implementing strategic and continuous projects that would be secured extensively; and constant implementation of baseline surveys and monitoring (as a prerequisite to the formulation and implementation of projects).

(6) Examine implementation methods to bring direct benefits to grassroots (community) level

In the next Country Assistance Program, it is essential to examine and adopt appropriate methods that will bring benefits directly to the community level through “collaboration with NGOs” and “encouraging participatory development.”

<Implementation structure>

(7) Further enhancement of country-based ODA task force

Under the strong leadership of Japanese embassies, country-based ODA task forces function effectively and play an important role. It is desirable to further enhance functions of ODA task forces, including the one to conduct mid-term monitoring and one of the focal points of multi-layered dialogues with Kenya.

(8) Reinforcing baseline survey and needs assessment

To increase the impact of Japanese ODA, a stronger understanding of Kenyan baselines and needs are required. For example, to achieve a fuller understanding of the baseline, it is essential to build a system that provides constant information on priority areas, regardless of projects implemented.

(9) Examining measures to simplify and streamline assistance procedures

In order to provide more efficient assistance, concrete measures are desirable to simplify procedures and shorten the decision-making process.
(10) Establishing and implementing a mid-term monitoring and evaluation mechanism

The Country Assistance Program should allow for modification of project plans in the event of sudden environmental changes or drastic administrative changes like Japan has experienced with the present programme, to enable flexible response and necessary improvements depending on the progress of each project. Mid-term monitoring of the Country Assistance Program that would allow for revisions is desirable.

(3) Country Assistance Evaluation of Tanzania (Third-party evaluation)

Chief Evaluator: Kiyoko Ikegami, Director, United Nations Population Fund Tokyo Office
Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation
Advisor: Ken Inoue, Director, Industry Department, Asian Productivity Organization
Consultants: Fuminori Arai, International Development Center of Japan
Yasuyuki Kuroda, International Development Center of Japan
Yukino Komuro, International Development Center of Japan

Evaluation objectives

The report evaluates Japanese assistance policies to Tanzania, concentrating on the “Assistance Program” of June 2000. In order to implement further effective and efficient assistance in the future, the report aims to draw useful lessons and make recommendations to fulfill accountability by releasing the results.

Evaluation scope

Assistance conducted between June 2000 and May 2005, under the Country Assistance Program. As aid coordination between donors and the Tanzanian government is advancing, general involvement of Japan with “aid coordination” was tried to be evaluated.

Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

• Japanese ODA policy is considered to hold consistency.
• Although the aid environment of Tanzania has been rapidly evolving since the latter half of 2000 with the formulation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) and National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP), Japanese Assistance Program, comprehensive as it is, still holds consistency.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Evaluation from this perspective is not a direct indicator in that the overall results of assistance are not necessarily clear; there are always external factors that can influence the results. However, sector-by-sector
verification was conducted in four topics; financial contribution; reflection of the Tanzanian needs; the multiplier and ripple effects of the program; and improvements in sectoral, regional and macro indicators. The effectiveness of these outcomes was evaluated as follows:

- Japanese support is generally regarded as important by the Tanzanian side.
- Japanese assistance is regarded effective in such sectors as agriculture and road infrastructure, etc.
- Japan has made important contribution in the sectors of education and health and is recognized as significant. Considering that aid coordination by many donors in both sectors is active, from the viewpoint of the contribution that is unique to Japan, effectiveness is relatively limited.
- Cooperation with Tanzania for poverty reduction proved effective.
- Support for the fishery industry has been an important contribution to nutrition improvement in Tanzania. However, the effectiveness is somewhat limited in the area of consistency between the development policies of the Tanzanian government and assistance policies of Japan.
- Japanese contribution was limited in the sectors of power, forestry preservation and small enterprise development. The policy of the Tanzanian government on the power sector remains unclear, which makes the effective use of Japanese assistance difficult.
- Strategies among projects and overall strategies were somewhat insufficient.
- Development of better indicators is desirable.

(c) Evaluation of process

- As to the appropriateness of the Assistance Program formulation process, information on the ongoing aid coordination in Tanzania was not sufficiently taken into account.
- As to the appropriateness of the implementation process, a practical and active response to the new assistance environment was achieved, as seen in aid coordination being deployed in Tanzania. At policy-level, however, the degree of radical response such as revision of the Assistance Program was insufficient.
- As to the structure of the Tanzanian side, ownership was confirmed among higher-ranked officials in the government to a considerable degree. At the working level, such as line ministries, further enhancement of the structures was deemed necessary.
- As to the verification system, only one assessment was conducted in the evaluation period of five years. The results have been inadequately taken into account and a periodic feedback system of the program is required.

(d) Response to aid coordination

- Since FY2000, Japan has actively and significantly participated in practical aid coordination and this should be appreciated.
- The increase in the number of local staff in Japanese embassies and JICA offices has been minimal (1 embassy official, 3 JICA officials). However, they are acting flexibly by establishing a local ODA task force which is functioning actively.
- Japan is an active participant in the aid coordination process, including policy consultations (Japan participates in 16 out of 22 consultation sectors).
- Contrarily, financial and procedural (fundraising, financial auditing, etc.) participation (in sector baskets, etc.) is limited.
- There is uncertainty as to the way of involvement in aid coordination (which sector to participate in, and to what extent, etc).

■ Recommendations

(1) Clarification of principles and strategies of the Assistance Program

<Recommendation 1>

With respect to the recipient country’s ownership and self-reliance efforts, it is important for future assistance programs to be consistent with Tanzanian development strategies (MKUKUTA, JAS, etc.) to account for Tanzania’s readiness, organization and human capacity. It is also important to include reinforcement measures in the assistance programme.

<Recommendation 2>

In order for effective use of limited aid resources, strategic assistance aiming at selection and concentration based on Japan’s competitive edge should be planned.

(2) Improving the structure of the Assistance Program and formulation/review processes

<Recommendation 3>

In formulating the next Assistance Program, strategy...
targets set by the government of Tanzania must be taken into consideration when setting quantitative and qualitative measurable strategic targets with temporal axes. In order to attain these targets within the time frame to the extent possible, it is desirable to clarify necessary input (input), detailed methods of achievement, prospective results (output) and achievements (outcome).

**Recommendation 4**

It is desirable to formulate the next Assistance Program in about a year, considering drastic changes to the current assistance environment. After formulation, appropriateness of the program should routinely be monitored on a daily basis to promptly respond to changes in circumstances.

**3) Clarification of response to aid coordination**

**Recommendation 5**

It is necessary to clarify the basic recognition of the Japanese stance to the trend of aid coordination in the aspects of “policy,” “fund use” and “procedure.” Based on this, a possible combination of these aspects needs to be found out, in relation to priority areas and issues.

**4) Improving the implementation structure of assistance**

**Recommendation 6**

For effective implementation of assistance including aid coordination, establishing relations between businesses and universities, enhancement of organizational power (including Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers and interns) and capacity development of staff (locally-based task force members or Tokyo-based officials) should be systematically conducted.

**Recommendation 7**

It is important to form a structure or mechanism in which requests by Tanzania or changes in the assistance environment of Tanzania can be incorporated into operations.

**Recommendation 8**

Accountability for assistance activities is not only fulfilled by publicizing selected “successful cases.” As the condition of assistance in Tanzania sets the trend for current international assistance, it would be valuable to actively disseminate this from the perspective of introducing new undertakings of Japan as well as publicizing Japanese ODA.

**Recommendation 9**

Upon setting measurable targets and strategies for assistance operations to Tanzania, it is important to collect and analyze relevant information and to build an information management system to allow stakeholders to easily share such information.

---

**Country Assistance Evaluation of Senegal (Third-party evaluation)**

- **Evaluation Period:** August 2005 – March 2006
- **Chief Evaluator:** Tatsuya Watanabe, Trustee, Japan NGO Center for International Cooperation
  
  Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation
- **Advisor:** Shozo Kamo, Full-Time Instructor, Department of Humanities, Meijo University
- **Consultants:** Makiko Komasawa, Earth and Human Corporation Ltd.
  
  Machi Kaneko, Earth and Human Corporation, Ltd.
  
  Kazuchiyo Kusuda, Earth and Human Corporation, Ltd.
■ Evaluation objectives

The report comprehensively reviews Japanese assistance policies in Senegal and its achievements as well as drawing useful lessons and recommendations for future planned Country Assistance Program. The report aims to fulfill accountability by releasing the evaluation results to the general public.

■ Evaluation scope

The evaluation covers Japanese assistance and policies in Senegal between FY1995 and FY2004. As a Country Assistance Program has not yet been formulated for Senegal, the Country Aid Policy for Senegal is regarded as the equivalent to a Country Assistance Program in this evaluation. As the policy subsequently became unpublished after 2001, ODA Country Data Books and the JICA Country Implementation Program for Senegal were referenced accordingly, though they are not policy documents.

■ Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

Generally, the last decade of assistance policies in Senegal have more or less been consistent with Japanese ODA priority policies, international initiatives and national development plans of Senegal. Inconsistencies can be found in private sector assistance, assistance for the poor and socially vulnerable, decentralization, gender, collaboration with NGOs and interaction with the civil society.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Seen by priority area, water supply, human resources development (vocational training), fishery sector saw significant outcome and impact. In education (pre-school education) and environment (in rural forestry), a certain level of outcome was also observed. In contrast, in the areas of health care and medicine, and agriculture, only limited results were observed. To address poverty reduction as a cross-sectional issue, the poor segment seems to receive benefit as more Japanese assistance has been put to farming or fishing villages in remote areas than other donors.

With respect to aid modality, technical assistance has contributed to the enhancement of capacity, ranging from the central government level to the community level. Although the quality of Grant Aid has been highly evaluated by the Senegalese government and NGOs, it is also pointed out that grant aid comes at a high cost due to the fact that it is tied for its implementation.

As to the results regarding aid method, aid coordination has not yet produced significant outcome due to its relatively short history in Senegal. In terms of coordination among aid modalities, positive results are being reported as cooperation especially between Grant Aid and Technical Assistance deepens. Yet in South-South cooperation, achievements and results are limited. Other cooperations, such as multi-sector cooperation and collaboration with NGOs, have been limited in numbers, but have already made significant achievements.

(c) Evaluation of process

Although timing of policy consultations (including the three policy consultations before 2000) is adequate, the 2004 policy consultations were held late in light of the full PRSP completion in 2002. During the policy formulation process, it was pointed out from the Senegalese side that the mechanism to systematically understand development needs in Senegal was weak. As to appropriateness of the policy implementation process, projects have been focusing on priority sub-sectors in the areas of water supply, education, the environment and agriculture. However, it is regarded that in the areas of environment and agriculture, implementation contents were not entirely in line with the needs of Senegal. In the areas of health and fisheries, the choice of priority sub-sectors inconsistent with assistance capacity at the time resulted in the lack of appropriateness. It was also hard to evaluate appropriateness of many issues, as aid methods were not clearly presented in the Country Assistance Policy while

![Development study “Study of Children’s Living Environment Improvement Project”](Children receiving child-care at the preschool facility “Children Center”)
aid modalities were appropriately covered. In order to ensure appropriateness in policy implementation in the future, it would be essential to specify goals and indicators to measure performance in the Country Assistance Policy, and to consult with Senegal in regards to monitoring and evaluation timings and methodologies.

**Recommendations**

*Recommendation 1: Clarification of objectives and targets*

It is necessary to clarify higher objectives to enhance aid consistency, transparency, predictability and effects, as well as to set mid-term concrete objectives aiming for a period of five years. The mid-term objectives must follow Senegal’s own development targets and present quantitative targets wherever possible.

*Recommendation 2: Strict application of “selection and concentration”*

As a semi-major donor, Japan needs selection and concentration of assistance areas and development tasks in order to provide assistance with high outcomes and impact. Based on fields, the areas with high development needs are those of agriculture and private-sector assistance Japanese assistance has excelled in water supply, fisheries and human resources development. Based on development issues, “sustainable economic growth,” “poverty reduction and reducing gaps” and “capacity building (capacity strengthening)” are considered key development tasks in PRSP, etc.

*Recommendation 3: Clear presentation of Japan’s efforts*

With regard to efforts toward development tasks, it is desirable that language be clear-cut so that the Japanese direction and position for its Country Assistance Policy in Senegal should be more easily understood. Such expressions as “take note of the issue” are regarded as unclear. In cases where aid environment and conditions change and directions and positions must be modified, they should be done with clear explanations.

*Recommendation 4: Reviewing aid modalities*

Since Senegal is one of the Heavily-Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC’s), it is necessary to carefully examine debt sustainability of Senegal in resuming provision of loan assistance. In deciding capability of debt burden, it is necessary for Japan to explain the ground on which the decision was made. For the time being, it is desirable that Japan initiates budget support on a trial basis with project-based assistance as the standard.

*Recommendation 5: Utilization of assistance methodologies*

To enhance aid effectiveness and efficiency, it is desirable to strengthen various types of cooperation such as cooperation among donors, coordination among aid modalities, multi-sector interventions, and partnership with NGOs. Aid modality and tie-ups between sectors show high potential. It is desirable to promote South-South cooperation by drawing upon the advantage of Senegal as a leading country in West Africa and in francophone African countries. In response to strong wishes from Senegal to learn from experiences of East Asian countries in achieving economic development, it is also advisable to actively promote South-South cooperation between Asia and Africa.

*Recommendation 6: Establishing a cooperation framework with Senegal and regular policy consultations*

In order to enhance ownership of Senegal and
Priority Issue Evaluation

(1) Evaluation on Japan’s ODA Contribution to Poverty Reduction (Third-party evaluation)

Field Survey Country: Vietnam
Chief Evaluator: Koichiro Agata, Professor, Faculty of Political Science and Economics, Waseda University
Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation
Advisors: Sanae Ito, Associate Professor, Graduate School of International Development, Nagoya University
Takeshi Daimon, Associate Professor, School of International Liberal Studies, Waseda University
Consultants: Yoshiaki Nakaune, International Management Association of Japan, Inc
Yasushi Yasuda, International Management Association of Japan

Evaluation objectives

Poverty reduction is an important development issue shared in international communities. Japan places poverty reduction as one of the priority issues in the ODA Charter. This report aims to evaluate previously undertaken efforts, draw lessons and make recommendations to contribute to the implementation of aid in the future.

Evaluation scope

This evaluation focuses mainly on Japanese ODA efforts to poverty reduction between FY2001 and FY2004, examining Vietnam as the case country for on-site studies, and Ethiopia for literature research. Considering that DAC defines “poverty” as a condition lacking in five potential capacities (economic, humanistic, political, societal and protection capabilities), the report is centered on: 1) humanistic capabilities (education, healthcare, water and sanitation, etc.) and, 2) economic capacities (economic infrastructure, etc.) whose achievements can be evaluated by section as focal areas, and treated enhancement of policies, systems, and organizational capabilities as 3) capacity building, etc.

Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

Rather than seeing poverty just from an economic point of view, Japan forms multifaceted policies to ensure the availability of opportunities for basic human living. This corresponds to the trends in international assistance. Implementing agencies use the DAC guideline for poverty reduction as their basis and are strengthening their responses to poverty reduction. These efforts correspond to the philosophy stipulated in the ODA agreement. Regular policy consultations and the formulation of a mutually-agreed upon Country Assistance Program must ensure participation of various stakeholders such as those of civil society (e.g., NGOs) to achieve legitimacy and transparency.

A citizen explains tree-planting at the village assembly
Charter setting forth poverty reduction as the top priority issue. It is appreciated that Japan’s efforts in trying to understand and analyze basic information on poverty in the planning stage in order to understand the status of poverty by recipient country/region and to concretely formulate the content of assistance are mentioned in the Mid-term Policy on ODA.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Yen loan projects on poverty reduction are increasing annually and many of them are being implemented in Asia. While aid covers infrastructure development such as roads and sustainable growth in many cases, projects aiming to enhance humanistic capabilities in education and healthcare are also on the rise. There is a movement toward providing support for pro-poor growth with long-term efforts on poverty reduction.

The ratio of technical assistance projects on poverty reduction is increasing annually as well. The number of projects is the highest in Asia, but an increase in projects is also evident in both Africa and Central America. In technical assistance, approaches are becoming wide ranging, covering technology transfer to a stepped-up diffusion into the regional communities and to policy and system assistance.

Grant aid in the areas enhancing humanistic capabilities have been remarkably increasing year by year. Grant aid that directly targets the poor are more inclined to be utilized than before.

■ Recommendations

(1) Systematization of strategic policies for poverty reduction

<Recommendation 1-1>

In order to formulate further effective assistance strategies, poverty reduction must be set as a common target for ODA policies. Under this, prioritization of issues must be addressed according to the characteristics of social and economic development.

<Recommendation 1-2>

Sectoral initiatives need to be clearly positioned in ODA projects in the planning stage.

(2) The “selection and concentration” of assistance and formulation of assistance strategies by region

<Recommendation 2-1>

It is necessary to strategically examine what aid modality is effective for poverty reduction at the policy formulation stage based on regional characteristics, in order to clearly place regional ODA strategy for poverty reduction in policies.

<Recommendation 2-2>

In order to prompt “selection and concentration” of assistance, it is necessary to structure an assistance model that fits each aid recipient country’s individual condition.

(3) Strengthening of assistance tools for poverty reduction (strengthen functions of country-based ODA task forces and promote collaboration)

<Recommendation 3-1>

In addition to enhancing collaboration among
Japanese assistance aid modalities, it is important to strengthen collaboration with other donors, international organizations and NGOs.

**Recommendation 3-2**

Through such measures as remote seminars for ODA task forces and meetings between officials in charge of economic cooperation, active support for country-based ODA task forces and the enhancement of their activities are required.

**Recommendation 3-3**

Country-based ODA task forces need to enhance interaction with civil society and to actively utilize external knowledge.

---

(2) Evaluation of Japan’s Peacebuilding Assistance Policy (Third-party evaluation)

**Field Survey Country:** Afghanistan  
**Evaluation Period:** August 2005 – March 2006  
**Chief Evaluator:** Yoshikazu Imazato, Editorial Writer, The Tokyo Shimbun  
Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation  
**Advisor:** Yasunobu Sato, Professor, Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, Tokyo University  
**Consultants:** Yoshihiko Kato, Mitsubishi Research Institute  
Shinichi Mizuta, Mitsubishi Research Institute  
Hideaki Shinoda, Associate Professor, Hiroshima University  
Yuji Uesugi, Researcher, Hiroshima University  
Tatsuro Yamane, Researcher, Hiroshima University  
Ken Shimizu, Because Institute

---

**Evaluation objectives**

This evaluation aims to comprehensively evaluate Japanese ODA toward peacebuilding, to draw useful lessons, make recommendations to implement further effective and efficient assistance in the future, and to fulfill accountability by releasing the evaluation results.

**Evaluation scope**

This evaluation mainly focused on ODA peacebuilding assistance (hereinafter called peacebuilding assistance), and in so doing it took into account non-ODA contribution where necessary. In addition, evaluation centered on peacebuilding activities related to armed conflicts. In a series of stages of the armed conflicts, the post-conflict stage was the focal point of evaluation, while attaching importance to the flow from pre-conflict, mid-conflict and post-conflict. Afghanistan was chosen as the case study country and in addition to detailed field research, desk review on other countries and regions was conducted.

**Evaluation results**

(a) Evaluation of objectives

Although Japan has not always stipulated clear
and consistent objectives toward assistance for conflict-affected countries and regions, the objectives Japan has set in providing assistance can be summed up as follows.

- Promoting peace and stability in the Asia-Pacific region, which is important for Japan
- Fulfilling an important role as a member of the international community
- Securing interest and safety of Japan and its people
- Realizing “human security”

The aforementioned objectives were regarded relevant in light of the principles of Japanese diplomatic standing on international harmony and pacifism, the ODA charter, and the Mid-Term Policy, with “peacebuilding” as one of the priorities, and the international trend attaching importance to measures for conflict-affected countries and regions.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Rather than examining or evaluating all aspects with equal weight, the following three assistance areas were selected as the priority evaluation areas; (1) Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration (DDR), (2) the Ogata Initiative, and (3) support for trunk roads development, which the Japanese government recognizes as profoundly meaningful as peacebuilding assistance measures.

(1) DDR

DDR in Afghanistan contributed to promoting the peace process and to increasing the centripetal force of the central government by aligning with the peacebuilding process. The greatest contribution Japan has made to DDR in Afghanistan is that it has made more active contribution than any other donor in terms of finance and political undertakings, as the leading country in this field. With this, Japan comprehensively contributed to the development of the DDR process. The financial contribution and the recruitment of specialized and highly motivated personnel attributed to Japan’s notable contribution.

(2) Ogata Initiative

The principle and approach of the Ogata Initiative, which aims to provide seamless support from humanitarian assistance to rehabilitation and reconstruction, and to promote a comprehensive development plan, targeting priority regions, were fresh at the time. It was approved by United Nations-related organizations as a form of aid to address the realities in Afghanistan. It was believed that more solid frameworks and tools were needed to achieve the goals of this initiative.

(3) Support for trunk roads network construction

Regarding Japanese support for trunk roads network construction, the support for the Kabul-Kandahar road development was successfully completed, improving convenience and economic activities. The Japanese support for the Afghan road sector has resulted in future use of different assistance aid modalities, not only supporting trunk roads but also improving roads in major cities and in local areas.

(c) Evaluation of process

The Japanese government has implemented a flexible deployment of human resources, established appropriate systems and made efforts for the expansion and improvement of operations of existing aid modalities...
in conflict-affected countries and regions. However, further improvement for more timely assistance is desired. Coordination and discussion with recipient country governments and other donors have generally been conducted smoothly but there is no structure within the MOFA to comprehensively coordinate and implement peacebuilding policies. As a result, coordination between personnel at the bureau or section in charge of coordination, and personnel at the Japanese embassy in charge of assistance implementation was not sufficient.

**Recommendations**

**Recommendation 1**

Bureaus and departments in charge of comprehensive policy to support peacebuilding should be specified and reinforced. Decision-making mechanisms should be developed to allow for prompt and appropriate political decisions.

**Recommendation 2**

In order to implement prompt and appropriate assistance to meet the needs and changes in the local conditions, Japanese embassies in those countries should be regarded as “front-line bases” of peacebuilding assistance. Their capacities should be reinforced and their decisions should be respected.

**Recommendation 3**

When Japan aims to make efforts for peacebuilding in a certain country/region, it is important to acknowledge the internationally agreed process based on consensus among the parties concerned, and to implement assistance so that development or the process can continue.

**Recommendation 4**

In order to promote a peaceful country or society in conflict-affected countries, it is necessary to implement assistance which respects capacity building with independence and sustainability of the country or society.

**Recommendation 5**

In implementing peacebuilding assistance, a sufficient number of personnel with expertise and experience need to be deployed to the Japanese Embassy in the concerned country. To this end, it is necessary to promote a strengthening mechanism that enables development of personnel with expertise and experience and their timely dispatch.

**Recommendation 6**

Japan should continue its efforts to improve operations and expand aid modalities to meet the needs of peacebuilding assistance. In aid modalities supporting NGOs it should be allowed to appropriate costs for safety measures as a part of expenses, and a certain amount of the whole sum of fixed cost as emergency expenses. In addition, it is desirable to conduct appropriate follow-up of improvement efforts for the prompt implementation of Japanese technical assistance.

**Recommendation 7**

As peacebuilding assistance is implemented on the premise of activities in dangerous zones in many cases, it is necessary for the government to improve the structure of safety measures in order to promote smooth, efficient effective implementation of assistance while securing the safety of aid workers.

**Recommendation 8**

The Japanese government should re-examine measures for proactive engagement in assistance for DDR in the future, which is supposed to utilize ODA for peacebuilding under the ODA Charter.
## 2.1.3 Program-level Evaluation

### Sector Program Evaluations

**(1) GOJ-GOB Programme Level Evaluation: Japanese Assistance to LGED Related Sectors**  
(Joint evaluation with the recipient country)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluators:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Japanese Side**   | Yukio Yoshii, Senior Deputy Director, Aid Planning Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
Makoto Tanabe, Official, Aid Planning Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
Masahiko Kiya, Counselor, Embassy of Japan in Bangladesh  
Shinya Tsuruda, Second Secretary, Embassy of Japan in Bangladesh  
Naoko Anzai, KRI International Corporation  
Nobuko Shimomura, KRI International Corporation  
Megumi Takahashi, KRI International Corporation |
| **Bangladesh Side** | Mr. Md. Wahidhur Rahman, Superintending Engineer, LGED  
Mr. Md. Zahangir Alam, Project Director, LGED  
Dr. Mohammad Jahirul Islam, Deputy Chief, LGD, MLGRD&C  
Mr. Subhash Chandra Gosh, Chief, IMED, Ministry of Planning  
Mr. Bazlur Rashid, Deputy Director, IMED, Ministry of Planning  
Dr. Krishna Gayen, Senior Assistant Chief, Economic Relations Division (ERD), Ministry of Finance  
Dr. Omar F. Chowdhury, Verulam Associates |

### Evaluation objectives

The completion of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in 2005 in Bangladesh has provided an appropriate timing to evaluate the areas directly related to poverty reduction by Japanese ODA to Bangladesh. Both Japan and Bangladesh decided to implement evaluation with the aim of (1) ensuring accountability to both Japanese and Bangladesh citizens and (2) providing feedback to the governments of both countries regarding aid effectiveness and efficient management of ODA.

### Evaluation scope

In light of the high status of the Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development and Co-operatives, and the Local Government Engineering Department (LGED) in the field of rural infrastructure, evaluation covered Japanese economic cooperation projects conducted by LGED from the latter half of the 1980s to date. Recent Japanese aid in Bangladesh is based on the Country Assistance Program for Bangladesh (CAP), (formulated in 2000), and the projects which LGED administers address two priority areas of “agricultural and rural development” and “disaster countermeasures.” Though other agencies in Bangladesh are also involved in the two projects, evaluation covered only LGED activities. And objectives and sub-areas confirmed through CAP for Bangladesh were set as the evaluation standards.
Evaluation results

(a) Rural development area

Japanese contribution to LGED in the area of rural development covered the development of rural infrastructure such as roads and bridges. The existing surveys and questionnaire findings show that rural road network development has produced a number of effects including time and cost reduction of transportation, traffic increases, better access to schools and public services, and an increase in income and employment. Aid in one Union through JBIC-JICA collaboration has been deployed by LGED in four places. This contributed to an effective approach to improving Union functions and government services, thereby to strengthening local government and participatory rural development. Although Japanese involvement in small scale water resources development has been limited so far to a master plan formulation, the participatory modality was introduced by prefecture in the targeted region, resulting in the Japanese role to promote participatory rural development. In addition, various instances of technical assistance have helped upgrade LGED technical capabilities, contributing indirectly to the objectives of rural development as a whole. Issues that call for more attention in future aid include: (1) information sharing and coordination with other donors, and (2) operation and maintenance of roads and bridges (including portable bridges).

(b) Disaster countermeasure area

Japanese aid in the field of measures against disaster through LGED mainly contributed to the development of multipurpose cyclone shelters. Unlike the 1991 cyclones which caused significant damage, damage from the 1996-1998 cyclones was minimal due to the shelters and improved warning and evacuation planning. The presence of shelters has provided security for people living in coastal areas, while contributing to improved school attendance and increased opportunities for community activities. The aid for shelters has been consistent with the objective of the Country Assistance Program, “provision of basic infrastructure and services.” The JICA Development Study on flood-adaptive livelihood improvement was also intended to “strengthen the capacity to respond to disasters in the communities,” however, at the post survey stage, only “basic infrastructure” was examined. Issues that need to be addressed in the future are: (1) promoting dialogue and coordination among other donors to ensure consistency of implementation systems, and (2) re-examining the multipurpose cyclone shelter cost taking overall resources allocation into consideration.

Recommendations

<Recommendation 1: Emphasis on maintenance>

The RDEC technical cooperation modalities and debt relief have contributed to strengthening the maintenance of rural roads in terms of technical capacity building and equipment procurement. LGED and other Bangladeshi government-related agencies should pay particular attention to the maintenance of portable bridges and multipurpose cyclone shelters.

<Recommendation 2: Review of agencies receiving aid for multipurpose cyclone shelters>

Other donors implement aid through the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education (MOPME). It is required to re-assess where responsibility lies in the framework of the Comprehensive Disaster Management Program (CDMP) in terms of maintenance.

<Recommendation 3: Capacity development>

In order to sustain the competitive edge of LGED and to foster LGED executives in the future, it is necessary to provide aid on capacity development in various fields such as organization, management and technology, while promoting closer coordination among donors under the ownership of LGED.

<Recommendation 4: Coordination among projects and sectors>

It is essential for the improvement of effective utilization of ODA resources and development effectiveness to provide aid based on cross-project and cross-sector approaches, capturing issues that fall beyond the boundary of particular projects or sectors. These approaches are necessary in providing aid, especially for an organization such as LGED, in multiple areas.

<Recommendation 5: Implementation of the “LGED model”>

The roles of LGED have been expanding due to the synergetic effects of its success and the willingness of donors to work with LGED as an implementing agency. After comprehensively capturing the role of LGED, it is desired to take approaches that ensure the balance of two effects: the effects produced by competing with
other agencies and the effects of avoiding overlap or confusion. In the long run, aid toward introducing the ‘LGED model’ to other Bangladeshi government agencies may be considered to ease burdens on LGED and to ensure its focus on core competencies.

**<Recommendation 6: Improvement of information management and sharing>**

The monitoring and evaluation system of LGED needs to be strengthened to improve the cycle of monitoring, evaluation and feedback to a new plan. Reform of the evaluation system is also being examined at the Bangladeshi government level and it is essential to link the two systems in the future. At the same time, developing a database for improved information sharing among relevant organizations is desirable.
(2) Vietnam-Japan Joint Evaluation on the Japanese ODA Program for the Transport Infrastructure Development in the Red River Delta Area of Vietnam (Joint evaluation with the recipient country)

Evaluators:
Japanese Government Evaluation Team
  Daisuke Matsunaga, Minister, Embassy of Japan in Vietnam
  Tomoyuki Okada, First Secretary, Embassy of Japan in Vietnam
  Yasuhsisa Suzuki, Assistant Director, Aid Planning Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
  Takeshi Shihara, Official, Aid Planning Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
  Keishi Miyazaki, Consultant, Overseas Project Management Consultants Co., Ltd.
  Michimasa Numata, Consultant, Overseas Project Management Consultants Co., Ltd.
  Ms. Nguyen Song Anh, Management Consultant
  Mr. Mai The Cuong, Lecturer, National Economics University of Hanoi
  Ms. Phuong Nguyen Minh, Lecturer, Foreign Trade University of Hanoi
  Dr. Doan Thi Phin, Deputy Director, Vietnamese Transport Development and Strategy Institute

Vietnamese Government Evaluation Team
  Dr. Ho Quang Minh, Director General, Foreign Economic Relations Department (FERD), Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI)
  Mr. Cao Manh Cuong, Chief of Division, FERD, MPI
  Mr. Pham Hung Vinh, Senior Official, FERD, MPI
  Mr. Cao Thanh Phu, Expert, FERD, MPI
  Mr. Do Duc Tu, Expert, Infrastructure Department, MPI
  Mr. Trinh Duc Trong, Expert, Infrastructure Department, MPI
  Ms. Nguyen Thanh Hanh, Chief of Division, Planning and Investment Department, Ministry of Trade

■ Evaluation objectives
  This is a joint evaluation with the Vietnamese counterparts on the Japanese ODA program for trunk roads and transportation in the Vietnamese Red River Delta region. This evaluation aims to promote understanding among the Vietnamese counterparts, to draw useful lessons toward more effective and efficient ODA assistance, and to ensure accountability to both Japanese and Vietnamese citizens.

■ Evaluation scope
  A quasi-program was developed for joint evaluation, based on “The Master Plan Study of Transport Development in Northern Vietnam” conducted by JICA in 1994, and was named “Red River Delta Area Transport Development Program” for descriptive purposes. This program is made up of 25 Japanese ODA projects carried out during the period between 1994 and 2004 and this evaluation was limited to three sub-sectors; namely road, railway, and marine transport and port and harbor. At the same time, in parallel with the Japanese ODA projects, projects implemented in the Red River Delta Area Transport section by other major donor country/organizations were also reviewed as a reference.
Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

(1) Consistency with Japanese priority policies and the needs of Vietnam


(2) Competitive edge in implementation of aid for Vietnam through Japanese initiatives

The competitive edge of Japanese assistance includes: (1) advanced technology and abundant experience in development projects throughout the world, (2) a renowned ODA system with a strong economy and the capability to implement large development projects, (3) timely and direct ODA response to local needs, (4) enthusiasm in the transfer of advanced technology to local counterparts, and (5) expertise and effective working manner among Japanese companies and professionals.

(3) Comparison of aid policies and programs between other major donors and Japan

The overall objectives of all major donors emphasize the pursuit of poverty reduction with sustainable economic development, and this corresponds to Japan’s aid policies.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

The program has achieved considerable improvement in the three sub-sectors. It was observed that the development of road transport, and port and sea transport particularly improved the connectivity of the two transport means. It was also observed that activities in each sub-sector expanded, and regional economic activities were invigorated, resulting in promoted economic growth and poverty reduction in the Red River Delta. Considering that economic growth is an essential factor for promoting growth in the private-sector, one of the major indicators in the process of shifting to a market economy, the program did not directly support promoting a Vietnamese shift to a market economy. However, it can be seen as one of the factors that indirectly produced positive results. It became clear that education, training and OJT, etc., provided by Japan assist Vietnam through implementing projects which create positive impacts on Vietnamese engineers/professionals not only because of technical improvement, but also due to work ethics and a boost in business morale. These results are greatly attributed to the Vietnamese efforts, as well as the Japanese efforts. On the other hand, issues of facility operation and maintenance, concerning roads and bridges in particular, were recognized as issues with the potential to negatively impact the aforementioned results in the future. As vehicle and traffic volumes increase, the number of accidents, fatalities and injuries can be expected to increase accordingly. The Red River Delta and Mekong River Delta regions have the largest reported number of injuries.

(c) Evaluation of process

(1) Appropriateness of implementation and needs assessment in the process

Evaluation showed that the major agencies (Embassy of Japan, MOFA, JICA, JBIC, etc., from Japan; relevant agencies centering around the planning and investment ministry from Vietnam) were suitably involved in the program planning and implementation processes, and that procedures, decision making, coordination, collaboration and needs assessment were appropriately carried out.
(2) Collaboration between Japanese ODA aid modalities, other major donors' assistance policies and programs

In the program, 14 ODA coordinations among ODA modalities took place in 25 projects. There was also ODA inter-modality coordination between grant aid projects and technical cooperation projects (Project for Strengthening Training Capabilities for Road Construction Workers in Transport Technology), and coordination between development study and technical cooperation projects (Project on the Improvement of Higher Maritime Education). In regards to coordination between other major donors and the program, the Improvement Project of National Trunk Road No. 1 was carried out with the involvement of the World Bank, Asian Development Bank and the United Kingdom. Other examples of inter-modality coordination include the projects for the National Trunk Road No.5 between Japan and Taiwan, as well as the National Trunk Road No.18 between Japan and Korea. Coordination among donors in the transportation area was also carried out in the three priority sub-sectors among donors. The development in the three sub-sectors of road, railway, and marine transport and port and harbor saw relations evenly supported among bilateral and multilateral donors. Furthermore, partnership group meetings, divided by sections or by issues were confirmed to play an essential role in collaboration among donors.

 Recommendations

<Recommendation 1>

Development assistance strategy in the Vietnamese transportation sector, from the experiences thus far, should be continued in the same “selection and concentration” method as before. However, considering that road rehabilitation maintenance budgets and the number of traffic accidents are evidently increasing throughout Vietnam, it is recommended that these matters be considered as priority issues.

<Recommendation 2>

As far as human resources development is concerned, there are three practical recommendations as follows:

(1) The components of human resource development in the Yen loan projects should be strengthened. Also maintenance and reinforcement of coordination between JICA and JBIC (dispatching JICA experts to the yen loan projects) remains essential.

(2) In JICA technical cooperation projects which are equivalent to vocational training, time spent on practical training should be increased upon collaboration with theoretical lectures in the curriculum, to address the need for practical capacity development.

(3) Regarding the JICA Development Study, more effective use of the training program for counterparts must be considered. The counterparts training program should be designed not only for the transfer of specific technical skills but also to promote the transfer of the general research skills and operation and management know-how, so that more comprehensive development effects can be achieved.

<Recommendation 3>

It is essential to further promote international collaboration by utilizing partnership groups, which are co-hosted by donors and the Vietnamese government.

<Recommendation 4>

In light of the effects brought about by the fact that Japanese cooperation has continued for a long time in
the priority areas of current development assistance in Vietnam, it is advisable to continuously maintain assistance until an appropriate time when both governments judge certain results have been attained and agree that.

**<Recommendation 5>**

For the transfer of evaluation skills, it is necessary to execute appropriate skills transfer with the Vietnamese government officials and private consultants, reflecting their specific needs. In this case, it is essential to fully utilize the limited financial resources, human resources and time.

### (3) Evaluation Study on Japan's ODA to the Education Sector in the Philippines (Joint evaluation with NGOs)

**Evaluation Period:** September 2005 – March 2006

**Evaluators and Consultants:**

(NGOs)

- **Masato Noda,** (Specified nonprofit corporation) Trustee, Nagoya NGO Center / Associate Professor, Chubu University
- **Chie Yamamoto,** (Specified nonprofit corporation) Member of Advocacy Committee, Kansai NGO Council
- **Tatsuya Watanabe,** (Specified nonprofit corporation) Trustee, Japan NGO Center for International Cooperation / Instructor, Tokyo Keizai University

(MOFA)

- **Kanji Kitazawa,** Senior Coordinator, Aid Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau (– November 2005)
- **Yukio Yoshii,** Senior Deputy Director, Aid Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau (December 2005 –)
- **Naoko Ueda,** Assistant Director, Aid Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau (November 2005 –)
- **Taeko Okitsu,** Official, Aid Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Chiharu Fukazawa,** Official, Aid Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Satoshi Fujita,** Official, First Country Assistance Planning Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Yae Kosugi,** Deputy Director, Non-Governmental Organizations Assistance Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Shunsuke Iwasawa,** Official, Technical Cooperation Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Takashi Masaoka,** Deputy Director, Loan Aid Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Toru Ueno,** Official, Grant Aid Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau
- **Atsuko Ebihara,** Official, Second Southeast Asia Division, Asian and Oceanian Affairs Bureau

(Consultants)

- **Yoshihiko Iwadare,** Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
- **Ryoichi Yamagishi,** Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
- **Richard Gonzales,** Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
- **Rintaro Yamaguchi,** Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
Evaluation objectives

This report comprehensively evaluates Japanese assistance directed at the education sector in the Philippines. For the future formulation of Japanese assistance policies and implementation of assistance in cooperation with NGOs, useful lessons are drawn and accountability is ensured by releasing evaluation results to the general public.

Evaluation scope

This evaluation reviews an aggregate of 39 ODA projects implemented in the education sector of the Philippines between FY2000 and FY2004.

Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

Consistency was confirmed in important issues such as poverty reduction, satisfaction of the basic human needs, and development of education infrastructure in light of Japanese assistance policies and directions (the old and new ODA Charters, Mid-Term Policy on ODA, Country Assistance Program for the Philippines, and BEGIN) and development policies of the Philippines (Midterm National Development Plan, Basic Education Sector Reform Agenda (BESRA)). However, relatively new directions such as the new ODA Charters, BEGIN and BESRA also emphasize views such as “human security,” “non-formal education,” and “cooperation with NGOs.” These are to be formulated toward the end of the evaluation period, and will carry further prominence in the future.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Regarding effectiveness, expansion and development of educational facilities for basic education have shown significant results. Management has been introduced at the school level and community participation in school operation and management has been pledged, which gave significant impact on education policies in the Philippines. Although these efforts do not immediately lead to an enhancement in educational quality or efficiency, it is concerned that dropout rate in elementary and secondary education has not improved, and that national academic achievement has risen only slightly in elementary education and has even decreased in secondary education. Non-formal education is anticipated to help lower dropout rates and appeal to those forced to withdraw from schools. As for higher education, it is still too early to evaluate the outcomes. Nevertheless, there is scope for improvement in assistance implementation methods. Regional poverty reduction and human security have benefited by medium-level skills development.

(c) Evaluation of process

In the education sector of the Philippines, various collaborative systems are under development. The Japanese embassy, JICA, and JBIC have created the local ODA taskforce and coordination is being strengthened, which can be seen in the education sector where policy direction being clearly mentioned and efforts in programme approach have started. Information exchange and collaboration among donors has also been promoted for about a year. Basic Education Sector Reform Agenda (BESRA) was formed as a policy package by major donors and the possibility of a pool fund to provide funds for implementation of BESRA has been indicated. Furthermore, community participation in school management is being promoted through the Third Elementary Education Project (TEEP). In terms of coordination with NGO, a list of prominent NGOs that could serve as partners in providing assistance to the Philippine education sector and policy formulation need to be further developed.

Recommendations

<Recommendation 1: Sub-sectors that complement formal education>

Sub-sectors in the area of education such as pre-school development, literacy education, and vocational training, are closely related to, and mutually supplement, formal
school education. It is expected that the reinforcement of functional ties between basic education and the related educational sub-sectors will be highly effective in realizing human security and “Education for All” (EFA).

<Recommendation 2: Support for improving the quality of education and management>

Providing tangible inputs combined with soft components

In developing tangible components, a soft or intangible perspective together with the measures for the improvement of educational quality and reinforcing management capacity is expected to produce high effectiveness. In addition to the assistance already underway, provision of alternative educational training by NGOs and others will result in capacity building of the overall target region, which is important from the viewpoint of human security.

Improving teacher training to raise the quality of education

In order to improve the quality of elementary and secondary education, it is important to improve teacher training programs through coordination between the Department of Education and the Commission on Higher Education. A particularly pressing issue for INSET is the establishment of a system where problems recognized by education supervisors and Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers can be communicated back to the higher education organizations for incorporation into training and recurrent education.

<Recommendation 3: Establishing a system for strategic coordination with NGOs>

In order to realize EFA, aid for targets with diverse needs will be required. From the human security point of view, in addition to formal school education, there is a need to provide alternative learning opportunities for children who cannot attend school due to poverty, for dropout children, and illiterate adults. In implementing the aforementioned assistance, it is expected that higher effects will be realized by collaborating with NGOs that have knowledge about both the inside and outside of the communities, making cross-sectoral efforts other than in the education sector, and responding to problems caused by the demand side (inability to send children to school due to poverty).

Coordination with NGOs is expected to be strategically positioned within assistance programs by presenting a wish list (list of activities that can be effective in coordination with NGOs) to NGOs and through participation of major NGOs in policy planning and project formation stages. It is necessary to conduct research on the possibility of mutual complementarity of NGOs and their comparative advantages, as well as acquiring information on powerful NGOs in information exchanges with other donors.

Furthermore, discussion on coordination with various NGOs and the way of aid modalities will be necessary, including the support from NGOs to the schools built with grant aid or yen loans.

<Recommendation 4: Efforts toward establishing a system for strategic coordination with NGOs>

There is a possibility that a pool fund is founded to implement BESRA. Japan has been involved in formulating BESRA, and its participation in such a fund can be considered when necessary. It is expected that Japan participate in such a fund, after fully securing complement between existing and expected Japanese projects,
the effectiveness of the BESRA efforts, and the monitoring/evaluation methodology on progress and results. It is also expected that effectiveness of assistance will be enhanced by complementing with other donors in the future.

<Recommendation 5: Active promotion of “information disclosure and publicity”>

For smooth dialogue with NGOs, it is important to ensure broad dissemination of information within Japan and to the Philippines and the international community, on the challenges of the education sector in the Philippines and the efforts being taken by Japanese ODA.

(4) Assessment on Project “to Construct General Education School Buildings” and Program “Grass Roots” in Mongolia (recipient country/agency evaluation)

Evaluation Period: March 2006
Evaluators: Munkh-Orgil, Officer, Department of Policy and Coordination for Loans and Aid, Ministry of Finance in Mongolia
Munkhjin, Officer, Division of External Cooperation, Ministry of Education, Culture, and Science in Mongolia
Consultants: Mon-Educ Co. Ltd.

Evaluation objectives

This report aims to objectively grasp Japanese assistance to the Mongolian education sector, to make a comprehensive evaluation, draw upon useful lessons for further effective and efficient assistance, and to ensure accountability for the citizens of the donor and the recipient countries by releasing evaluation results to the general public.

Evaluation scope

16 schools established as part of the Grassroots Human Security Grant Aid Project where general grant aid provided for elementary educational facilities, and 8 schools or facilities where development of education facilities was enhanced were covered in this evaluation.

Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

The Mongolian government has established an “action plan” and “good governance for human security” as part of its major mid-term development strategies. To implement the government action plan, the Economic Growth Support and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EGSPRS) provides principles and sector-by-sector policies. “Preservation and respect for education and culture” is cited as a principle, and “provision of basic education and vocational training” is stipulated as a sector-by-sector policy among public policies. “Mongolian Education Sector Strategy 2000-2005” (formulated in 1999), as the Mid-term Development Plan, cites measures against the lack of educational facilities as one of the objectives, which is in line with the goal.

Japanese policies emphasize the importance of basic education and human resource development in ODA and in Mid-Term Policy on ODA. In addition, “support for institution-building and human resources development necessary for promoting a market economy” is cited as one of the four priority issues of the Country Assistance Program for Mongolia, which is in line with the goal.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

School officials, teachers, staff members, and parents who had benefited from the General Education School Program and the Grassroots Human Security Grant Aid

11-grade school in Bayangol City, Selenge Province
Projects programs were interviewed, and approximately 80 percent responded that Assistance Programs were successfully implemented and rated “good” (without problems).

- The number of students being able to attend school increased.
- The number of classrooms increased, and courses taught in three shifts decreased.
- Decline in the three shifts system relieved burden for teachers, and the quality of education improved.
- The number of students per classroom decreased and poor learning environments were improved.
- Motivation to work and learn among students and teachers rose.
- Due to the schools built nearby and the decline in the three shift system, safety for children commuting to school was enhanced.

As shown above, the impact on intangible components for students and teachers was quite significant. The respondents to the survey from most of the schools praised improvement of conditions as well as the plan overall.

(c) Evaluation of process

Through requests and the coordination process, the Mongolian government (Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education, Culture and Science), relevant authorities (Ulaanbaatar City Education Bureau, Regional Education Bureaus), and the Japanese government built new school buildings and conducted extension and reconstruction work. There was no overlaps because of coordination with other donors.

■ Recommendations

<Recommendation 1: Recommendation on the improvement of primary education school facilities project>

Particularly in the capital city, Ulaanbaatar, rapid population growth has led to a shortage of school facilities. Assistance for the improvement of primary education school facilities is thought to be in line with the city’s social needs. As the needs for such assistance remain high, detailed research on population influx into the capital city is required.

<Recommendation 2: Recommendation on “Grassroots Human Security Grant Aid” projects>

(1) After grant aid is provided, when the aid recipients and construction corporations make contracts, a proper framework for construction management and maintenance needs to be in place.

(2) Following the above (1), the quality, quantity and value of supplies purchased by the contractors should be publicly disclosed in local newspapers, bulletin boards and on the Internet. To ensure that local residents can check and evaluate the contractors’ business practices, such disclosure needs to be obliged as one of the articles to be kept by contractors.

(3) Bidding results need to be disclosed in choosing agencies (contractors) who will be engaged in construction and refurbishment works, as well as providing equipment.

(4) The criteria of the selection of schools to be covered by the project should be made public in order to gain public support.
Aid Modality Evaluation
(1) Evaluation of Japan’s Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security (Third-party evaluation)

Field Survey Country: Ghana and Nigeria
Chief Evaluator: Teruo Kawakami, Representative, Office Asahi
Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation
Advisors: Katsuya Mochizuki, Director in Charge, Inter-disciplinary Studies Center, Institute of Developing Economies
Izumi Ono, Professor, National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies
Consultants: Keiko Kita, Global Link Management Inc.
Kazumi Shimaoka, Global Link Management Inc.
Wakako Hashimoto, Global Link Management Inc.
Akiko Shimooka, Global Link Management Inc.

■ Evaluation objectives

The main objectives for this evaluation were to acquire useful lessons and recommendations for effective and efficient aid modality management, and to ensure accountability by making the evaluation results available to the general public. As this is the first aid modality evaluation since the inclusion of human security as one of the principles in the new ODA Charter, the main focus of the evaluation study centered on how the strengthening of the human security principle was reflected in aid modality policy and implementation. Additionally, an attempt was made to present the necessary future direction for grassroots human security grant aid in consideration of these evaluation results.

■ Scope of evaluation

This evaluation encompasses overall grassroots human security grant aid projects implemented over a period of three years between FY2002 and FY2004.

■ Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

The evaluation study found that the direction of this aid modality described in the implementation guideline (formed by the Grant Aid Division, MOFA) as well as the policy document “Japanese Grassroots Human Security Grand Aid Projects – Strengthen Assistance for Human Security” (April 2003) are in line with the principles and priority areas of assistance specified under the new ODA Charter. The evaluation study concluded that human security, as one of the principles in the new ODA Charter, was factored in this aid modality at the time of its initiation, and is adequately reflected in the direction of this aid modality.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

95 percent of the projects implemented in the last three years addressed the traditional area of basic human needs (BHN). Only 5 percent covers the field where the principle of human security is “strengthened” (emergency humanitarian relief, support for consolidation of peace and nation building, HIV/AIDS and Project for construction of multipurpose training center and well in Doutze Village, Kaduna District
Multipurpose center was constructed with two training rooms, administrative office, reference room and bathrooms. In front of the building, there is an ODA placard made independently by the implementing organization (NGO).
other infectious diseases). However, relevance is highly evident in the areas centered on countries where post-conflict reconstruction assistance was highly needed. Since FY2002, projects intended for “peacebuilding and nation building” have increased in number. The evaluations were conducted to show how comparative advantages of this aid modality (“support for the projects directly contributing to the needs of the grassroots level,” “flexible response to the grassroots needs,” “prompt response to the grassroots need”) have actually been utilized in implementation. As a result, it is noted that “flexible response to the grassroots needs” is flexibly reflecting local needs, as the needs in the field equivalent to “strengthening” of the concept of “human security” along with the conventional field of BHN are met, especially in the countries in the Middle East and Africa under the process of peacebuilding.

(c) Evaluation of process

Personnel structures for implementing this aid modality vary greatly by each Japanese diplomatic establishment. Asia is relatively advantageous while Africa faces a severe reality. Even after the inclusion of the strengthened concept of “human security” in FY2003, operational processes have not changed except that all projects must be now approved and decided by MOFA. Considering the operational environment of aid modalities particular to each region, many Japanese diplomatic establishments have opted to apply their own selection criteria. A quarter of Japanese diplomatic establishments revised their project selection criteria after 2003. In the implementation process, candidates for aid in many regions are short-listed at the document examination stage prior to site visits. Because of this, those reaching implementation of site visits only account for 10 percent of the total projects proposed. There are disparities among regions in the implementation rate of prior site visits for the approved projects. The rate is extremely low in the Middle Eastern countries, including Afghanistan and Iraq in the process of post-conflict reconstruction. Although not a small number of Japanese diplomatic establishments promote network of local NGOs and coordination with other donors to jointly formulate successful projects, only less than half of Japanese diplomatic establishments have actually formulated projects with them. This is due to the lack of personnel to promote such coordination in Japanese diplomatic establishments, and also a lack of information sharing with counterparts. As to monitoring and follow-ups on the ongoing projects, many Japanese diplomatic establishments confirmed the progress of projects through midterm/final reports, which had to be submitted as stipulated in the bestowal contract with the recipient organizations, and by utilizing participation in the delivery ceremony upon completion, or through visits by staff members on business trips to neighborhood areas as the chances for monitoring.

■ Recommendations

<Recommendation 1: Maintain efficiency through streamlining of selection process>

(1) In order to determine the number of projects to be implemented under this modality, it is recommended that the number of projects which can be implemented under the current system while securing the quality to be determined, with consideration of the time required to approve a project.

(2) Pre-application screening can be a possibility to increase the efficiency of the project selection with a limited number of staff.

<Recommendation 2: Effective way to validate capacity of grant recipients>

(1) In order to assess the capacity of the NGOs which applied, it is recommended to visit their offices to identify their personnel and management condition, and conduct hearings from other NGOs. It would be also effective to check the performance of applicant NGOs with program officers of other donors in charge of small-scale grant assistance.
(2) Regarding the information collected by the method mentioned in (1), making databases and utilizing them as necessary is recommended.

(3) To maintain the capacity of the recipient organization, it should be considered to prioritize the NGOs which have had good performance in the past, and to attach importance to the recommendation from local government authorities depending on the condition of governance of the recipient country, while maintaining grassroots needs and impartiality. In order to check the reliability of NGOs, records of past activities and financial reports could be submitted with the application forms.

<Recommendation 3: Effective use of local ODA Task Forces for efficient project implementation process>

(1) For countries where ODA Task Forces are active, it is recommended to use these taskforce meetings to reflect the knowledge and experience of the Japanese personnel to project formation and planning. Furthermore, task forces can also contribute to the selection of grassroots assistance projects.

(2) In addition to local ODA task forces, effective use of existing human resources to understand the needs at the grassroots level, and to conduct monitoring and follow-up activities for ongoing projects would enable the efficient operation of the scheme.

<Recommendation 4: Measures to achieve high aid effectiveness through this modality>

(1) Since overhead costs contribute to capacity building and empowerment of local communities and individuals, expansion of such support through an increase in the overhead costs is recommended in order to promote “safety assurance for people” in this modality.

(2) Continued support for added-value projects is desirable as they conduct several aid activities in one region, across different sectors.

(3) Flexible project finding and formulation that take into consideration the aid environment in each country.

(4) The main assistance items provided through this modality have been equipment and materials for facilities. These tend to improve the access of the local people to social services such as education and healthcare, yet in order to contribute to the improvement of “quality”, cooperation with Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCVs) and JICA technical assistance projects is one example of effective and efficient collaboration.

<Recommendation 5: Recommendation for strengthening monitoring and follow-up activities of the on-going assistance>

(1) The implementation agencies (grant recipients) should be obliged to conduct self-evaluation after a certain period of completion of the projects in accordance with evaluation criteria set forth by the Japanese diplomatic establishments. It is also recommended to ensure submission of the project report by implementation agencies (grant recipients), and revise the existing format of mid-term and final reports in order to improve efficiency and effectiveness of monitoring and follow-up activities.

(2) Active use of the existing human resources for assistance such as commissioners from the external organizations, as well as JOCV and JICA experts.

(3) Monitor on-going projects on the occasion of site visits for appraisal.

(4) If the project belongs to the priority issues of this modality, prioritize the projects in the region where project sites are located closely, or focus on a certain region for assistance per fiscal year.

<Recommendation 6: Recommendations for effective management of the GGP>

(1) By improving the communication environment, it would be possible to download application forms access relevant information through websites, to enable more effective operation.

(2) Establish interactive information sharing systems between each Japanese diplomatic establishments, such as internal operation manuals (checklists of...
interim applications, advance research, monitoring and follow-up); database operation manuals; information for candidate organizations; application forms; terms of reference (TOR) and contract to commissioners from external organizations, information on local NGOs; manuals to assess the capacity of candidate organizations; guidelines to deal with problems; and examples of good practices, and create a system for exchanging experiences.

(3) The application of an efficient implementation strategy is suggested that takes into account promptness and flexibility, which are the characteristics of this modality, in the context of the target country.

**<Recommendation 7: Maintenance of operational framework from mid and long-term perspective>**

In order to achieve the effective use of local staff and commissioners from external organizations, maintaining the operational framework of this scheme (development of human resources) at Japanese diplomatic establishments from mid and long-term perspectives is required.

---

**Field Survey Country: Tanzania**

**Evaluation Period:** September 2005 – March 2006

**Chief Evaluator:** Yayoi Tanaka, Associate Professor, School of Engineering, University of Tokyo, Member of the MOFA External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation

**Advisors:**
- Koichi Sakamoto, Professor, International Regional Development Studies, Toyo University
- Motoki Takahashi, Professor, Graduate School of International Cooperation Studies, Kobe University
- Masumi Shimamura, Associate Professor, National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies

**Consultants:**
- Fumihiko Kamio, Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
- Yoshihiko Iwadare, Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.
- Shigeharu Satake, Nomura Research Institute, Ltd.

---

**Evaluation objectives**

In order to help set a Japanese direction for General Budget Support (GBS), the past Japanese assistance for Poverty Reduction Support Credit (PRSC) and the Poverty Reduction Budget Support (PRBS) are reviewed, and their achievements and challenges are clarified. The evaluation also aims to draw lessons for the operation of budget support to be implemented in the future and to fulfill accountability by releasing the results.

**Evaluation scope**

Evaluate the objectives, process and results comprehensively for the Poverty Reduction Support Credit (PRSC) for Vietnam, and Poverty Reduction Budget Support (PRBS) for Tanzania.

---

**Evaluation results**

(1) **The direction of GBS by Japan**

In Tanzania, where economy and social infrastructure are underdeveloped, the implementation of GBS is considered to have strengthened administrative and budgetary capacity, and contributed to macro level poverty reduction and economic growth.

It seems that Vietnam had a clear objective to support the establishment of investment environment and economic development by committing to promote the development of infrastructure (power facilities, roads and ports) which provide benefit to Japanese companies by achieving better policies and systems through GBS.
(2) Approach, framework and authority of local offices

It is necessary to understand the distribution of staff in the following three categories, in order to conduct a comparative study of assistance framework between each donor: 1) the number of people involved in economic/economic cooperation (development and international matters), 2) the number of people participating in some meetings on aid coordination, and 3) the number of people directly involved in GBS. The Japanese assistance framework in Tanzania (local ODA task force) is categorized into three groups: 1) 5 embassy officials and 12 JICA members (including Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV)), 2) 4 embassy officials and 10 JICA members (including the Resident Representative, Deputy Resident Representatives and advisors), and 3) 2 embassy officials and 3 JICA members. Many of the ODA task force members also oversee project management so they devote less time for aid coordination, such as sector, theme and group activities, compared to other donors expanding finance-based assistance.

In regards to staff deployment in Vietnam, there are 5 to 6 officials from the embassy for each sector (of which 3 officials are directly involved with GBS); 1 JICA member; and JBIC members (4 resident members + 1 external expert under a long-term contract + 5 to 6 local staff members) which results in 12 to 18 officials involved in GBS either directly or indirectly. These staff members have responsibilities in other sectors in addition to GBS.

■ Recommendations
<Approaches to GBS>

GBS requires close cooperation between recipient countries and donors, and takes an approach to emphasize aid harmonization. At donors meetings, the two parties share common approaches and assistance programs, while making suggestions, and at times, need to take persuasive approaches. How should Japan approach this?

(1) When dealing with budget support, Japan needs to clarify its objectives. In order to determine those, selection and concentration are needed. Many of the donors have narrowed down issues or sectors in which they have already prioritized.

(2) GBS aims to enhance administrative and financial capacity which is expected to take some time. Furthermore, if donors suddenly decrease the amount of GBS assistance for any reason, it would be detrimental to the administrative and budgetary reforms which recipient countries have been undertaking. Japan must make efforts to enhance “predictability of assistance.” Since GBS is increasingly becoming a platform for policy dialogues on reform, it is desirable that Japan makes commitments at appropriate timings, taking into consideration the situations of recipient countries and other donors.

(3) Capitalizing on comparative advantages of Japan

1) The comparative advantages of Japan might lie in its field-driven experience and expertise which can be capitalized upon, thereby enhancing practical policy proposals.

2) In order to reflect field-based information and experiences to policy recommendations, it is necessary to have bird’s-eye view of the overall picture as a system, ranging from the top strata down to the field of the policies.

3) It is irrelevant to consider that all aid modalities should be integrated into budget support or that an aid modality should take an evolutionary process from project, basket fund, onto budget support. There are certain sectors where project-type support would be more appropriate. Therefore, combining program aid with project aid may be more appropriate, depending on the issues and demands of recipient countries.

4) Many donors have been decreasing the number of projects (of which many are off-budget). However, in the case of supporting countries where dependency on aid is relatively high and rapidly shifting to financial support, the negative impact caused by a sudden downsizing of project aid should be considered. Particularly in rural areas, it would probably take a considerable amount of time until an adequate level of social services is provided. Also, for the capacity building of public institutions such as at central and local governments, and schools, understanding of the needs and technical assistance will continue to be necessary.

(4) Since development contexts vary from country to country, it would be inappropriate to standardize or generalize entry points for budget support. However, the following points also need to be confirmed; 1) the
condition of recipient countries, 2) relations between Japan and the recipient country, 3) relations between Japan and other donors, and 4) Japanese presence in comparison to other donors. While confirming them, it would be necessary for Japan to strategically participate in GBS by assessing and identifying sectors that Japan has a comparative advantage, as well as areas of policy recommendations and frameworks.

(3) Human resources
1) With the introduction of GBS, it seems that there have been changes in terms of expertise required. Donors are increasingly expected to participate in policy dialogues and discussions on budgeting with expert knowledge of macroeconomics, public administration and finance, and statistics, in addition to development assistance. Lists of technical researchers and applicants for international organizations can be used to start developing an experienced pool of human resources.
2) The introduction of GBS will not necessarily mean that project managers or sector experts would become less important. By giving these experts the opportunity to learn about economics and the viewpoint of systems, they will be able to play a role in linking field-based knowledge and experience macro-level policy issues.
3) Researchers assigned to embassies and JICA project formulation advisors play an important role in participation in donor meetings. On the other hand, donor staff participating in donor meetings are high-ranking staff such as director-generals or economists. It is also necessary for Japan to create appropriate ranks as well as recruit experts and conduct training.

(3) Evaluation of the Non-Project Grant Aid Program in Zambia
(recipient country/agency evaluation)

Evaluator: D. N. Ndopu, Director, Economic and Technical Cooperation For Permanent Secretary-Budget and Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance and National Planning, Government of the Republic of Zambia
Survey Consultant: N S Consultants

■ Evaluation objectives
In FY1999-2000, Japan implemented non-project grant aid (1.5 billion yen in total) to support the Zambian government in its efforts to improve economic structure. This report compiles the appropriateness, relevance, effect and derived recommendations on the programs implemented by the government of Zambia to foster small and medium-sized enterprises.

■ Evaluation scope
With the Japanese non-project grant aid provided, the Zambian government distributed funds to 114

<Structure>
(1) Effective devolution
At GBS donor meetings, a variety of policy-level issues are discussed and decided very quickly. However, since the level of authority held by embassies is rather limited, it takes a considerable amount of time for the embassy to discuss and reach an agreement with the MOFA headquarters in a timely manner. An appropriate level of transfer of power to overseas offices will be one of the agendas to be examined, as donor cooperation is becoming the trend of international aid.

(2) Effectiveness of the local ODA task forces’ activities
Japan’s GBS in Tanzania are well appraised by other donors and the Tanzanian government. One of reasons for this is that the ODA Task Force is functioning well, although not perfectly. Likewise, in the case of Vietnam, it has been pointed out that good teamwork between the ODA Task Force and the Ministry of Finance has contributed to the formulation process of PRSC. In order
Chapter 2 An Overview of Evaluation Results

enterprises—mainly domestic private enterprises—to finance procurement of supplies and machinery necessary for business operations and expansion, as part of the program to foster small and medium-sized enterprises. Each enterprise was required to reimburse the Zambian government for the supplies and machinery within a prescribed period after the agreement. In this evaluation, NS Consultants, a Zambian consulting company in charge of evaluation research, selected a total of 27 companies out of the 144 as samples cases, taking into account regional disparity, and conducted surveys and interviews.

■ Evaluation results

(a) Evaluation of objectives

The interim midterm expenditure framework of the Zambian government cites “poverty reduction through sustainable growth and job creation” as one of the priority development issues of relevance. Support for this program, which aims to advance small and medium-sized enterprises, was high.

(b) Evaluation of outcomes

Project implementation seems to have been favorable. The majority of the sample enterprises used supplies procured through this aid modality and incurred profits by expanding production and employment. During the program implementation, employment increase was observed in agriculture, fishery, forestry, and manufacturing industries. This increase can be considered to have been brought by this program. As a result, this program contributed to the increase in real income, improvement of living conditions and economic development.

- Usage of procured equipment and machinery, and project implementation condition
  
As initially planned, 70 percent of the sample cases used equipment and machinery effectively and deemed the program implementation status as good. Yet some cases did not necessarily have good preparational condition due to such factors as a lack of working capital.

- Reimbursement
  
Due to reasons such as a signature not having been placed on contracts between the Zambian government and beneficiaries, the collection rate of loaned funds was low for the 27 sample enterprises. Through technical committees, the government of Zambia is attempting to assess the situation and seek reimbursement from beneficiaries with outstanding loans.

(c) Evaluation of process

- Selection and examination of beneficiaries
  
Through newspapers, the Ministry of Finance and National Planning advertised for beneficiaries covered by this program, along with specified loan coverage and criteria. A technical committee was set up to examine guarantee of applicant companies beneficiaries using a strict scoring system (criteria included capital of enterprises, environmental friendliness of applicant projects, support for the vulnerable, and guarantee). However, there were occasional sample cases where minutes of beneficiary selection conferences were missing or where the government of Zambia was unable to visit and examine the proposed sites of applicants.

- Procurement of equipment and machinery
  
There were cases where the procurement of equipment and machinery by the responsible agencies took

Kaliolio Crocodile Farm
It aims to improve the facility to culture 5,000 crocodiles annually

Zambeef Products Limited
Zambeef is a beef producing company known even in neighboring countries. A freezing compartment has been added.
more time than expected. Moreover, as communication between the responsible agencies and beneficiaries, agencies and the Ministry of Finance and National Planning were inadequate, there were cases where the initial date in reckoning of loan refund interest became inaccurate.  

- **Response by relevant ministries after selection of beneficiaries**

  Although communication with Zambian government ministries (Ministry of Finance and National Planning, Ministry of Legal Affairs) was tied with the establishment of the technical committee, monitoring of loan reimbursement from beneficiary by the Ministry of Finance and National Planning has been inadequate, as there were cases without records.

  In order to examine efforts by the Zambian government of the non-project grant, Japan withheld provision of non-project grant aid to Zambia since FY2001. However, the significance of the effects of this modality itself is not lost. In addition, the Japanese Embassy in Zambia has actively set up committees and is repeatedly requesting the government of Zambia to employ frameworks to ensure effective use of non-project grant.

**2.1.4 Project-level Evaluations**

Ex-post evaluation of grant aid implemented in FY2005 was conducted on 52 projects as a trial experiment, out of 113, which were completed three to five years ago and were worth over 1 billion yen. Taking into consideration time and geographic constraints, each embassy selected one to two cases and a total of 52 projects were covered.

In conducting ex-post evaluation, the basic design study data used at the planning stages of each grant aid project was used as baseline. Using the five evaluation criteria (relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability) set by the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), each project was rated on a 12-point scale, ranging from D– to A+. In order to incorporate external objective viewpoints, conferences for the appropriate implementation of grant aid as well as the External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation were consulted on the methods and contents of evaluations.

From FY2006, evaluations will be conducted with higher objectivity. This is to be attained by increasing the number of evaluated projects and obtaining technical and professional expertise through the participation of development experts and academic and research organizations.

Following is the summary of results and examples of the evaluation for grant aid projects implemented in FY2005. (For the entire text of each evaluation results, see: http://www.mofa.go.jp/mofaj/gaiko/oda/kaikaku/ hyoka.html)

---

**Recommendations**

Following the above, two recommendations are proposed in providing loans for promoting small and medium-sized enterprises with this aid modality.

- **Recommendation 1**

  Establish an independent team of experts to evaluate and select projects, and to maintain activity during the loan period.

- **Recommendation 2**

  Establish an independent loan supervisor to be in charge of project selection, debt and beneficiary management.

---

Samfya hardware Trading and Timber Ltd.  
With the growing demand for timber, they are trying to raise productivity by introducing new machinery.
(1) Results overview on grant-aid cooperation ex-post evaluations in FY2005

(a) Special instructions on each evaluation point

Operation and maintenance of facilities obstructed and equipment procured

There are cases where operation and maintenance are properly undertaken through self-help effort of implementation agencies in the recipient country. There is also an example of hospital improvement in the Dominican Republic where technical transfer is effectively conducted through Japanese technical cooperation. On the other hand, there are cases (such as development of fisheries research vessels in Morocco) where high technical skills were needed to use the facilities or equipment, or the implementation structure is not sufficient to exert full effects.

Effectiveness

As was in the case of the Philippines, the levee constructed with Japanese aid produced no casualties when a heavy typhoon hit, in comparison to the previous incident where a typhoon resulted in 8,000 people missing or dead. Like this, there were many cases where the benefits of aid were clearly presented.

On the other hand, there were also cases (such as improvement of hospitals in Zimbabwe) where effects were not fully manifested due to unexpected events, such as deterioration of public order and economic situation resulting from rapid changes in the political and economic climate.

Impact (ripple effects)

There are cases where ripple effects exceeded expectations (cases included living environment and investment conditions improved by flood countermeasures and erosion and sediment control in Honduras, and road improvements leading to the development of new businesses like the taxi industry in the Marshall Islands). At the same time, there were cases where measurement of positive effects upon the overall goals and relevant indicators was not easy (such as the building of water facilities in Malawi) or cases where weak effects did not lead to significant impact (such as the Mozambique fishery harbor modification plan).

Sustainability

In the cases of Sri Lanka and Senegal, proper maintenance and management is ensured where teachers and guardians work actively by establishing school management committees for the maintenance of school facilities. On the other hand, there were cases where financial difficulties or inexperienced engineers led to insufficient management (such as the water supply project in Uganda).

Visibility

There have been various exposures of the projects including the signing ceremony for Exchange of Notes reported on domestic televisions and newspapers, and a local marathon race held after the completion of road construction in Ethiopia. However, it was pointed out that the visibility of some projects was limited to relevant experts.

(b) Lessons for formulating future programs

• Proper operation and maintenance of the developed facilities and supplies are the key in ensuring success of projects. Considering the cases where the effects of projects were limited due to insufficient operation and maintenance systems, future planning should be designed from the beneficiary’s viewpoint, taking into consideration the technical level of recipient countries, while referring to good examples in other countries, so that realistic methods of operation and maintenance can be in place.

• In procuring spare parts, projects should be planned to deploy materials which are locally procured as easily as possible, from the formulation stage. In the implementation stage, support for operation and management systems of implementing agencies in recipient countries is required.

• In relatively larger projects where high skill is needed such as road improvement and the development of healthcare equipment and facilities, grant aid and technical cooperation must be coordinated. This will help facilitate technology transfer and capacity building, as well as maximizing aid effectiveness.

• For cases where the recipient country government is behind schedule on implementation or where the facilities or supplies are not used as initially planned, requests put through Japanese embassies must be made for improvement from recipient country government.
(2) Ex-post evaluation cases of grant aid projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject Title</th>
<th>E/N Date of Signature</th>
<th>Date of Completion</th>
<th>Provision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Project for the Rehabilitation of Trunk Road (1/2)</td>
<td>7 September 1998</td>
<td>16 February 2000</td>
<td>¥1,271,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Project for the Rehabilitation of Trunk Road (2/2)</td>
<td>28 July 1999</td>
<td>24 April 2002</td>
<td>¥4,156,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Project for the Rehabilitation of Trunk Road II (1/2)</td>
<td>8 June 2001</td>
<td>5 February 2003</td>
<td>¥1,182,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Project for the Rehabilitation of Trunk Road II (2/2)</td>
<td>17 May 2002</td>
<td>19 October 2004</td>
<td>¥3,380,000,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Diplomatic Office in Charge:** Embassy of Japan in Ethiopia  
**Implementing Organization of the Partner Country:** Ethiopia Roads Authority (ERA)  
**Other Related Support:** Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) Technical Assistance  
Project “Aremugana Road Construction Training Center”  
JICA Individual Specialists “Bridge Management Advisor”

1. **Project objectives**

   The northwest trunk road links the capital Addis Ababa to the northwest of Oromia and Amhara, as two of the most important agricultural regions in Ethiopia, leading to the oil producing country of Sudan. Once reconstruction is completed in the section leading to the Addis Ababa and Goha Tsion trunk road section (182.5km), regions with high agricultural development prospects and regions of industrial development are to be linked, helping facilitate the agriculture-led industrialization policy, which is one of the basic policies of the Government, as well as food security.

2. **Project contents**

   Road improvement on the 182.5km stretch between the capital city Addis Ababa and Goha Tsion of the northwest trunk road (National Trunk Road N-3), from simple to asphalt paving.

3. **Project relevance**

   **Overall rating:** A

   **Detailed evaluation:** Besides infrastructure development being one of the five priority areas of Japanese ODA to Ethiopia, it is also cited as one of the priority areas in Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Program (SDPRP of Ethiopia). In the Road Sector Development Phase (RSDP), trunk road reconstruction is also a priority issue. Relevance in the linkage between the Ethiopian grain belt in the northwest and the capital city is extremely high in a country where five million people are said to be suffering from constant food shortages.

4. ** Appropriateness and efficiency of facilities constructed and equipment procured by Grant Aid**

   **Overall rating:** A–

   **Detailed evaluation:** The average daily traffic volume before the reconstruction in 1994 was merely 450 vehicles. After the reconstruction was completed in 2004, the number quadrupled to 1,628 vehicles. This shows that the roads provided in this project are properly and effectively used. However, as a result, traffic volume...
increased more than originally expected, which has led to faster deterioration of the asphalt paving in some areas. From the viewpoint of long-term cost-effectiveness including maintenance and management costs, there is room for further verification as to whether or not the initial traffic volume estimates are most appropriate and efficient.

5. Effectiveness

Overall rating: A+

Detailed evaluation: As is seen as a direct effect of the decrease of transit time from eight to three hours for 182.5km (Addis Ababa-Goha Tsion), remarkable results are apparent. In addition, transit costs have also eased as traffic speed improves.

As an indirect effect, agricultural development along the trunk roads has been promoted. In a neighboring village, a rose plantation was developed and the export of the flowers as a cash crop was started. In another village, the amount of milk collected has grown by 5 times in recent years, with the profit per union member growing by 2.5 times in one village.

Development along the road is evident in villages where active distribution of goods has stabilized the supply of daily commodities, with the development of new stores and hotels. Furthermore, as a transportation route to the oil producing country of Sudan, the road contributed to the stabilization of oil supply (before the reconstruction, oil supply would be halted several times a year but this has not occurred since then) and oil stock bases are being constructed.

6. Impact (Ripple effect)

Overall rating: A–

Detailed evaluation: As mentioned in 5., there are appearances of various indirect effects. In other cases, in Chancho (30 km away from Addis Ababa), residential neighborhoods are being developed. With commuter towns around the capital developing, city bus routes are being extended and people’s lives are becoming more convenient.

Conversely as a negative impact, though considered transitory or temporary, the average speed of vehicles has drastically increased, leading to traffic accidents involving pedestrians or overturn accidents due to excess speeding.

7. Sustainability and areas for further improvement

Overall rating: B

Detailed evaluation: The project fulfills basic criteria for sustainability, as ERA is taking proper budgetary and management steps on regular operation and maintenance. Yet, as mentioned in 4., a drastic increase in traffic has caused some asphalt sections to deteriorate. If the traffic volumes continue to grow at the same pace, it is presumed that overall repavement or rehabilitation works may be needed earlier than the in-service period (lifespan) of 20 years.

(1) Response principles

In addition to requesting regular inspections and necessary measures to be taken by ERA, follow-up projects should be considered if unexpected increases of traffic volume continue to damage the roads.

(2) Concept behind response principles

In order to foster the awareness of ownership within the Ethiopian government, response should be taken in line with the budgetary measures of the partner government.
8. Visibility

**Overall rating:** A

**Detailed evaluation:** On milestones of project implementation, E/N signing ceremonies, opening ceremonies, transfer ceremonies and other events (such as soccer games, bus tours and marathon races sponsored by the implementing agency, ERA) are held. The events were combined with press releases, which are disseminated through television and the front page of newspapers. As a result, the project is known not only to government officials or beneficiaries but to the general public as well. In addition, signboards are placed at the startpoints and endpoints of construction, and memorials are placed at the midpoint. All of them bear the Japanese flag with a label saying “Japan’s Aid.” They also prove to have a significant visibility among beneficiaries.

9. Evaluations by recipient countries

High-ranking Ethiopian officials—in particular, Prime Minister Meles and Foreign Minister Seyoum—have repeatedly expressed tremendous gratitude during their visits to Japan. Even at opening and transfer ceremonies far from the capital of Addis Ababa, the participation of the Minister of Works and Urban Development and the Minister of Foreign Affairs shows that the project is highly appreciated.

10. Recommendations and lessons

With traffic volumes increasing and development along the trunk roads advancing, the project evidently had significant effects. With highly effective visibility through the television and newspapers, Japanese assistance has been recognized by the general public—beyond high Ethiopian government officials or those living along the road.

On the other hand, the planning contents were formulated based on the presumed traffic volume. As traffic volume was significantly increased, the structure should be regarded vulnerable. Furthermore, from the viewpoints of cost-effectiveness in operation and maintenance, it is also true that efficiency leaves some doubts.

Therefore, in future reviews on the planning contents, it is necessary to consider that the contents should become more efficient in the mid- and long-term span, no matter how big initial investment may increase.

11. Other

The basic design study report targeted 182.5km of the Addis Ababa-Goha Tsion stretch. As it is difficult to measure effects of road projects in limited places, this report evaluates the same zone as the basic design study.
MOFA discusses countermeasures and conducts follow-ups in response to recommendations submitted by members of the External Advisory Meeting on ODA Evaluation.

In the previous Annual Evaluation Report on Japan’s Economic Cooperation, the following evaluation results were presented as the evaluation results by third-party evaluators.

This section presents the status of follow-up activities on the third-party evaluation results reported in the previous Annual Evaluation Report on Japan’s Economic Cooperation (FY2005 edition). Some of the recommendations may be addressed immediately, while others may require detailed discussion or study. However, all recommendations are valuable guidances for the improvement of future ODA.

### Major Recommendations

#### Country Assistance Evaluation of Laos

- The country assistance program will need to consider priorities from the following perspective: (1) support for regional economic integration for the economic development of Laos, i.e., infrastructure and human resources development; (2) support for poverty reduction, i.e., BHN support and assistance to deprived area; (3) cross-cutting issues, i.e., gender initiatives.
- In light of the capacity of Laos, it is necessary to support local project formation capabilities, including the reinforcement of participatory approach.

#### Country Assistance Evaluation of Uzbekistan/Kazakhstan

- In Uzbekistan, there are relatively few donor activities including those of international organizations, and the initiatives are generally compartmentalized without creating enough incentive for collaborative works. However, there may be a possibility in the future that cooperation among donors becomes necessary. In order to prepare for this, it is essential to maintain and strengthen exchanges of opinion with the government of Uzbekistan and other donors.
- In order to formulate new loan assistance projects in Kazakhstan, the technology transfer sector should be strengthened to design and formulate projects in line with the needs of Kazakhstan.

#### Country Assistance Evaluation of Bangladesh

- There is a need to consider the possibility of forming a result framework with “contribution to PRSP goals (i.e., poverty reduction)” as the overall goal. By demonstrating that Japanese assistance programs hold consistency with PRSP the Bangladeshi government and the international community, and by articulating the objectives and direction of assistance to Bangladesh, aid-related persons can share common awareness.
- The country assistance program revised in May 2006 aims to hold consistency with PRSP, reflecting the comments made by the Bangladeshi government. Result framework is attached with poverty reduction as the main issue to be dealt with.
- Sector-based assistance policy made by on-site ODA task force better reflects the concept of priority sector support, which is established by the country assistance program. Efforts have been
Long-term and continuous efforts are needed for the removal of anti-personnel mines. While Japan has been actively supporting this sector, there is a decline of support in recent years. Considering the seriousness of the anti-personnel mine issue and the need for continuous efforts, active support should be continued.

Although the “Zero Victim Program” was not directed for specific priority areas, countries or sectors, it is advisable to have clear strategies for future assistance.

The development of new mine detection and clearance technology is a necessary effort to achieve the goal of “zero victim” in the near future. While there is a limited assistance from the international community, there are calls for on-site demining activities over technology development. Nonetheless, it is desirable for Japan to make positive efforts to provide assistance in mine detection and clearance technology rather than prioritizing one over the other.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Recommendations</th>
<th>Follow-ups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation of Japan's Contribution to the Achievement of the MDGs in the education sector (priority issue evaluation)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Follow-ups</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- In the formulation process of the projects where direct and indirect contribution to education-related MDGs are expected, EFA (including education-related MDGs) and BEGIN must articulate their position in order to create a system in which the ongoing progresses are assessed by indicators for the purpose of monitoring and evaluation.</td>
<td>- A list of past performances from FY2002-2004 was compiled.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- In the education sector, many countries, mostly low-income ones, have advanced donor collaboration. Global initiatives such as FTI are continually developing. If education-related MDGs and EFA are meant to be achieved by internationally-set goal years in low income countries, donor collaboration and financial assistance will be unavoidable while taking into account of administrative capacity of partner governments.</td>
<td>- Japan announced at the G8 Summit in St Petersburg that it intends to introduce new FTI-related funds (catalyst funds and education program formation funds).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- With regard to contribution to international organizations, it is desirable to conduct thorough monitoring and evaluation by these organizations. As a result, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology should announce the results and contents of activities based on contribution-related programmes and if necessary, a system of self-monitoring and self-evaluation by these ministries should be established. Furthermore, by articulating the relevance of funds and other projects within the framework of each country assistance program, it is possible to improve the collaboration of funds as well.</td>
<td>- Internal evaluations are conducted basically at the termination of UNESCO Trust Fund projects, and the final report is sent to Japan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- By reviewing previous performances and lessons, it is advisable to consider the following factors for the region (or country) to achieve the goals of education-related MDGs: (1) The prioritized activities in a schema of efforts for achieving the MDGs, (2) The appropriate aid modality considering the level of economy and technology of the partner country, and degree of contribution and sustainability of education-related MDGs achievement, and (3) The effective combination of efforts and levels in an integrated approach.</td>
<td>- The website of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs updates information on the use of the UNESCO Trust Fund as well as the content and result of activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation on Japan’s Contribution to the Achievement of the MDGs in the Health Sector (priority issue evaluation)</strong></td>
<td>- For collaboration in bilateral assistance, in selecting individual projects, prior discussions are being held with the related departments (i.e. Regional Bureau or Economic Cooperation Bureau (current International Cooperation Bureau)) on the projects where adjustment may be required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- In order to classify ODA input condition (i.e. number of cases, numerical figures) toward the achievement of MDGs targets for monitoring purpose, there should be a database of input condition where one can register necessary information with appropriate classification procedures in order to sort health care programs.</td>
<td>- There is a plan to create brochures that demonstrate good practices in the education sector and to gather a list of collaborative projects with international organizations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Strategic assistance issues should be set and experts whose responsibility is to design and formulate appropriate programs in the aforementioned issues should be assigned.</td>
<td>- The division in charge is in the process of developing an information-based system. By using the evaluation classification matrix, a result summary and criteria of “Health and Development Initiative” is created.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- While acknowledging the need for human resources development, it is recommended that more experts who can create projects based on the strategic assistance tasks be sent to developing countries.</td>
<td>- For global challenges such as HIV/AIDS, JICA continues to dispatch wide-area experts especially to Africa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- It is advisable to formulate a project database which would function as a system where policy documents that concern the higher level of ODA policy, project plans and reports could be presented at any given moment. While the United Nations actively promote, coordinate, and evaluate projects for the achievement of MDGs, Japan has the experience in working with the United Nations and other agencies for collaborative projects in the field of health-related MDGs, and having evaluated and learned from the past achievements which are highly commended, it should strengthen the collaborative projects and corporation with the United Nations and other agencies.</td>
<td>- For there is a limit to the classification criteria of the database in being, to the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 2  An Overview of Evaluation Results

2.2 Results of Evaluations Conducted by Other Ministries and Agencies

This section covers ODA policies and overviews of their evaluations conducted by ministries and agencies other than the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in FY2005. The ODA policies implemented by ministries and agencies other than the Ministry of Foreign Affairs can be broadly classified into acceptance of trainees, dispatch of experts, surveys and research, and contribution to international organizations, and so forth. All ODA policies of relevant ministries and agencies are listed in the table at the end of this report. This section introduces overviews of the major evaluation results, as selected by these ministries and agencies. In principle, the evaluation results included in this section are policy evaluations conducted in accordance with the Government Policy Evaluations Act (GPEA), however, some non-GPEA evaluations are also included as reference based on the selection made by these ministries and agencies.

2.2.1 The Financial Services Agency

Technical Assistance to Banking Regulators in Emerging Market Economies (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Financial Services Agency

1. Outline and objectives of policies

In developing countries, a sound and stable financial system and trouble-free financial and capital markets are the essential foundation for continuous economic development. As the globalization of finance progresses, the stability of financial systems in the emerging market economies of Asia is essential for the stabilization of international financial systems, including that of Japan. Recognizing the importance of developing appropriate financial systems and of supporting the development of sound financial markets in Asia, the Financial Services Agency is proactively making efforts to provide technical support (financial administration training for officials regulating and supervising banks, securities, and insurance) to financial regulation and supervision authorities in emerging market economies of the Asia-Pacific region.

2. Outline of evaluation results

The training project carried out in FY2005 was planned and implemented based on the results of surveys conducted in the past, and meets the needs of emerging market economies.

As for financial administration training, the results of an ex-post questionnaire survey show that over 70% of respondents are practically using what they learned at the training, are examining concrete ways to utilize it, or have shared what they learned with their colleagues upon returning to their home country. It thus appears that the training by the Financial Services Agency has contributed to the capacity building through technical support of financial authorities in emerging markets and to the strengthening of collaboration with Japan.

◆ Notes

For more information, see the Financial Services Agency website: (http://www.fsa.go.jp/en/)
2.2.2 The Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications

Contribution to Creating a Global Society Integrated through Information and Communication Networks (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications

1. Outline and objectives of programs
To promote policy coordination by actively participating in conferences with international organizations, including regular consultations and policy dialogues, to deal with bilateral and multilateral issues in the field of information communication, such as the elimination of international digital divide (especially in Asia) and the improvement of market network and systems which promote network development, in order to realize a global society integrated through information and communication networks.

2. Outline of evaluation results
Through exchanges of opinions on information and communication policies, future cooperation, regulatory reform dialogues, and international issues, the Ministry makes efforts aiming at policy coordination between countries and with international organizations regarding information and communication.

As these, exchanges of opinion are carried out with the participation of high-level staff from various countries and the participation of persons who are able to sufficiently deal with international issues, their effectiveness and efficiency are recognized from the perspective of international understanding and international coordination.

Active and sustained dialogue, coordination, and support, are necessary through bilateral, multilateral, and other frameworks to deal with issues such as the elimination of the international digital divide and the development of market environments and systems that promote the development of network.

Notes
This policy is introduced as ODA policy, although it is partially financed by ODA budget. For more information, see the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications website: (http://www.soumu.go.jp/menu_02/hyouka/index.html)

2.2.3 The Ministry of Justice

Promotion of Training Programs, Research and Surveys in Collaboration with the United Nations (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Justice

1. Outline and objectives of projects
The Ministry of Justice (MOJ) carries out international trainings and seminars for the improvement of criminal justice administration and the promotion of international cooperation in the fields of the prevention of crime and the treatment of offenders as well as in the fields of the prevention of juvenile delinquency and the treatment of juvenile delinquents. MOJ also holds international meetings to analyze current situation and circumstances of international criminal justice, and participates in such international meetings.

2. Outline of evaluation results
MOJ implements technical cooperation through international training and seminars in accordance with the needs of recipient countries, including those in the Asia-Pacific region. Based on the evaluation result that this was an effective measure for the development of criminal justice administration in these countries, MOJ will examine further measures necessary to improve these
international trainings and seminars.

◆ Notes
For more information, see the Ministry of Justice website. (http://www.moj.go.jp)

2.2.4 The Ministry of Finance

(1) Assistance Extended through Multilateral Development Banks (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Finance

1. Outline and objectives of policies

Multilateral Development Banks such as the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank have extensive human resources with abundant experience and expertise, and they have advantages in being able to carry out effective assistance by using extensive information networks. The Ministry of Finance (MOF) recognizes these advantages, and as a responsible member of the international community, MOF is actively contributing to the activities of multilateral development banks and is utilizing expertise of these organizations in implementing bilateral assistance.

2. Outline of evaluation results

The Ministry of Finance, as a major shareholder of multilateral development banks, actively expresses opinions on lending practices, organizational operations, and so forth carried out by these organizations, and is making efforts to appropriately reflect Japanese principles of development and ODA policies in their measures.

In addition to funding for multilateral development banks, MOF has established the Japan Trust Fund in each organization, and is making efforts aimed at poverty reduction and economic development, including giving individual policy advice to developing countries and capacity building for civil society organizations. In FY2005, through the Japan Trust Fund of the World Bank and Asian Development Bank, MOF announced and carried out support of a total of 20 million dollars maximum in order to respond to outbreaks of avian and new types of influenza.

In order to boost efficiency and effectiveness of bilateral support from Japan, MOF also carries out financial assistance to developing countries in coordination and collaboration with multilateral development banks. In FY2005, MOF announced an initiative (Enhanced Private Sector Assistance for Africa (EPSA for Africa)) in partnership with the African Development Bank aimed at developing and cultivating private sectors, including fostering small and medium-sized enterprises and improving the capabilities of financial institutions, and carried out joint financing for the Republic of Senegal under this initiative. MOF also carried out joint financing together with the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank for the Socialist Republic of Vietnam and the Republic of Indonesia.

In this way, MOF has responded to the assistance needs of the international community, actively contributed to the activities of multilateral development banks, and succeeded in carrying out effective assistance while utilizing the knowledge and networks of these organizations.

◆ Notes: For more information, see the Ministry of Finance website: (http://www.mof.go.jp)
1. Outline and objectives of policies

In order for developing countries to move forward with continuous economic development, it is necessary to design and operate appropriate socioeconomic systems that are in accordance with the stage of development and economic structure of these countries. The Ministry of Finance is actively working to promote international cooperation and exchanges by carrying out support for human resource development and support for systems and policies in such areas as fiscal and tariffs and customs administration.

2. Outline of evaluation results

The Ministry of Finance is providing technical advice to developing countries through participation and the dispatch of experts to training sessions, seminars, and policy missions for policy makers and administrative working-level officials in developing countries, with the objective of fostering human resources who will be responsible for economic and social development. The following are the examples of support in FY2005.

- Fiscal and economic long-term seminar
- Special training in customs administration for East Asian countries
- Workshop on external debt management

In carrying out support, MOF grasped the requests and current situation of recipient countries in advance through spending questionnaires and fact-finding missions, interviewing local officials, and reflected them in the assistance.

Upon completion, MOF conducted questionnaire surveys on participants, to gather feedback of opinions on the content of training. MOF also dispatched evaluation survey teams as necessary to find out activities participants are engaged after the training and their requests for future training. MOF also made efforts with follow-up to maximizing effectiveness of training in Japan, including having officials of other countries who participated in the training held in Japan take part as presenters in local training sessions which were held after their return.

As a result of carrying out reviews so that human resource development assistance is more in line with requests of developing countries, MOF has received high appreciation from many participants on the curricula, the content of lectures, and so forth, which has led to the promotion of international cooperation and exchange.

Notes: For more information, see the Ministry of Finance website: (http://www.mof.go.jp)

2.2.5 The Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

(1) Promotion of International Cooperation in Education that Conveys the Heart of the Japanese People (ex-post evaluation)

Evaluator: Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

1. Outline and objectives of projects

Education is one of the most important areas for promoting poverty reduction in developing countries. The Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT), based on discussions at the Committee for International Cooperation in Education (a private consulting group of the MEXT Minister), aims to realize effective international cooperation in education using the experience and human resources of Japan and to promote “internal internationalization” of Japan.
2. Outline of evaluation results

(a) Development of a Cooperation Base System

A Cooperation Base System has been built as a domestic implementation system to promote the utilization of Japan’s experience in education and the dispatch of in-service teachers. The system was introduced in the final report of the forum for international cooperation in education in 2002 and in the Basic Education for Growth Initiative (BEGIN) announced by the then Prime Minister Junichiro Koizumi at the Kananaskis Summit.

Under this system, MEXT organized and gathered knowledge and experience on education possessed by persons involved in education in Japan at universities, non-governmental organizations, research institutes, etc., and created a model for cooperation in education with the objective of providing assistance for basic education in developing countries and improving quality of Japan’s international cooperation in education.

MEXT has promoted dissemination of the results of these undertakings through international forums, briefing sessions in Japan, and Internet websites (electronic archives) so that they can be freely referred to and utilized by persons related to international cooperation in education. Internal evaluations are also being conducted by external eminent persons in order to improve the effectiveness of this project.

(b) Improvement and reinforcement of the system for sending teachers to international cooperation projects

The number of teachers seeking to participate in the Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers “In-Service Teacher Special Participation System” was 164, which exceeded the target number of 100. In the end, 83 participants underwent a health examination and passed the screening. Since the system was established in FY2001, though there was a decrease in the number of persons dispatched in FY2002 compared to the previous year, the number of persons dispatched has risen steadily each year, and a certain level of results have been achieved. MEXT will continue to enhance public relation activities toward boards of education so that the number of in-service teachers participating in Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers and other international cooperation programs exceeds 100 every year.

(c) Cooperation with the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

MEXT has been supporting literacy projects in the Asia-Pacific region through contributions to trust funds and the dispatch of experts. From 1990 to 2000, enrollment rates for primary education and literacy rates in the Asia-Pacific region both rose in the medium to longer term, but they declined somewhat in the short-term, and the situation is unpredictable. While statistics for FY2005 are not available yet, the EFA trust fund review meeting was conducted in the following fiscal year based on performance evaluation reports created by UNESCO. It was confirmed that funds are being operated effectively and projects are being carried out steadily, which means that Japan’s cooperation is generally making a smooth progress.

In order to support UNESCO, which is leading the “United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD) 2005-2014” proposed by Japan at the Johannesburg Summit, MEXT contributed to the ESD trust fund and cooperated in dissemination and raising awareness of ESD at the international level. As the fiscal year in question was the first year of DESD and at the same time the first year of implementation of the project, MEXT focused on working for the dissemination of ESD and supported efforts such as holding of international and regional meetings.

As for projects implemented in FY2005, based on performance evaluation reports by UNESCO, the EFA trust fund review meeting was held in the following fiscal year, and it was confirmed that funds are being operated effectively and projects are being carried out steadily. Nevertheless, project procedures for starting the operation of funds at UNESCO have been slow, and there appears to be somewhat of a delay in progress.

◆ Notes

- Evaluation based on GPEA (evaluation of performance in FY2005).
- Non-ODA projects are included.
(2) Student Exchange Promotion Program (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

1. Outline and objectives of projects
In order to increase mutual understanding with foreign countries, to build personnel networks, and to make intellectual international contribution to the international community, MEXT has made efforts to promote student exchanges based on the “Plan to Accept 100,000 International Students,” which was formulated in 1983. As a result, in 2005 the number of overseas students studying at universities in Japan became 121,812.

2. Outline of evaluation results
As a result of the comprehensive promotion of related measures, the number of international students studying in Japan in 2005 was 121,812, up by approximately 4,500 compared to the previous year. On the other hand, the number of Japanese studying overseas based on internuniversity exchanges agreements in FY2004 was 18,570, up by approximately 3,000 compared to the previous year. The number of international students illegally staying in Japan in FY2005 was 7,628, down by 545 compared to the previous year. In a questionnaire for foreign students and former foreign students, over two-thirds had a positive impression of studying in Japan.

In terms of both acceptance and dispatch of international students, promoting further exchanges and ensuring the quality of these students are making a smooth progress on the whole.

◆ Notes
• Evaluation based on GPEA (evaluation of performance in FY2005).
• Non-ODA projects are included.

(3) International Cooperation by Universities and Human Resources Development for International Cooperation Activities (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

1. Outline and objectives of projects
In order to move forward with international development cooperation utilizing “knowledge” of universities effectively and efficiently, MEXT is developing the foundation for universities to carry out international development cooperation activities as organization, based on discussions at the Committee for International Cooperation in Education (a private consulting group of the MEXT Minister). MEXT is also making efforts to foster and secure human resources engaged in international development cooperation.

2. Outline of evaluation results
(a) Construction of a database for university bodies and faculty members
In FY2005, the number of universities registered in the database was 269, the number of teachers registered was 3,608, and the target figure for registered teachers was achieved. With registrations continuing up to now, the objective of “300 registered universities and 3,000 registered teachers to be achieved in FY2005” was on the whole achieved as envisioned.

(b) Development of Support and Coordination project for University Cooperation in International Development (SCP)
In response to the final report of the Committee for International Cooperation on Education proposed in July 2002, MEXT opened a Support and Coordination project for University Cooperation in International Development (SCP) to assist international development cooperation activities at universities in July 2003. The achievements of SCP in FY2005 are as follows: collaboration with 7 aid organizations; 27 organizations affiliated with universities in Japan and abroad; and 5 other collaborating organizations was launched or strengthened. These records surpassed the target of “starting or strengthening collaboration with 5 aid organizations,
10 organizations affiliated with universities in Japan and abroad, and 5 other collaborating organizations.” Based on the objective of developing for universities to carry out international development cooperation activities reached exceeding through the SCP, the number of commissioned projects reached 39, exceeding the envisioned standard of 36, which concludes that the results achieved in FY2005 were thus better than expected.

(c) Human resource development

Based on the objective of promoting the involvement of young human resources specializing in development issues in developing countries in international development cooperation activities and of fostering human resources, the total number of interns and recruits amounted to 96 in FY2005, surpassing the level of 45 in the base year FY2002. Progress has thus been better than expected.

With these achievements made so far, university-related information will be further improved, as is necessary for reinforcing organized and strategic international cooperation activities by freshly utilizing characteristics of university. Through the SCP, efforts will be made to strengthen functions of consultation, advice, and proposals in order for universities to carry out organizational and strategic international cooperation activities, by providing information and responding to universities individually, in accordance with their needs. Efforts will also be made to enhance collaboration between the SCP and the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), the Japan Bank for International Cooperation (JBIC), the World Bank and other core organizations.

◆ Notes
- Evaluation based on GPEA (evaluation of performance in FY2005).
- Non-ODA projects are included.
- For more information, see the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology website: (http://www.mext.go.jp/a_menu/hyouka/kekka/main5_all.htm)

2.2.6 The Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare

(1) Cooperation in International Organization Activities: Cooperation with the International Labour Organization Technical Assistance (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare

1. Outline and objectives of programs

(Program 1) Contributing to the development of gender-friendly employment and the expansion of work / employment opportunities for women in developing countries by providing financial assistance to technical cooperation projects undertaken by the International Labor Organization (ILO)

Implementing the following projects through voluntary contributions to the ILO and the use of ILO specialists:
(1) Project in China to support potential small entrepreneurs with the creation of job opportunities through entrepreneurship training, and micro-finance, etc.
(2) Project for managing the movement of labor out of countries in Southeast Asia
(3) Project which provides vocational training and enhances awareness of women aiming at expanding their employment opportunities in Cambodia and Vietnam

(Program 2) Contributing to the development of a healthy working environment through seminars, etc., to improve labor standards in developing countries
(1) Through voluntary contribution to the ILO, tripartite regional seminars involving government, labor and management is implemented with the objectives of disseminating and raising awareness of core labor standards such as the prohibition of forced labor and the effective elimination of child labor in the Asia-Pacific region with the provision of information and other follow-up projects.
(2) Carrying out labor policy fellowship projects for administrative officials in charge of labor and
employment policies in developing countries with the aim of providing training opportunities related to labor and employment policies of two or three countries in Asia, including Japan.

(Program 3) Contributing to increase vocational skill development in the Asia-Pacific region through cooperation with the Asia Pacific Skill Development Program (APSDEP)

Making voluntary contribution (US$130,000 in FY2005), to assist APSDEP activities, and to carry out projects in Japan, including seminars using Japanese experience, expertise and facilities.

(Note)
APSDEP is a regional program established in 1978 with the cooperation of the ILO. Its objectives include promotion of technical cooperation mutually utilizing knowledge, experience, facilities, etc., in the vocational skill development sector in the Asia-Pacific region, in order to encourage socioeconomic development of the countries within the region through improvement of vocational training and employment growth.

Japan extends contribution to APSDEP activities and supports projects such as seminars utilizing the Japanese experience, know-how, etc., in the field of vocational training.

(Program 4) Developing Japanese specialists in technical cooperation

Through hands-on training at project sites in the Asia-Pacific region where ILO conducts technical cooperation, projects are implemented to train Japanese experts familiar with the labor conditions in the region with knowledge and experience related to technical cooperation.

2. Outline of evaluation results

These programs were carried out through the ILO and the APSDEP. In addition to the full use of extensive networks, expertise and know-how accumulated by international organizations, the programs adopt a mechanism which encourages mutual cooperation of the members, including labor and management organizations. This enables a broad and efficient contribution to the solution of the issues relating to employment and labor in the countries in the Asia and the Pacific region, including those which cannot be covered by bilateral cooperation.

The ILO conducts mid-term or final evaluations by third-parties depending on the duration of the plan. By undertaking objective evaluations of programs, ILO is actively pursuing greater efficiency and effectiveness in the operation of the projects. The above activities as a whole have gained a good reputation among governments as well as labor/management organizations.

APSDEP in FY2005 worked to strengthen networks between member countries in the region, including the “Planning Meeting for Building Regional Skills Networks,” and promoted the mutual effective utilization of resources in member countries.

Overall, these programs have been highly commended by the governments and labor-management organizations of the participated countries, suggesting that the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare (MHLW) is contributing to the achievement of the goals, which is to cooperate with the activities of international organizations and to promote health, labor and welfare administration appropriate to the era of globalization. It can be concluded that the progress has been made in the achievement of these goals.

◆ Notes
(1) For more information, see the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare website: (http://www.mhlw.go.jp/wp/seisaku/jigyou/06jisseki/dl/10-01-01.pdf)
(2) The evaluation outlined here was conducted in conformity with the Government Policy Evaluations Act (Law No. 86, 2001).
1. Outline and objectives of programs

(2) Cooperation in International Organization Activities:
Assistance to Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) Human Resources Development (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare

(1) Long-term training programs using local training facilities owned by Japanese enterprises in the recipient countries to help local residents acquire basic vocational skills (APEC Vocational Training Project in Cooperation with Enterprises)

(2) International conferences for persons in charge of human resource development in the APEC countries in which public and private sector representatives discuss the modality of human resource development in the region (APEC Forum on Human Resource Development)

(3) Training programs with the participation of private companies to provide necessary knowledge and skills for white-collar workers in developing countries who are in leadership positions in distribution management and production management (APEC White-Collar Training Programme)

(4) Short-term training programs for persons in charge of human resource development at local enterprises to provide workers with vocational training on computerization (APEC Training Programme on IT Skills)

2. Outline of evaluation results

This project contributes to human resource development, which can be a bottleneck to economic growth in developing countries. It is also appropriate as cooperation for APEC from the perspectives of narrowing economic disparities and developing dynamism in the APEC region. The project has received high appreciation from APEC member economies, participants and local communities. It is believed to be contributing to achieving the objective of promoting health, labor, and welfare administration appropriate for the era of internationalization, and progress was made toward achieving this objective.

◆ Notes
(1) For more information, see the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare website: (http://www.mhlw.go.jp/wp/seisaku/jigyou/06jisseki/dl/10-01-02.pdf)

(2) The evaluation outlined here was conducted in conformity with the Government Policy Evaluations Act (Law No. 86, 2001).

(3) Contribution to International Society via the Promotion of International Cooperation:
Promotion of Technical Assistance for Human Resources Development in Labor Sector (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare

1. Outline and objectives of programs

(1) Developing human resources that contribute to building sound industrial relations in developing countries

(1) Training Programme of Personnel and Labor Managers in Developing Countries in Asia
In order to improve personnel and labor management skills in developing countries in Asia and to promote economic development in each country, Japan supports the projects of the Nippon Keidanren International Cooperation Center which receives middle managers who oversee personnel and labor management in their countries as organizational leaders to carry out training at Japanese companies.
(2) ASEAN-Japan Programme on Industrial Relations

The objective of this project is to promote stable economic growth within the ASEAN region by establishing stable industrial relations. The project was launched in FY2005, and it provides Japanese experience to the ASEAN region and promotes dialogues on industrial relations. Early in the each fiscal year, MHLW holds a committee meeting on basic policies with vice-ministerial and director-general level officials of the countries, and specific activities shall be implemented as commissioned projects. This project is a successor of those implemented from FY2002 to FY2004. The seminars are commissioned to the ILO Association of Japan.

(Program 2) Cultivation of vocational training instructors in developing countries

In order to address the shortage of skilled workers caused by industrialization of developing countries, this program aims to develop and expand vocational training programs in these countries through the Program for Government-sponsored Foreign Students. This project accepts overseas students on an undergraduate course (four-year program) or a graduate course (two-year program) at the Polytechnic University, the only institution in Japan specializing in the training of vocational instructors. The students learn a broad range of techniques and expertise required for vocational instructors, including specialized subjects, teaching techniques and expertise for the operation of training/teaching facilities.

(Program 3) Promoting skill transfers to developing countries through receiving workers from developing countries

MHLW is implementing (1) the International Skills Development Training Scheme, which receives trainees workers currently employed at private companies in developing countries, to train them to be future leader at private companies in their countries; (2) the International Youth Vocational Training Scheme, which receives young workers, who will serve as future skilled workforce in developing countries, to provide them with job training related to advanced industrial technologies; (3) the Guidance and Assistance Program for Foreign Trainees, which provides a variety of guidance and support to corporations which accept foreign trainees; (4) the Technical Intern Training Program, aimed at appropriate and smooth promotion of technical intern training.

2. Outline of evaluation results

Providing support through the voluntary cooperation between Japanese and overseas labor and management organizations for the development and cultivation of human resources that contribute to the stabilization of industrial relations in developing countries in the Asia-Pacific region enables more practical and meticulously designed projects based on the needs of recipient countries. This kind of support has been highly appreciated in the recipient countries in the survey results of project evaluation reports. This approach also has the advantage of building personnel networks and the access to the latest information through assistance, which are essential for Japanese companies to expand their businesses overseas. Overall, these programs appear to be contributing to international society by promoting international cooperation through technical cooperation for human resource development in the labor sector, and progress has been made toward the achievement of the goals.

◆ Notes

(1) For more information, see the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare website: (http://www.mhlw.go.jp/wp/seisaku/jigyou/06jisseki/dl/10-02-01.pdf)
(2) The evaluation outlined here was conducted in conformity with the Government Policy Evaluations Act (Law No. 86, 2001).
1. Outline and objectives of policies

There are approximately 850 million undernourished people in the world (2000-2002), 96% of whom are concentrated in developing countries. This led to the declaration of the two goals at the World Food Summit in 1996: to achieve world food security, and to halve the world’s undernourished population by the year 2015. At the World Food Summit: Five Years Later, which was held in 2002, the status of the achievement of the goals set at the World Food Summit was deemed insufficient. For this reason, there is a need for countries to step up their efforts toward the objective of halving the world’s undernourished population.

As the progress of desertification due to the depletion and deterioration of forests and overgrazing resulting from non-traditional slash-and-burn farming becomes an increasingly serious global environmental issue, it is important to make considerable efforts to restore and conserve agricultural land and grasslands that are being degraded in developing countries, and to disseminate and develop sustainable and highly-productive agricultural practices.

In carrying out official development assistance (ODA), there is now a greater need to work for consistency with Japan’s foreign and domestic policies. From this perspective, it is important to contribute to promoting understanding of Japan’s agricultural policies, including enabling developing countries to understand Japan’s position at EPA negotiations, and WTO agricultural negotiations, and so forth, as well as working to smooth negotiations.

It is also important to respond appropriately to unexpected and large-scale problems, such as natural disasters and zoonotic cross-border diseases.

In order to contribute to the reduction of starvation and poverty and the conservation of the global environment, and eventually to the stability of the food supply and demand in the world in future, MAFF will actively promote international cooperation in the field of food, agriculture, and rural areas through technical cooperation in these sectors, and food assistance, in line with circumstances and needs of developing countries.

2. Outline of evaluation results

Four items have been set as goals: (1) contributing to the reduction of starvation and poverty, (2) contributing to the conservation of the global environment, (3) promoting understanding about Japan’s agricultural policies, (4) appropriately responding to unexpected and large-scale disasters. Furthermore, objectives have been set for each project, and a questionnaire survey with five-tier evaluation was carried out on relevant persons in partner countries regarding respective achievement levels. The content of the questionnaire included points of view of adequacy, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability.

The questionnaire results were put in numerical terms (for example, excellent: 100%, poor: 0%, and so on) and tabulated. The target figure for each objective was set at 100%.

The results are as follows.

(1) Contribution to the reduction of starvation and poverty: 80%
(2) Contribution to the conservation of the global environment: 80%
(3) Promotion of understanding about Japan’s agricultural policies: 78%
(4) Appropriate response to unexpected and large-scale disasters: 83%

The objectives were on the whole achieved for each item, and MAFF will implement projects with even further effectiveness and efficiency with a view to continuing to achieve the objectives in the future. In the questionnaire, columns were set up for each project for inputting opinions regarding the project content, etc., and MAFF will work to reflect these opinions in revisions of project.

◆ Notes
- Non-ODA projects are included.
1. Outline and objectives of policies

Deforestation and degradation of forests of the world, especially in the tropical forests have become critical issues in terms of global environmental conservation including the prevention of global warming, and it is necessary to promote efforts aimed at realizing sustainable forest management based on international coordination. Japan is working to promote sustainable forest management in developing countries where these issues are arising through efforts such as the development and transfer of practical technologies, capacity building, the implementation of projects aimed at improving policies, etc., holding of international meetings participated by relevant experts from government agencies, non-governmental organizations, etc., and the funding of projects implemented by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO).

2. Outline of evaluation results

MAFF conducted a questionnaire survey with a five-tier evaluation on relevant persons including government agencies in the countries where international forestry cooperation projects were implemented. The results were put into numerical terms and calculated as percentages. Questions were set up regarding the “degree of contribution to sustainable forest management” of the projects, and a target figure of 100%, meaning that all respondents gave the highest evaluation, was established. Status of achievement was 90%.

In addition to “degree of contribution to sustainable forest management” mentioned above, a questionnaire survey with a five-tier evaluation on effectiveness, efficiency, etc. was also implemented and the identified results are reflected to revisions of the project.

◆ Notes
- Non-ODA projects are included.
- For projects related to international forestry cooperation, evaluation is carried out as part of “demonstration of multi-functional roles of forests through management and conservation of forests” policy. Objective (2) under the category of this policy corresponds to these projects.
- For more information, see the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries website: (http://www.maff.go.jp/soshiki/kambou/kikaku/hyoka/17/12_1.pdf)
2. Outline of evaluation results

To ensure a stable supply of marine products, the sustainable use and management of not only domestic fisheries but also marine resources outside the exclusive economic zone are necessary. It is effective to promote conclusion of agreements regarding operations in relevant waters, discussions with foreign countries, and cooperation with frameworks for the management of international aquatic resources.

From these perspectives, an objective was set to “maintain and increase fish species managed by international organizations and the number of fisheries agreements,” and as a result of actively promoting cooperation with resource management at regional fishery management organizations and discussions with relevant countries:
(a) regarding fish species subject to resource management, five fish species were newly added at the Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission (WCPFC) and the Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organization (NAFO) to bring the number to 75
(b) regarding the number of fisheries agreements, there was an increase of two agreements through accession to the WCPFC mentioned above and the conclusion of a private-secter agreement with the Republic of Madagascar, to bring the number to 49.

- Maintaining and increasing fish species subject to management by international organizations and the number of fisheries agreements: 75 fish species and 49 agreements

Notes
- Non-ODA projects are included.
- For projects related to international fishery cooperation, evaluation is carried out as part of “ensuring a steady supply of marine products” policy, objective (3) under the category of this policy corresponds to this project.
- For more information, see the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries website: (http://www.maff.go.jp/soshiki/kambou/kikaku/hyoka/17/14_1.pdf)

2.2.8 The Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry

1. Outline and objectives of programs

METI is supporting policy formulation, development planning, etc., in developing countries to form efficient and effective development plans, and using this support as the basis for the formulation of effective technical cooperation programs for economic development in these countries.

2. Outline of evaluation results

Efficient and effective planning and construction of industrial policies and systems as well as the formulation of development plans is essential for developing countries to realize sound economic development. Japanese assistance for developing countries, through policy and technical recommendations making use of the experience that Japan has built up, is very effective as a means of contributing to the economic development of these countries.

From the viewpoint of ensuring effectiveness of policies and systems established in developing countries, it is important to verify how these systems can be implemented and diffused, by clarifying problems of related systems as necessary.

It is necessary that this type of assistance be positioned as national policy from the perspective of promoting it as a Japanese contribution to the international community.
1. **Outline and objectives of programs**
   METI is supporting the establishment of foundations for economic progress in developing countries by assisting human resource development to engage in efforts to reinforce industrial infrastructure, liberalization of trade and investment, and economic integration in developing countries.

2. **Outline of evaluation results**
   With the progress of economic globalization, Japan must urgently address efforts to improve the environment for trade and investment in developing countries with which it has established close economic ties. Specifically, it is important to give priority to human resource development that will serve as a base of economic growth in developing countries. This policy is of significant public interest because the development of industrial infrastructure in these countries will contribute to the creation of a favorable environment for trade and investment in Japan. The involvement of government is essential since this ODA program helps developing countries achieve goals.

---

1. **Outline and objectives of programs**
   METI is assisting developing countries through joint researches with the countries utilizing Japanese research and development capabilities to supplement those capabilities of developing countries and thereby promoting the transfer of technologies from Japan to those countries.

2. **Outline of evaluation results**
   To complement research and development capabilities to deal with technology development challenges centered on energy and the environment and to achieve self-sustaining growth, demand for Japanese technologies in developing countries continues to be high, as Japan has a rich experience in these fields.

   Government involvement is necessary for two reasons. Firstly, it is extremely difficult for private companies to extend this kind of assistance in terms of profitability. Secondly, this policy needs to be promoted as official development assistance, which is Japan’s international contribution.

---

1. **Outline and objectives of programs**
   This policy primarily intends to increase the “visibility of Japanese aid” that utilizes Japanese experience and knowledge and to promote private-sector involvement in economic cooperation. It includes carrying out swift identification and formulation of yen loan projects that can make use of the experience and knowledge of Japanese companies, and identification and formulation of infrastructure development projects that draw on private-sector capital in developing countries.

2. **Outline of evaluation results**
   This policy is of significant public interest and requires government involvement because (1) the results
are not limited to specific companies but contribute to the solution of broader global environmental issues through the implementation of environmental conservation projects; (2) it contributes to strategic and efficient implementation of assistance by improving Japanese ability to make proposals; (3) it contributes to increasing the “visibility of Japanese aid” that utilizes Japanese experience and knowledge.

◆ Notes
For more information, see the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry website: (http://www.meti.go.jp/policy/policy_management/index.html)

2.2.9 The Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport

(1) Effect Analysis of Infrastructure Projects (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport

1. Outline and objectives of projects
At the Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport, efforts are being made to evaluate infrastructure development projects based on ODA and to examine methods in evaluating these projects, utilizing know-how and knowledge which have been built up through evaluations of infrastructure development projects in Japan for utilization in the effective promotion of international cooperation projects in future.

In FY2005, an evaluation was carried out targeting the “Project for Flood Mitigation in Ormoc City” in the Republic of the Philippines. In this project, river improvements and the construction of driftwood blocking devices and bridges were carried out based on a plan for flood prevention at major rivers in Ormoc City.

2. Outline of evaluation results
In evaluating the project, an interview survey was conducted on residents benefiting from the project, regarding circumstances when being hit by two typhoons similar in size, one in 1991 prior to the project and one in 2003 after the project, and the circumstances before and after implementation of the project were compared.

The results of the survey showed that implementation of the project led to decreases in the level of flood water, the number of houses affected, and the duration of effects, a decrease in the number of days of interrupted service of infrastructure, and decreases in human suffering and property damage. The results also showed social effects, such as a decrease in the number of job losers at the time of the flood, an increase in employment opportunities after the flood, and improved scenery.

◆ Notes
This is not the evaluation in accordance with the Government Policy Evaluations Act and is included for reference purposes only.

(2) International Cooperation Evaluation Projects (ex-post evaluation)
Evaluator: Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport

1. Outline and objectives of projects
This project examines methods for ascertaining effects related to socioeconomic infrastructure development in developing countries while conducting case studies, verifies the results of such infrastructure development, and promotes effective future international cooperation projects.

2. Outline of evaluation results
In order to quantitatively evaluate the effect of the development of the port infrastructure project in Kingdom of Cambodia, the Ministry measured the development effect of individual projects by making and utilizing an inter-regional input-output table in Cambodia. Furthermore, in order to grasp the ripple
effects on regional economies and effects on the lives of local residents, such as employment creation, MLIT conducted interview surveys on local people involved in industries related to transport. These surveys confirmed beneficial effects of the implementation of the project, such as a ripple effect for regional economies and an increase in job opportunities.

**Notes**
This is not the evaluation in accordance with the Government Policy Evaluations Act and is included for reference purposes only. For more information, see the Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport website: (http://www.mlit.go.jp)

### 2.2.10 The Ministry of the Environment

|(1) Evaluation Title: Measures to Protect the Ozone Layer (ex-post evaluation) |
|Evaluator: Ministry of the Environment |

**1. Outline and objectives of policies**
With developing countries entering the full-scale compliance period of control schedule stipulated in the Montreal Protocol on the Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, support for these countries is growing in importance. In light of this, support will be carried out in accordance with the needs of Asian developing countries so that compliance with the protocol by these countries proceeds smoothly.

**2. Outline of evaluation results**
It is extremely effective in terms of cost-effectiveness and will grow in importance in the future, to make use of the experience of Japan, which has already succeeded in phasing out major ozone-depleting substances like chlorofluorocarbon (CFC) in order to support for capacity building of developing countries in implementing ozone protection measures, including human resource development, improvement of institutions, and support for development of frameworks in Asian developing countries. It is necessary to continue to identify and formulate projects for the reduction of ozone-depleting substances in developing countries.

**Notes**
The evaluations of the policies of the Ministry of the Environment are based on performance evaluation methods and cover “programs” comprising groups of projects that share the same objectives; the Ministry in principle does not conduct evaluations of ODA projects per se. Accordingly, the evaluation above represents the overview and evaluation of programs including ODA projects and thus includes non-ODA projects. However, in order to facilitate understanding of the evaluation, those sections relating to ODA projects have been extracted from the policy evaluation findings and are reported here.
1. **Outline and objectives of policies**

   To conduct specialised training on programme formation and implementation know-how, which are necessary for Japanese local governments to accept trainees from developing countries.

2. **Outline of evaluation results**

   The training contributed to develop the system of accepting trainees from developing countries in Japan.

◆ **Notes**

   The evaluations of the policies of the Ministry of the Environment are based on performance evaluation methods and cover “programs” comprising groups of projects that share the same objectives; the Ministry in principle does not conduct evaluations of ODA projects per se. Accordingly, the evaluation above represents the overview and evaluation of programs including ODA projects and thus includes non-ODA projects. However, in order to facilitate understanding of the evaluation, those sections relating to ODA projects have been extracted from the policy evaluation findings and are reported here. For more detailed information, see the Ministry of the Environment website: [http://www.env.go.jp]
2.3 Results of Evaluation by the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)

2.3.1. Overview

JICA’s project evaluation is carried out with the objectives to implement the projects more effectively and efficiently, as well as to gain understanding and support of the general public by utilizing the evaluation findings to improve the quality of projects and secure accountability.

Since its reorganization into an independent administrative institution in 2003, there has been further demand for JICA to ensure result-based project management and accountability. To this end, JICA has made increasing efforts to expand and strengthen its evaluation systems, to improve the quality of evaluation, and to enhance the objectivity and transparency of evaluation findings. As part of these efforts, JICA performs evaluations at four different stages during the project cycle—ex-ante, midterm, terminal, and ex-post—so as to judge as objectively as possible the relevance of projects and effectiveness of its cooperation. JICA is also proactively making efforts to use external experts in the evaluation process and secondary evaluations, which are performed by the Advisory Committee on Evaluation.

There are two categories of JICA project evaluation: project-level evaluation and program-level evaluation.

Project-level evaluation is conducted at each stage of the project cycle, from ex-ante to ex-post stage. The results of project-level evaluations are utilized to plan and revise the projects, to make a decision as to whether to complete or continue cooperation, and to draw out lessons for other similar projects.

Program-level evaluation is conducted with the objectives of summarizing and analyzing from a broad cross-sectional perspective the effectiveness and implementation-related issues of JICA programs for a specific country, sector or development issue, or of specific forms of cooperation, and drawing lessons learned and making recommendations for future programs. As part of this effort, JICA is conducting “comprehensive analysis” with the objectives of taking up similar projects of specific challenges and fields, analyzing common tendencies, problems, and good practice, and extracting lessons and recommendations for better utilization. This “comprehensive analysis” takes up fields in which JICA has a record of achievements, challenges, and issues that are attracting attention in the international trend of cooperation. Furthermore, JICA is making efforts to strengthen program approaches, strategically combining different cooperation schemes with different sectors, in order to further improve the effectiveness of projects and solve the issues faced by developing countries. Efforts are also underway to improve program-level evaluation methods.

In order to improve the quality of evaluations and strengthen feedback of project evaluation findings, JICA introduced the “evaluation chief” system and “evaluation network” in FY2003, and developed a system for promoting the utilization of past evaluation findings in the ex-ante evaluation stage. In FY2005, JICA further strengthened these efforts and reflected evaluation findings when formulating the “Thematic Guidelines” by issue, which are the principles of JICA cooperation for each issue. JICA is also working to collect successful examples that have utilized evaluation results, and to accumulate knowledge. Furthermore, from the view of promoting the utilization of evaluation results and execution of accountability, JICA endeavors to make reports available to the general public and to post summaries of evaluation results on its website promptly. JICA also holds evaluation seminars to provide feedback concerning major evaluation results, particularly of program evaluations, to the people concerned in Japan and in the recipient countries.
2.3.2 Program-level Evaluation

(1) Synthesis Study of “Higher Education”

Evaluating Advisors:
Norihiro Kuroda, Professor, Center for the Study of International Cooperation in Education, Hiroshima University
Akiyoshi Yonezawa, Associate Professor, National Institution for Academic Degrees and University Evaluation

Head Office:
Office of Evaluation, Planning and Coordination Department, JICA
Satoko Miwa, Director
Kazuaki Sato
Akihisa Tanaka
Motoe Nakajima
Hiromi Takagi

Consultant:
Mitsubishi UFJ Research and Consulting

Evaluation objectives
As shown in the UNESCO World Conference on Higher Education (1998) and the report on Higher Education in Developing Countries: Peril and Promise (2000) by UNESCO and the World Bank, there has in recent years been a global trend towards re-acknowledgement of the importance of institutions of higher education. The role demanded of such institutions is that of so-called “Centers of Excellence” where knowledge- and information-based development activities take place, such as the “creation of knowledge” (research and survey), “popularization of knowledge” (education and human resource development), and “utilization of knowledge” (implementation of projects and direct social contribution activities).

For the development of human resources in developing countries, Japan has long participated in international cooperation with institutions of higher education. In recent years, based on the above-described movement, support has begun not only for the university activities focusing on education and research activities which have been implemented up until now, but also for university activities dealing directly with regional issues such as the issue of poverty reduction.

This evaluation analyzed the primary functions that universities are expected to fulfill as institutions of higher education, as “Centers of Excellence” in particular, and organized these into three categories: improvement of educational activities, capacity building of research institutions, and encouragement of social activities. It then focused on JICA’s support for higher education, mainly universities, and in addition to typifying individual projects according to the three functions, conducted cross-analysis of the results of evaluations of individual projects. Furthermore, special lessons learned and recommendations were drawn from past JICA cooperation activities in the field of higher education, particularly universities, and the evaluation was carried out with the objective of contributing to future support for higher education in developing countries.

Evaluation framework
(a) Evaluation questions
• When each project is analyzed from the perspectives of “improvement of educational activities,” “capacity building of research institutions” and “encouragement of social activities,” how does the project contribute to the university or society?
• What are the features of sustainability and impact for each of the above three categories?
• What are the lessons learned and recommendations derived from analysis of contributing and
inhibiting factors that affect the creation of effects for each of the three categories?

(b) Evaluation methods

(1) Major functions and categories of institutions of higher education

Taking into consideration their various fields, departments and regional characteristics, out of the JICA projects conducted up until now in the field of higher education, representative projects (12 projects in eight countries) were selected for this evaluation survey and categorized according to the three functions of institutions of higher education listed above.

(2) Evaluation analyses by category

In order to draw out the characteristics of each category, the approaches undertaken to respond to social needs in each project were organized. Additionally, a cross-analysis was attempted from the perspective of impact and sustainability.

(3) Overview and lessons learned

Following the above analysis, the results and issues of JICA higher education projects overall were summarized and studied comprehensively. Lessons learned which will contribute to the direction of JICA cooperation in the field of higher education in the future were considered.

Evaluation results

(1) Approaches of the project

The “improvement of educational activities” category projects adopted the approaches such as guidance on instruction methods aimed at improving the quantity and quality of teachers, and improvement of curriculums and teaching materials. In the category of “capacity building of research institutions,” vitalization of research activities through aiding research, the improvement of facilities, and guidance of research methods were all carried out with the aim of improving the facilities of the research environments and raising the capacity of researchers. These two categories have had adopted a mid- to long-term approach which aims to improve development issues by increasing the numbers of superior human resources in the industrial world and utilizing research results in the real world. In contrast, in the category of “encouragement of social activities,” it was assumed that the aim was to obtain results from activities in a relatively short timescale, such as through direct participation on the universities’ part in regional development projects such as grouping farmers, tree-planting, or fishpond management. In addition, as the educational and research functions of universities are utilized for social activities, the items in the category of “encouragement of social activities” in this survey are fundamentally combined with the other two categories.

(2) Impacts of the project

The two categories of “capacity building of research institutions” and the “improvement of educational activities,” which require mid- to long-term periods of time to achieve the overall goals, involve external factors; ensuring opportunities for employment and opportunities for the application of research outcomes, respectively. In projects aiming for the “improvement of educational activities,” efforts by universities to provide support for graduates in finding employment were seen. On the other hand, in the category “capacity building of research institutions,” endeavors towards affiliations between universities and industry or efforts to reflect research results in policies were not judged to be sufficient. It would be desirable for countermeasures that would overcome such constraint factors to be included in the projects.

As the category of “implementation of social activities” is combined with the other two categories, there were instances where concerned parties did not share the common goal of the project. Consequently, it is even more important in such projects than in the usual projects to set specific objectives beforehand, so that the participants share the same outlook.

Likewise, the results of the evaluation survey showed
that participating universities have a profound influence on generating the impacts. During project implementation, Japanese experts visited those countries and counterparts had opportunities to study in Japan, so both Japanese customs and culture have made an impact, and cooperation with Japanese universities has been built or strengthened.

(3) Sustainability of the project

Among all the categories of projects, the biggest issue of sustainable capabilities following project completion is that of securing financial resources. Financial management in universities plays an important role in the “improvement of educational activities” category projects, and the support is provided for project implementation in this area. “Capacity building of research functions” projects require external financing from the government or donors to continue the research, and when support is provided to academic research centers with a relatively weak organizational foundation, stable development has often been difficult comparing with “improvement of educational activities” projects.

In “Encouragement of social activities” category projects, universities working directly on society follow recent international trends, and there are many cases that are comparatively fortunate in fund procurement. For this reason, some organizations that are the recipients of assistance for “improvement of educational activities” spontaneously have begun social activities in order to secure funds. The needs for this kind of project are expected to increase in the future.

Concerning sustainability, in some cases, equipment supplied during the project has contributed to the assistance from other organizations and to organizational development after the project is completed. This shows that the importance of the selection of equipment during project implementation is needed to be recognized.

Major recommendations

• Forming composite projects for “Encouragement of social activities”

Among recent higher education trends, there have been an increasing number of cases, even in universities in developing countries, where efforts at voluntary social activities have been made not only as a social mission but also from the perspective of management strategies. JICA should attach importance to supporting higher education institutions’ efforts towards social activities through composite projects combining “Encouragement of social activities” with other functions, in strengthening the functions of higher education institutions, and from the rational perspective of utilizing the resources of regional universities.

• Support for improving management

In order to ensure sustainability after completion of the project, support for management, including operation and management, financial management and resource management, is indispensable. For projects in the category of “improvement of educational activities,” a comparatively large amount of support has been carried out for operation and management, but less so for those in the category of “capacity building of research functions.” For research to continue, support for operation and management for projects concerned with research functions is essential. In addition, as financial management has an impact on sustainability for projects in all categories, assistance for financial management is also important. Furthermore, support for resources has much significance for the sustainability of projects through raising the social evaluation of the recipient organizations, providing opportunities to work on social activities, and having a beneficial effect on the securing of excellent human resources.

• Continuous support with universities in Japan

Coordination between recipient organizations and Japanese universities has a significant impact, and the continuous support through such coordination after project completion is likely to contribute greatly to the

King Mongkut’s Institute of Technology Ladkrabang, Thailand
The Information Transmission Technology Research Center
sustainability of aforementioned organizations. It will be necessary to bear in mind the question of what kind of forms/contents of coordination will continue to support with national universities being involved on an organizational basis from the project formulation stage until the project is completed.

- **Promotion of South-South cooperation**

There were many cases covered in this survey where project activities had spread beyond the targeted regions or countries. Also, in particular cases, recipient organizations that had received long-term support from JICA went on to become bases for south-south cooperation or training in third countries, where they worked to popularize education, research and social activities. This development was brought about because the recipients of support were higher education institutions with skilled human resources and international networks with high project implementation capabilities. It is desirable that JICA continues to support the network building with other organizations from other countries/regions, in order to raise the sustainable capabilities of activities of recipient organizations and popularize/widen their impact after the project has finished.

(2) **Basic Education Sector in Honduras**

**Evaluation Advisors:**

Koichi Miyoshi, Professor, Graduate School for Asia Pacific Studies, Ritsumeikan Asia Pacific University
Kazuo Kuroda, Associate Professor, Graduate School of Asia-Pacific Studies, Waseda University

**Head Office:**

Office of Evaluation, Planning and Coordination Department, JICA
Satoko Miwa, Director
Kazuaki Sato
Nozomi Iwama
Masashi Yamamoto

**Consultant:**

Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development (FASID)

**Evaluation objectives**

In order to improve project effects further, JICA has been working to solve issues through strengthening program approaches which strategically bring together cooperation projects across the boundaries of project form and field. As part of such work, JICA is working to improve evaluation methods, and new program evaluation methods were discussed based upon the results of a survey on the assistance evaluation methods of other assistance organizations in FY2004. These methods aim to systematically grasp efforts to solve development issues in the countries concerned, and by confirming JICA’s position within this, and taking note of the coherence and strategic aspect of JICA programs in terms of areas such as tie-ups between projects, they seek to evaluate the contribution that JICA programs make to solving issues. This evaluation survey, based on such evaluation methods, was carried out with the objective of improving evaluation methods, at the same time as conducting an evaluation on a trial basis of the JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program in Honduras.

**Evaluation framework**

(1) **Evaluation questions**

What were the JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program’s contributions in developing the education sector in Honduras?

(1) What position did JICA projects have in the development strategy of the partner country?

(2) What were the strategic aspects (coherence, outcome)
of JICA projects during the period in question?
(3) How are JICA projects contributing to the progress of development strategy in the partner country?

(2) Evaluation methods
(a) Confirmation of positioning
First, the positioning of the JICA Basic Education Enhancing Program in relation to the development strategy (EFA-FTI Plan in this study) of the country concerned was confirmed. Furthermore, in order to check the appropriateness of the approach on the Japanese side, consistency with country- and issue-specific aid policies as well as utilization of cooperation experiences were checked.

(b) Confirmation of strategic aspect (coherence and outcome)
The study checked whether the JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program was planned and implemented with coherency, and verified what kind of outcomes the program has yielded. At the same time, understanding of the implementation process was attempted in order to analyze contributing and inhibiting factors.

(c) Evaluation of JICA program based on the concept of contribution
After checking the positioning and strategic aspect as described in (a) and (b) above, and examining the progress of development strategy (EFA-FTI Plan) in the partner country, which is the base for positioning, the contribution (plausibility) of the JICA program to the development strategy (EFA-FTI Plan) in the partner country was evaluated to draw out recommendations and lessons learned.

(3) Scope of evaluation
The evaluated JICA program was formed based on the results of a survey (Survey on Educational Environment related to Primary Education) implemented by experts in a development plan, with the objective of improving the school completion rate (that is, lowering the school dropout rate), which is an issue in primary education in Honduras. The program’s structure contains PROMETAM (Project for the Improvement of Teaching Methods in Mathematics) to improve the teaching skills of mathematics teachers and the Comprehensive and Regional Strengthening of Basic Education Model Project to address all other factors. Moreover, the formulation and implementation of this program maintains consistency with Japan’s policies which emphasize basic education, as shown in the results of the policy discussions, which posit education as a priority area; JICA’s country-specific project implementation plan; and the Basic Education for Growth Initiative announced in 2002.

Since April 2003, PROMETAM has conducted training for in-service teachers and prepared teaching materials in the area of arithmetic for three years as a technical cooperation project. Teaching materials for first to sixth graders have been completed, and the materials have been adopted as government-designated materials; the distribution of approximately 1.27 million copies began in May 2005 (total printing costs for national distribution was funded by Sweden). In regard to training, some effects were confirmed on classes conducted by teachers who underwent in-service training. Moreover, plans are underway for the implementation of training at a national level on the usage methods of the materials, to be carried out by Spain.

The Model Project was implemented as a group dispatch of JOCVs for three years from February 2003 and activities were being carried out with the aim of developing sustainable and applicable work (models) in other regions. Currently, activities which could be candidates as models, such as class observations, open classes, and calculation cards, are in practice, and plans are underway to create manuals through the examination of activities, to check these in detail, and to introduce them nationwide.

In the educational policy support sector, two long-term experts have been dispatched, and are involved in a variety of aspects of the JICA program and the Honduras Basic Education field such as in the formulation of the program, in the promotion of aid coordination (such as acting as chairpersons for donors’ meeting in the
A class taught by an attending teacher for the model project education sector); through these activities, they are playing a significant role in the JICA program.

Evaluation results
(1) Position of the JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program
In Honduras, as insufficient human resources have long been an impediment to economic growth, successive government administrations have emphasized development of the education sector. However, looking at the situation of the Honduran education sector, the rough enrollment rate for primary education stands at 97.3%, but the completion rate is at a low 68.5%, and with completion of elementary education within six years at 31.9%, the internal efficiency rate remains low. Various developmental strategies have been formed in the education sector to respond to such a situation; regarding the primary education sector, in 2002, the EFA-FTI plan was formed on the basis of past developmental strategies and efforts have been promoted in accordance with this plan. This plan aims for complete enrollment in primary education, and sets out the following three goals: (1) 100% of children completing the six-year elementary education, (2) 85% of them finishing within a six-year period, and (3) the average score being 70% for standardized tests on sixth grade mathematics and Spanish. There are five components as approaches for achieving these objectives: 1. Efficiency of Basic Education, 2. Teaching Human Resources with Quality and Efficiency, 3. Strengthening Pre-school Education, 4. Equality and Access to Intercultural Bilingual Basic Education, and 5. Rural Education Network. When government and donor participation for each component is considered, support is centered components 1 and 2.

The JICA program, while aiming to improve completion rates in the same way as the EFA-FTI plan, in the field of mathematics, which is emphasized in the plan, implements cooperation in components 1 and 2, which are the center of their endeavors, through the training of teachers and the creation of teaching materials. Both examples of coordination with donors, centering on PROMETAM, (funding for teacher training and the popularization of materials nationwide) and complementary relationships (assigning responsibility for in-service teachers, and for training to develop new teachers) are being established.

(2) Strategic aspect (coherence and outcome) of the JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program
◆ Coherence of the JICA program
The JICA Basic Education Enhancement Program in Honduras was, as previously described, formed under the common goal of lowering the rate of grade repeating as well as the rate of dropout in primary education. It was planned in consideration of the complementary relationship between PROMETAM and the Model Project. Even though these two projects were combined to aim at one common goal, it was difficult for these two projects alone to achieve the purpose of lowering the rates of grade repeating and dropout, requiring support from the government of Honduras and other donors to achieve the given purpose. Also, this program was not designed to achieve the goal through direct collaboration of the two projects, but with a complementary approach. This is also shown in that their result levels and implementation regions differ.

◆ Outcome of the JICA program
The PROMETAM, one of the components, as described before, has succeeded in disseminating the effects, such as distribution of teaching materials and deploying training nationwide, through the cooperation of donors in the outcome of the project (development of teaching materials and teacher training). The background of this success is that the PROMETAM was positioned along with the EFA-FTI Plan, and brought clear outcomes as a Technical Cooperation Project so that the effectiveness of the project was recognized by other donors through aid coordination. On the other hand, the Model Project is at the stage of extracting model activities. Furthermore, since it is more like a trial, it is
not positioned in the context of the EFA-FTI Plan, and full-scale coordination with other donors and nationwide deployment still has to be discussed.

(3) The JICA program’s contributions to the EFA-FTI plan (plausibility)

In order to look at the contribution of the JICA program to the EFA-FTI Plan from its position in the partner country’s development strategy and its strategic aspect and the progress of the development strategy, the flow of contribution for each component to the improved completion rate and its relationship with the JICA program was conceptualized as shown in the diagram below.

The JICA program is engaging in efforts to improve the lesson quality covered under Components 1 and 2 in the EFA-FTI plan, centered on PROMETAM. The JICA project’s outcome under Components 1 and 2, combined with results accomplished by other donors’ projects, are leading to higher-level outcomes. In order to raise the plausibility of improvement of the completion rates, which is the ultimate objective, it is necessary to assess and progress the level of importance of the efforts being made not only in Components 1 and 2 but also in other components, where work has made less progress. In doing so, it is necessary to clarify the positioning within the EFA-FTI plan of the Model Project, which deals with Components 3 and 5 and some of external factors outside of school, as well as ways to expand its outcome.

In addition, educational administration, which has had not explicitly provided comprehensive measures in the EFA-FTI Plan, was indicated as a problem in a joint evaluation of the EFA-FTI Plan. It has become clear that it is necessary to cope with this problem in order to increase the plausibility of achieving the ultimate goal, which is the improvement of the completion rate. JICA also needs to examine the direction of the program, including deciding whether to deal with these issues outside of the EFA-FTI Plan, which are not included in the focus of the program.

Lessons learned and recommendations

Recommendations for JICA’s Basic Education Enhancement Program in Honduras include the desirability of establishing a general manager to oversee programs in order to lead a coordinated management to achieve higher-level outcomes, and clarification of the position of the Model Project. Lessons to assist in future program formulation include clarification of the program purpose and scenarios, program implementation or scenario formation that includes expanded outcomes through aid coordination, as has been seen in the case of PROMETAM, and selection of schemes of
inputs according to the objectives to be achieved. In implementing methods suggested within this evaluation, it must be noted that selection of the developmental strategies which form the positioning base must be carefully made, and that evaluation objectives must be clarified to carry out the evaluation effectively and efficiently.

Training for teachers by JOCV using PROMETAM teaching material
Country: Thailand  
Project title: Reforestation and Extension Project in the Northeast of Thailand (Phase II)  
Division in charge: Forest Conservation Team 1, Group 1 (Forest and Nature Environment), Global Environment Department  
Total cost: Approximately 500 million yen (at time of evaluation)  
Period of cooperation: December 1999 – December 2004  
Partner Country’s Implementing Organizations: Royal Forest Department (RFD), and National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation Department, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment  
Supporting Organization in Japan: Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries

2.3.3. Project-level Evaluations (An Example of a Terminal Evaluation)

Background and outline of cooperation

Forests in Thailand have rapidly lessened due to the expansion of farmlands and an increased demand for lumber accompanying striking economic and population growth. In 1943, forests covered 63% (32.3 million ha) of Thailand’s total land area but by 1991 they had been reduced to 27% (14.38 million ha). Most notably in northeast Thailand, forests covered 42% (7.1 million ha) of the land in 1961, which was reduced to a national low of 14% (2.42 million ha) by 1985, accompanied by frequent floods, salt pollution, and droughts which jeopardized people’s lives and farming—a key industry of northeastern Thailand. In response, the government of Thailand has treated the increasing of forest coverage percentage and the diversification of local people’s sources of income as urgent national issues. National forest policies were formed in 1985 with the target of recovering total forested area to 40% (20.48 million ha) of the country’s total land area, and setting the National Long-Term Plan for Afforestation, which was to start from 1991 and which aimed to afforest 7.18 million ha by 2020 through promotion of afforestation by the government working together with the private sector. With regard to northeastern Thailand, where the destruction of forest has been the most severe in the country and where the situation is grave, the Afforestation Plan in Northeast Thailand was formulated for the conservation and restoration of natural resources, in particular water, soil, and forests, the expansion of incomes and employment, and the improvement of the quality of life in the region.

In FY1990, in order to proceed with the plan smoothly, the government of Thailand requested grant aid from Japan for the construction of a large-scale seedling field center which would be the project base; technical cooperation for various measures for improving seedling production technology, extending tree-planting and the social forest industry; and the dispatch of Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers to spread forestation operations among the region’s residents. This project extends from the technical cooperation and, based upon the cooperation results of the Reforestation and Extension Project in Northeast Thailand Phase I and the Follow-up Cooperation, it aims to establish sustainable forest management through the development of the rural forestry industry and farmers’ participation in response to the Thai government’s requests.

Evaluation results

- Relevance: The objectives of the project, which aims to improve and extend the sustainable forestry management techniques in small-scale plantations, are consistent with the Thai government’s directions, and tree-planting is encouraged in the Ninth National Economic and Social Development Plan (2002-2006) as well. In Japan’s aid policies for Thailand, environmental conservation including reforestation is also a priority issue. Furthermore, in addition to activities relating to tree-planting, a series of activities after tree-planting forestry market analysis and management, wood utilization, and information provision—are important for sustainable forest management, and
the cooperation. Since the project covers these activities, the relevance is high.

**Effectiveness:** Information on forest management was collected and analyzed at the Reforestation and Extension Center (REX Center) through a variety of surveys including socioeconomic surveys, lumber and forestry product market surveys, surveys on the actual status of privately-owned afforested areas, and impact surveys. Forest management information was then widely disseminated to people through various media (newsletters, information exhibition corners, radio broadcasts, etc.). It can be said that this has contributed to the promotion of understanding of the project, which targeted the wider area of northeastern regions of Thailand. Improving forest management techniques in small-scale plantations, and introducing information and techniques on forest management to the residents are key activities to this project, which aims to improve and extend the techniques on forest management, and contribute greatly to the accomplishment of project purpose through the achievement of outputs. Furthermore, through the establishment of a monitoring system, tie-ups between the various outputs in the project have been achieved, contributing towards the smooth accomplishment of project purpose.

**Efficiency:** Dispatch of experts was mostly appropriate in terms of timing, amount and quality. In terms of cost effectiveness, the performance of long-term experts was high with limited numbers covering various activities. Short-term experts with relevant experience and proficient techniques were dispatched. However, it was sometimes difficult to recruit and dispatch proficient experts, which influenced some project activities. Equipment was generally utilized in the Project because its utilization was based on the needs assessment. Procurement of some equipment was delayed. The training in Japan was good to gain specific skills and a wide range of experience for forest management. It was observed that those who attended training have attempted to apply and share the knowledge and skills gained through the training. The Thai side has made great efforts to secure the budget in spite of severe budget constraints in RFD. The timing of releasing funds was delayed in some stages partly because of the beginning of organizational restructure. The number of C/Ps was adequate, and the capacity and knowledge of the C/Ps were excellent even though the C/Ps were transferred in some cases.

**Impacts:** Some private furniture companies and local NGOs have started to distribute seedlings and forest management information to promote tree-planting activities in the model areas. Some model farmers have started to produce seedlings and to sell them to their neighbors. Outside resources for Training and Extension activities such as university professors and lecturers, Provincial and Tambon Administration Officers, successful tree-planters and farmers, and NGOs have recognized the Project Purpose, and started to extend information and techniques to other institutions and neighbors. Some groups were established to support sustainable forest management activities, and various activities have started such as charcoal making and marketing or agroforestry for demonstration purposes.

**Sustainability:** Although the restructuring of RFD under the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment has not yet finished, it is quite obvious that collaborating activities leading to possible increase of forest area will be considered as high priority. Therefore it is certain that RFD will provide continuous support, inclusive of financial resources, to sustain the activities. Since almost all of the equipment is procured in Thailand, they will be able to receive an appropriate maintenance after the project termination. Data-sharing between the REX Centers through proactive utilization of the computer network system is anticipated in order to achieve further outcomes.

### Promoting factors

The Thai counterparts had excellent technical skills and enthusiasm in forest management, and strongly
recognized the importance of community participation in afforestation. The establishment of a framework for the stakeholders’ collaboration, such as NGOs, universities, provincial forest offices and successful tree planters, has been one of the promoting factors for successful implementation of the Project.

**Impeding factors**

In line with drastic government reorganization, the RFD, which is a supervisory organization, was divided into three divisions according to the type of area where the forests exist and the role which they play: the Marine and Coastal Resources Department of the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (mangrove forests), the National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation Department of the same ministry (protected and conserved forests), and the Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives (commercial and private forests). While organizational restructuring of the RFD did not affect the basis of project activities, it caused some delays in holding a joint coordinating committee meeting, approval of project plan, and budget execution.

### 2.3.4 Status of Follow-up on past evaluation results

**Agricultural and Rural Development**

In planning and formulating Agricultural and Rural Development for Rehabilitation and Reconstruction through Community Approach (TRINCAP), launched in Sri Lanka in FY2005, the results of Thematic Evaluation in Poverty Reduction and Community Development were utilized. The project involves reconstruction of rural infrastructure with participation of the community in the Northeast Province, Trincomalee, which has been devastated as a result of the civil war that lasted over two decades. It aims to establish a development model for participatory agricultural and rural reconstruction through activities such as enhancement of community-based organizations and technical guidance in agriculture.

Based on the lesson learned that “mutual cooperation was not sufficiently obtained since the roles of the concerned parties were not adequately defined” derived from the thematic evaluation study, information will be thoroughly shared among the concerned parties prior to the launch of the project regarding the concept and method of operations as well as the division of roles. Even during the project, the information will be updated appropriately in the periodical joint committee sessions. Through such activities, the project aims to build a mutual cooperation system with the involvement of various concerned parties such as an agriculture support center, administrators of provincial and village levels, community-based organizations, etc., making use of the lesson that “a proactive approach was adopted to increase the incentives and initiatives of the concerned parties in the partner countries, which led to support gained from the concerned parties for the activities and the highest sustainable morale,” proactive and continuous participation of the community-based organizations, which are the key player of development, will be promoted in the project in Sri Lanka, by performing operations based on the community action...
plans developed by community initiatives.

- **Fishery**

The Fisheries Training Project in the Federated States of Micronesia utilized the results of its mid-term evaluation for its project management. Specifically, based on the activities performed during the first half of the cooperation period, the organizational system of the marine fisheries training school, which is the implementing body of the project, was reviewed at the time of mid-term evaluation and, as a result, a career counselor was placed at the school. Through the activities of the career counselor, the operations of the marine fisheries training school became widely known to private shipping companies engaged in marine fisheries, which used to be unfamiliar with the school activities. This contributed to gaining cooperation from private shipping companies in activities of the training school, allowing the use of private fishing vessels and regular ferries in addition to school-owned training ships for on-board training. As a consequence, training opportunities have increased and the quality of training has improved (more practical training opportunities), creating more job opportunities for students. Furthermore, effective management of practical training was made available without increasing the budget of the training school.

In other cases, lessons learned from projects in the past were used for the start of similar new projects. For example, the lesson learned from the Aquaculture Improvement and Extension Project in Laos is that conducting third-country training in Thailand was effective for the promotion of understanding and technical improvement of the Lao trainees because of similarities in culture and language. In addition, in the Freshwater Aquaculture Development Project in Indonesia, verification tests at the farmers’ level and visits to the more advanced farms proved to be effective for the dissemination of aquaculturing technology to small-scale farms. Based on these lessons, in newly-planned projects called the Freshwater Aquaculture Improvement Project in Cambodia and Aquaculture Improvement and Extension Project in Laos (Phase 2), the following considerations have been given at the planning stages.

- Promoting south-south cooperation (third-country training and dispatch of third-country experts)
- Technology exchange between the counterpart and experts of both projects in Cambodia and Laos
- Diffusion of aquaculture at the farmers’ level, highlighting training and exchange among farmers
2.4 Results of Evaluation by Japan Bank of International Cooperation (JBIC)

2.4.1 Overview

JBIC has conducted ex-ante evaluations of yen loan projects at the preparatory stage, and ex-post evaluations at the completion stage (individual evaluations and evaluations thematic evaluations). In addition, in FY2004, in order to fully develop a consistent framework from the ex-ante to ex-post stage, mid-term reviews, which carried out verification of project plans focusing on their relevance and effectiveness, were introduced for projects in the fifth year since the conclusion of their loan agreement, and ex-post monitoring, which carried out verification of effectiveness, impact and sustainability of projects, was introduced for projects in the seventh year since completion. In addition, evaluations are carried out not only for yen loan projects, but also for the Strategy for Overseas Economic Cooperation Operations, which sets the basic direction and priority areas in yen loan support.

In ex-post evaluations, with the objective of exercising full accountability and conducting yen loan project operations with greater effectiveness and efficiency, projects’ efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability are verified quantitatively as far as possible, taking all projects as the subject, based on international standards and with the addition of third parties’ points of view. In order to make the evaluation results easy to understand and objective, a rating is carried out at the fourth stage. From the perspective of accountability, all evaluation results are made public on the JBIC website. Ex-post evaluations consist of program-level evaluations (thematic evaluations), which comprehensively evaluate a number of projects based on a set theme, and project-level evaluations (individual evaluations), which take individual projects as their subject.

In the process of carrying out evaluations, the evaluation results, lessons learned, and recommendations are given directly and effectively as feedback from the Project Development Department’s Development Project Evaluation Bureau to the operations for examination and supervision of issues. The results, lessons, and recommendations are obtained via evaluation through a partnership between the relevant departments responsible for examination of yen loans and supervision of projects and the local offices stationed in the project area. In addition to being stored within JBIC, these are then utilized in an everyday fashion for raising the efficiency and effectiveness of future projects through the extensive sharing of the information with developing countries through feedback activities.

In order to make JBIC evaluation activities better, the Yen Loans Evaluation Experts Committee, including outside experts, is held twice annually. From the perspective of strengthening the evaluation frameworks from the ex-ante to ex-post stage, the committee conducts reviews from a variety of perspectives including evaluation systems, evaluation methods, feedback and the development of evaluation capacity. The contents of the discussions are reflected in JBIC evaluation operations and JBIC is endeavoring to improve project evaluation through the improvement of evaluation systems and methods, and to raise the objectivity of evaluation results.

In order to work towards raising the quality of yen loan projects, JBIC is promoting the proactive participation of developing countries themselves in the evaluation process. In FY2005 joint evaluations were carried out with six countries—Thailand, India, Sri Lanka, the Dominican Republic, the Philippines and Morocco—and in addition to sharing evaluation results, technology transfer relating to evaluation methods has been carried out. Furthermore, through a partnership with the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), JBIC is holding the ODA Project Evaluation Seminars, and working to support the capacity building among evaluators in developing countries.
2.4.2 Program-level Evaluation

(1) Role of infrastructure in poverty reduction

Outline and objectives

The eradication of extreme poverty and hunger is the first goal of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which represent the objectives that the international community need to come together to deal with. Economic and social infrastructure are indispensable for developing countries to achieve economic growth and sustainable poverty reduction; thus, in recent years, the importance of such infrastructure has been re-examined by the international community from the perspective of their contribution to the MDGs. However, the path from the installation of infrastructure to poverty reduction is complex, and it is necessary to develop new evaluation methods to verify its effects. The primary aim of this evaluation is the development of a method of quantitatively analyzing the contribution made by the installation of infrastructure to poverty reduction, through utilizing the Poverty Analysis Macroeconomic Simulator (PAMS), which is an economic method of poverty analysis.

Evaluation methods

In this evaluation of eight projects in the state of West Bengal in eastern India, to which assistance to a large number of infrastructure installations in the electric power and transportation sectors is provided through yen loans, in addition to evaluation through the five DAC criteria, an attempt is being made to quantitatively analyze the impact which the eight projects are making to poverty reduction through using the Poverty Analysis Macroeconomic Simulator (PAMS), a poverty analysis method developed by the World Bank. PAMS is one type of what is known as Poverty and Social Impact Analysis (PSIA), and has the characteristic of measuring impact consistently from the macro model through the meso level (mainly the labor market) up until the micro level (refer to Diagram 1).

![Diagram 1: PAMS Conceptual schema](image_url)
PAMS is a method which was developed primarily to predict the impact of a shift in economic policies (examples: reduction in expenditure on the military shifted towards education) on micro level poverty indices and income distribution, prior to the policy shift taking place; as a result, in these evaluations, which measure the post-project impact of an infrastructure project, it is difficult to use PAMS in its unmodified form. Therefore, the poverty impact has been predicted according to the method shown in Diagram 2, while retaining the consistency from the macro level to the micro level, which is a characteristic of PAMS.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{evaluation-framework.png}
\caption{Evaluation Framework}
\end{figure}

\section*{Evaluation results}

\subsection*{(1) Macro level}
At the macro level, the kind of impact that the project in question had had on the Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) of West Bengal was analyzed. A regression analysis of the project input (amount invested) against the outcome (amount of electricity generated, in the case of an electric power project) and the GRDPs of various sectors (agriculture, industry, services) was carried out, and the relational expression (coefficient of correlation) obtained. Using such methods, the projects’ effects were considered to be the gap between the supposed GRDP had the projects not been carried out and the actual GRDP.

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
\textbf{Percentage of GRDP increase as a result of the project} & Agriculture & Industry & Services \\
\hline
Effective project* & 8.1% & 30.0% & 9.7% \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\subsection*{(2) Meso level}
An analysis was done at the meso level into the kind of impact that the changes in the GRDP of various sectors (agriculture, industry, services) were having on the distribution of the working population between the various sectors through increases in employment. The group in question was divided six ways, between the various sectors (agriculture, industry, services) and also between cities and villages; then, as in the case of the macro level, through regression analysis the relational expression (coefficient of correlation) for the relation between the GRDP and the number of households belonging to each sector was obtained. Using such methods, the projects’ effects were considered to be the gap between the supposed working population had the projects not been carried out and the actual working population.

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
\textbf{Share of labor demography} & Agricultural Villages & Urban Cities & \\
\hline
Agriculture & Industry & Services & Agriculture & Industry & Services \\
\hline
51.1% & 10.4% & 14.6% & 1.0% & 8.0% & 14.9% \\
48.5% & 10.3% & 15.7% & 0.9% & 8.6% & 16.0% \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\subsection*{(3) Micro level}
At the micro level, the kind of impact that the change in GRDP sought at the macro level and the change in the working population sought at the meso level (increment) are having on poverty reduction is analyzed using a statistical method.

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
\textbf{Percentage of impoverished population} & Agricultural Villages & Urban Cities & \\
\hline
Agriculture & Industry & Services & Agriculture & Industry & Services \\
\hline
15.8% & 5.3% & 5.9% & 8.3% & 0.9% & 3.0% \\
21.0% & 16.5% & 9.4% & 9.3% & 5.5% & 4.6% \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\section*{Issues in method application}

\subsection*{(1) Simplification of the impact route through constraints on data}
In order to measure the impact at the macro level, which is the first stage of PAMS, it had initially been planned to obtain the relational expression (coefficient of correlation) for the relation between the input, the increment in outcome and the increment in GDP from the West Bengal inter-industry table in calculating the increase in the GRDP of West Bengal as a result of the project; however, as the inter-industry table in existence
was extremely old, a new regresional analysis was carried out under this data constraint, and the relational expression (coefficient of correlation) obtained.

(2) One-sided grasp of impact

A limitation of PAMS is that the impact on poverty reduction is seen solely in terms of income poverty. Therefore, in (for example) the case of a subway project, it is necessary to grasp the impact of the project in a multi-faceted fashion, through analysis of the effects in terms of improved convenience, such as time savings and improved access to schools and hospitals, through surveys of beneficiaries.

From JBIC

The survey quantitatively analyzes the course of infrastructure installation as it leads to reduction of poverty, and is the world’s first endeavor of its kind. In accordance with the above-mentioned “Issues in method application,” further improvement in terms of evaluation methods will be necessary going forward. In addition, for survey results across the macro, meso and micro level, the final conclusions will be derived, based on the draft final report by external evaluators, through further verification and feedback given to relevant persons in the government of West Bengal.

(2) Integrated water resource management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field Survey Country:</th>
<th>Tunisia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation Period:</td>
<td>December 2004 – August 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Evaluators:</td>
<td>Société Centrale pour l’Equipement du Territoire-Tunisie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader:</td>
<td>Dr. Francois Riviére SCET-Tunisie Project Leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doctor in Universite Paris VII (agriculture) After working for Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), he is currently involved in this project since 1993. His specialization is in agricultural village development, water quality and resources management, evaluation on effects of environment etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Outline and objectives

Since the current president, Zine El Abidine Ben Ali, entered office in 1987, rapid development has been promoted in agricultural development in the interior of Tunisia. Since the mid-1990s, three irrigation projects with the aim of rural development in the northern

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Water Pipeline Construction and Irrigation Project in Northern Region</th>
<th>Goubellat Irrigation Project</th>
<th>Barbara Irrigation Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loan Amount</td>
<td>14.13 billion yen</td>
<td>2.64 billion yen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disbursed Amount</td>
<td>10.71 billion yen</td>
<td>2.01 billion yen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executing Agency</td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture</td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Due to the increased demand from farmers, the area of Nefza irrigation doubled from its initial plan.
regions have been conducted through yen loans, and it was foreseen that all three would be completed by the end of 2004. Moreover, in the northern region which is a semi-arid zone, not only does annual rainfall vary widely depending on the area from 400mm to 1,200mm, but the region experiences periods of dry and wet weather at irregular intervals of 5 to 10 years; thus, appropriate water-resource management is an important issue. Consequently, in this thematic evaluation, it has been decided that mid-term evaluations be carried from the perspective of the five DAC criteria and the three projects’ general water resource management, in advance of the ex-ante evaluations conducted in the second year following project completion. The evaluations not only draw out the important issues in terms of ensuring and promoting the generation and sustainability of project effects and impact, but also the proposed action plans necessary for solving such issues.

**Evaluation results**

(1) **Interim evaluation results**

In the three target projects of the Water Pipeline Construction and Irrigation Project in Northern Tunisia, the Goubellat Irrigation Project, and the Barbara Irrigation Project, there were no problems of consistency regarding the policies (five-year plans) and the measures (water resource development plans) between the time of appraisal and time of evaluation. In addition, although there were significant delays in the construction period caused by the expansion of the irrigation area and delays in the delivery of concrete pipes, project expenses were below planned levels, and output results such as water channels were equal to or above planned levels. Although effectiveness and impact cannot be confirmed as only a short period of time has elapsed since completion, there is a case where, in the wake of increasing demand from farmers, the area benefitting from irrigation has been expanded by more than 2,000ha, and going forward it is predicted that the desired objectives will be achieved.

(2) **Future issues (for effectiveness/impact and ensuring/promoting sustainability)**

The following three important issues have been extracted through interim evaluations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human resource and organization issues</th>
<th>There is a need to build the capacity of farmers and water users association to manage and operate irrigation facilities. Due to the absence of registered land certificates by the farmers, there is difficulty in borrowing funds from financial institutions to construct irrigation facilities in agricultural area.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land related issues</td>
<td>There is a need for more appropriate water resource management coping with poor penetration of irrigated water, caused by the calcareous or aqueous type of soil in many sites. There is poor irrigation efficiency caused by slopes 10% inclination (approx. 6 degrees) or more (20% (approx. 11 degree) in some cases).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical issues</td>
<td>In Tunisia, the agricultural land is subdivided so there is poor irrigation facility because farmers share small number of terminal channels, and the land is vulnerable to salination due to insufficient development of drainage networks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(3) **Action plans for dealing with future issues**

With regard to the human resource organization issue of strengthening of administration and management capabilities of farmers and water utilization organization, JBIC has proposed a method in which the Agricultural Training and Extension Agency communicates know-how to the popularization cells (CVTs) in the northern region’s regional agricultural development offices, and the CVTs train the farmers/water utilization organizations. Furthermore, with regard to the procurement of funds by farmers, in addition to the Office National de la Réforme Agraire (ONRA) planning the re-grouping of irrigation areas and promoting land registration, JBIC has proposed the strengthening of financial institutions
such as the Tunisian Solidarity Bank and the National Agricultural Bank.

In relation to land-related issues of soil/gradient problems, JBIC has proposed that once an expert agricultural organization has carried out a detailed soil survey, it proposes an irrigation method that is suitable for the soil and conducts construction to solidify the ground base, thereby preventing wastage of water resources and deterioration in irrigation efficiency.

With regard to the common ownership of end-consumer water channels, which is a technical issue, JBIC has made a proposal for preventing deterioration in irrigation efficiency through the new introduction of hydrants with multiple water connections. In terms of measures against salt pollution, not only the additional construction of drainage network facilities but also monitoring of salt concentration and regular cleaning of irrigated areas is being proposed.

Feedback results

In order to consider future issues extracted from the evaluation results, and the action plans that have been proposed for solving such issues, workshops have been held on four occasions in the suburbs of Tunis and in the regions where the various irrigation projects that are the subject of evaluation are located. A large number of participants, including the Ministry of Agriculture, research/education organizations, financial organizations, NGOs and farmers took part in each seminar, and there were lively exchanges of opinions; opinions were expressed by farmers that, “We have inadequate knowledge and technology regarding irrigation, so we would like training to be carried out,” to which the Ministry of Agriculture expressed its opinion that in addition to conducting an action plan, “We will create opportunities for farmers/water utilization organizations to observe and learn from successful examples of irrigation projects.” In addition, at the general workshop held in the suburbs of Tunis, given the results of the workshops held in the regions where projects had been conducted, the vice ministry of agriculture announced that all action plans proposed would be conducted.

Future efforts

The Ministry of Agriculture has begun reviews aimed towards conducting action plans, but it is difficult to simultaneously conduct action plans that cover a wide range of fields, and therefore it is necessary to assign priorities. In addition, the Ministry of Agriculture intends to ask JBIC for technical assistance with regard to matters such as guidance for farmers on irrigation technology and improving fund procurement, and discussions are proceeding between the Ministry of Agriculture and JBIC regarding the specific way to proceed.

2.4.3 Project-level Evaluations

(1) Colombia: Aguablanca Water Supply and Sewerage Project

Objectives

To provide potable water and dispose of wastewater from daily life and industry through the establishment of water supply and sewerage facilities in the city of Cali, and thereby contribute to the improvement of the lifestyles and sanitary environment of the city residents, and to preventing the pollution of the Cauca River.

Evaluation results

In this project, a water treatment site and sewerage site were established more or less in line with plans. The time period was considerably greater than planned because time was required for hiring consultants and obtaining permits for land use, but projects costs were less than planned.
The plan for the water supply project set a water-supplied population of 1,550,000 people and an average daily water supply volume of 600,000m$^3$ per day; against this, the actual performance in 2004 was a water-supplied population of 2,200,000 people, and an average daily water supply volume of 612,350m$^3$, achieving amounts approximately in line with the plan.

For the sewerage project, the plan had set an average daily wastewater treatment volume of 475,200m$^3$ but, as a large number of residents dispose of daily wastewater into rainwater channels and because trash built up in wastewater channels caused wastewater to overflow, levels in 2003 had risen no higher than 228,960m$^3$.

In terms of lifestyle and sanitary improvements, the mortality rate in Cali for children under one year (per 1,000 births) has been improved from 5 (in 1986) to 0.3 (in 2003)*. However, regarded by Japanese river water quality standards, there is room for improvement in the quality of the water of the Cauca River.

In terms of the technical aspects of the Empresas Municipales De Cali (EMCALI), there are no problems with the water supply project, but there is room for improvement including in the application of manuals in the sewerage project. In structural and financial aspects, the right of supervision over EMCALI was transferred from the city of Cali in 2003 to the central government, under whose direction managerial restructuring is currently being proceeded.

As recommendations, the strengthening of efforts to crack down on illegal connection to rainwater canals, the improvement of trash collection systems, educational activities, and the strengthening of administration and management capabilities for sewerage facilities are desirable.

* The mortality rate for children under one year in Colombia in 2003 (per 1,000 births) was 18.

**Third-party evaluator’s opinion**

This project is contributing towards meeting Millennium Development Goals such as reductions in the infant mortality rate. Going forward, impact surveys on the effect on household incomes, and promotion of the correct use of water supply and sewerage facilities through school education will be important.

**Third-party evaluator**

Mr. Diego Villegas Navarro (Private company) 
BA from Antioch University (Sociology). Currently, private consultant. Previously, representative of the Colombian International Cooperation Agency. His specialties are social development, participation-style planning, monitoring and evaluation.
Chapter 2  An Overview of Evaluation Results

Water Quality of Cauca River (*1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Water Quality of Cauca River (*2)</th>
<th>Japanese Water Quality Standards for Rivers (*3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential of Hydrogen (pH)</td>
<td>7.10</td>
<td>6.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD)</td>
<td>8.80mg/l</td>
<td>4.23mg/l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Suspended Substance (TSS)</td>
<td>172.0mg/l</td>
<td>84.0mg/l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissolved Oxygen (DO)</td>
<td>0.60mg/l</td>
<td>2.17mg/l</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Autonoma Regional del Cauca (CVC)

(*1) Due to the lack of water quality standards for river in Columbia, this analysis uses Japanese standards

(*2) The site of measurement was 49 km downstream from the Cali sewage treatment plant. The data above are spot checks and do not represent annual averages.

(*3) Japanese water quality standards are the standards for ‘tap water grade 3, and marine products grade 2’.

Results from the Beneficiary Survey (Object: 100 resident households in the city of Cali)

Out of 100 resident households which were part of the beneficiary survey, 96 households state ‘release from labor of carrying water’ as the positive impact of this project, and due to the decrease in the number of water-borne infectious illness that dropped from 15 to 4 households after the implementation of the project, it appears that the project contributes to the improvement of the resident’s livelihood and sanitary condition.

Change Before/After the implementation of project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Before implementation of project</th>
<th>After implementation of project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of residents that state ‘release from the labor of carrying water’ as positive impact</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases of water-borne infectious illness</td>
<td>15 households</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(2) Indonesia: Bandung Institute of Technology Facilities Project (2)

External Evaluator: Takako Haraguchi, Global Link Management Co., Ltd.
Field Survey: September 2004

Objectives

This project aims to raise interdepartmental efficiency, enhance education qualitatively and quantitatively, and strengthen research activities at Bandung Institute of Technology through the establishment of facilities and the conducting of study abroad programs for instructors, and thereby contribute to the development of engineering in Indonesia through the fostering of human resources and the development and popularization of technology.

In 1993, the number of years taken to graduate was on average 6.3 years in the undergraduate departments and 3.3 years in the master’s programs; however, by 2003 these had shrunk to 5.1 years and 2.6 years, respectively. The number of graduate students rose from 910 students in 1993 to 3,375 students in 2003, 1.7 times the target figure (2,000 students). A qualitative and quantitative enhancement was seen in education; for example, the percentage of instructors with master’s degrees or doctorates rose from 50% in 1994 to 90% in 2003, exceeding the target figure of 70%. Research activities likewise have been strengthened, with the number of such activities rising from 340 in 1993 to 434 in 2003, and joint projects/commissioned research projects being conducted with almost 60 companies. The results of some research (petrochemistry, software, etc.) have been commercialized, and are being utilized by companies.

Evaluation results

In this project, the construction of facilities for education and research, the procurement of materials, the study abroad program for instructors and technical assistance (establishment of a curriculum) were carried out more or less according to plan. The time period was approximately according to plan, and project costs were below planned levels.

At this university, which is responsible for administration/management, there are no problems in the technical aspects, but with the structure currently being transferred following the acquisition of judicial personality in 2000, it will be necessary to pay attention to the administration/management structure following the transfer. In terms of financial aspects, the administration/
management budget allocated for each department is inadequate, and each department is thus procuring funds through its own efforts.

It is desirable for each department to supervise the state of its own administration/management, and expand good examples in this area.

**Third-party evaluator’s opinion**

This project has granted students higher-level and broad-ranging opportunities for learning in terms of science and technology, and is leading to the fostering of human resources who can become leaders in their respective fields.

**Third-party evaluator**

Ms. Ema Witolar (International organization)

Master’s degree at the University of Indonesia (Human ecology). Currently, United Nations Special Ambassador, UNDP Senior Advisor. Former Minister of Settlement and Regional Infrastructure. Her speciality is environmental science.

### Outline of Bandung Institute of Technology

Located in the city of Bandung in West Java, in addition to being one of Indonesia’s oldest universities, having been established in its previous form in 1920, this university possesses the country’s highest academic levels in the field of science and technology, and as such has come to play an important role in producing the human resources which have formed the core of the country’s development up until now, in providing further education instructors in Indonesian universities, in advising on Indonesia technological policies, and in engineering development. In 2000, the Institute ranked 21st in the publication Asiaweek’s ranking of Asia’s best science and technology universities.

### Results of research using facilities/equipment installed through this project

The development/design of engine oil and engine oil containers was consigned by Indonesia’s national oil company to the Department of Chemical Engineering of the Faculty of Industrial Technology and the Design Department of the Faculty of Fine Arts and Design.

---

**2.4.4 Status of Follow-up on Past Evaluation Results**

JBIC is establishing mechanisms to provide feedback for new kinds of projects and the projects currently being conducted from lessons learned from the ex-post evaluations of yen loans. Specifically, the evaluation results for similar past issues are reflected in the ex-ante evaluations and Special Assistance Facility (SAF), and are linked to improvement of projects.

In addition, developing countries and JBIC encourage the necessary improvements for projects based on the results of ex-post evaluations, and the results of this are verified at ex-post monitoring, which is conducted on the seventh year following project completion; if any areas of concern in terms of realization of results are seen, Special Assistance for Project Sustainability (SAPS), one of SAF’s measures, is conducted, and support is given to the efforts of the developing country towards securing sustainability.