

Evaluation of Japan's Official Development Assistance (ODA) in
Guatemala's Health and Water Sectors
(Recipient country-led evaluation)

1. Theme: Evaluation of Japan's ODA in Guatemala's Health and Water Sectors
2. Country: Guatemala
<p>3. Evaluators</p> <p>Evaluation team selected by Guatemala's Secretary for Planning and Programming of the Presidency (SEGEPLAN) that is composed of:</p> <p>Chief Evaluator: Marco Pérez (Professor, University of San Carlos, (MA in Project Formation and Evaluation))</p> <p>Consultant: Blanca González (health sector)</p> <p>Consultant: Mario García (water sector)</p>
4. Period of Evaluation: February, 2010 - March, 2010
<p>5. Description</p> <p>(1) Objectives</p> <p>The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability and appropriateness of the process of Japan's ODA projects in Guatemala's health and water sectors. The evaluation aims to identify the projects' strength as well as points that need to be improved for designing more effective and efficient projects.</p> <p>(2) Scope of Evaluation</p> <p>This evaluation reviews Japan's ODA projects in the health and water sectors between 2003 and 2009. Due to the large number of the projects (including those aided by "Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects"), only several projects were selected for evaluation. The selected projects differ in terms of aid modality, target region, etc.</p> <p>Grant Assistance for General Projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Project for Water Supply in Urban Areas at Quetzaltenango Municipality (Terms 1/2 and 2/2) · Improvement Project of the Principal National Hospitals in the Metropolitan Area of Guatemala <p>Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects:</p>

- 3 projects in the health sector (construction of clinics and equipment maintenance)
- 10 projects in the water sector (water and sewer pipe maintenance)

Technical Cooperation Project:

- Children's Health Project

(3) Evaluation Methodology

Field Study

The evaluation team observed the projects' current situations. The evaluation team members conducted interviews with representatives at the recipient institutions and organizations, beneficiaries as well as individuals residing in the target communities in order to identify the projects' outcome, and points that need to be improved for future projects.

Analysis of Documents and Related Materials

The evaluation team read and analyzed the ODA White Paper, the projects' application forms, basic research design reports, defect inspection reports, embassy's website, etc.

6. Results of Evaluation:

(1) Relevance

51.0% of Guatemalans live in poverty (including those living in extreme poverty) while 15.2% of Guatemalans live in extreme poverty. Considering the high poverty level, meeting the Basic Human Needs (BHN) has always been one of the major national policy issues in Guatemala. Guatemala has an extremely high demand for aid in the health and water sectors as well as in the areas of education and agriculture.

The goals of Japan's ODA projects in the health and water sectors coincide with recipients' need. The projects' approaches are appropriate in solving problems that the recipients face. Furthermore, the objectives of these projects are consistent with the Japanese government's ODA policy and its aid priorities for Guatemala.

(2) Effectiveness

The projects are very effective since the majority of the projects' goals have been achieved and the resources (water supply facilities, hospitals and equipments, technology transfer and so forth) provided in the projects have been used effectively.

(3) Effects and Impacts

A. "The Project for Water Supply in Urban Area at Quetzaltenango Municipality" achieved

its goals. Over 100,000 beneficiaries expressed their gratitude to the Japanese cooperation. In addition, appropriate technologies have been transferred to the Xelajú Municipal Water Company (EMAX), and no negative point has been found.

- B. “The Improvement Project of the Principal National Hospitals in the Metropolitan Area of Guatemala” dealt with equipment maintenance at the two national hospitals in the metropolitan area (“Roosevelt” and “San Juan de Dios”) and the quality improvement of facilities and equipment at San Vicente National Hospital that specializes in infectious diseases, including tuberculosis. Thanks to Japan’s cooperation, these hospitals can now provide prompt and appropriate medical consultations. In addition, these hospitals’ response capacity has been improved. Therefore, the projects’ appropriateness and positive impacts brought by these projects were confirmed.
- C. Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects (GAGHSP): The evaluation team has found that the aid modality was effective because the projects could meet local demands directly and promptly. The demand for the GAGHSP is extremely high in the health and water sectors since the country is mountainous. Assuring access to drinking water is especially difficult in mountain regions, and infant and maternal mortality rates are particularly high in the western highland region where a large number of indigenous people reside. The health and water sectors have been prioritized in order to help Guatemala achieve the MDGs. Japan’s cooperation that targets the health and water sectors in rural agricultural regions through this aid modality is extremely useful.
- D. The technical cooperation project, which is a highly effective modality, can adapt flexible assistance activities in accordance with local needs. The combination of equipment supply, training programs, and experts dispatch (also Japan Oversea Cooperation Volunteers) has widely been accepted. In the project target areas, the projects’ high effectiveness and positive impacts have been observed. Indeed, infant mortality rates in these areas have considerably been reduced.

(4) Sustainability

- A. Water supply facility quality improvement (in urban areas of Quetzaltenango). Xelajú Municipal Water Company (EMAX) now uses the transferred technology to administrate and maintain the facility appropriately. Furthermore, the company is making efforts to improve its administration (e.g. maintenance of water meters and reduction in water cost).
- B. Quality improvement project (Guatemala’s principal national hospitals): When the donated medical equipments needed repair or replacement, the hospitals got in touch with project-related consultants to obtain the list of manufacturers or representatives so that staff members at these hospitals can resolve the problems themselves. While these hospitals’ budget is limited, these hospitals are making as much effort as possible. The Japanese government continues to cooperate with these hospitals in terms of hospital

administration and administration and maintenance of the medical equipments through the *JICA Training and Dialogue Program*. Since the projects have provided both equipments and staff members, the continuity of the projects is assured.

- C. The Embassy of Japan in Guatemala undertook monitoring of the Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects two years after the projects' completion date. In addition, efforts have been made to assure the projects' continuity.
- D. Regarding the technical cooperation project, even though a part of the project's positive effects have temporarily been declined after the project was over (due to delay in payment of expenses by the Guatemalan governmental organizations to the counterparts), the technology transferred through this project including the "Five Basic Cares" on children's medical care has been established firmly in health and medical facilities. Additionally, the continuity and sustainability of the project in the technical aspect are worth noting.

(5) Appropriateness of the Project's Procedure

- A. Each Grant Assistance for General Project or technical cooperation project is analyzed for its relevancy between Japan's ODA policy and the needs from Guatemalan side through ODA policy consultations and other working-level meetings. Therefore the process is appropriate.
- B. Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects: The evaluation team members have observed some negative cases, which the impact of the projects were declined because of the lack of communication or coordination between local residents and recipient organizations, however the community-level needs were well considered when the both sides were designing the projects together. In addition, all recipient organizations possess excellent achievements in various development projects organized by Guatemalan governmental organizations or other donor countries. Therefore, in general, the Japanese embassy's judgment process regarding the projects' feasibility and the recipient organizations' implementation capacity are appropriate.

7. Recommendations

- (1) Since the success of Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects largely depends on the recipient organizations' implementation capacity and individual recipients' understanding and participation, it is fundamental to evaluate the projects content and its validity, recipient organizations' capacity (implementation, maintenance, and sustainability). Additionally, to ensure that projects produce expected outcomes and these outcomes last for a long time, it is recommended that the Japanese embassy offer enough support (including a monitoring of the project and technical assistance during and after a few years since its implementation).
- (2) Medical Equipment Donation Project: Given that Guatemala's Ministry of Public Health

and Social Assistance faces financial difficulties and cannot secure necessary budget for equipment maintenance, it is recommended to donate the minimum number of equipments that only require minimal cost for maintenance (i.e. those that can easily be repaired and replacement parts are widely available).

- (3) Technical cooperation projects: The government of Guatemala needs to improve their organizational and financial functions not only at the regional office level, but also at the ministry level, in order to maintain the transferred skills and knowledge and to ensure their auto-sustainability after the projects are completed.

(Note: The opinions expressed in this summary do not necessarily reflect the views and positions of the Government of Japan or any other institution.)



Incubators (Grant Aid)



TB Specialized Hospital (Grant Aid)
(The plate shows that this hospital was built with Japan's ODA)



Scale (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)



Speculum (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)



Incubators (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)



Incubators (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)



Plate with the ODA logo (Project for Water Supply Facility in Urban Areas in Quetzaltenango)



Plate with the ODA logo (Project for Water Supply in Urban Areas in Quetzaltenango)



Signboard with ODA mark for publicity

(Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects in Water Sector)



Water Tank (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)



Elevated cistern (Grant Assistance for Grassroots Human Security Projects)