

## Indicator 4.7.1

### Indicator Name, Target and Goal

**Indicator 4.7.1** Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies;(b) curricula;(c) teacher education; and (d) student assessment (repeat of 12.8.1 and 13.3.1)

**Target 4.7** By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

**Goal 4** Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

### Definition and Rationale

#### ○ Definition

This Indicator measures the extent to which countries mainstream Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in their education systems. This is an indicator of characteristics of different aspects of education systems: education policies, curricula, teacher training and student assessment. It measures what governments intend and not what is implemented in practice in schools and classrooms.

#### ○ Concepts

Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) nurture respect for all, build a sense of belonging to a common humanity, foster responsibility for a shared planet, and help learners become responsible and active global citizens and proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, inclusive, secure and sustainable world. They aim to empower learners of all ages to face and resolve local and global challenges and to take informed decisions and actions for environmental integrity, economic viability and a just society for present and future generations, while respecting cultural diversity.

## ○ Rationale and Interpretation

In order to achieve SDG targets 4.7, 12.8 and 13.3, it is necessary for governments to ensure that ESD and GCED and their sub-themes are fully integrated in all aspects of their education systems. Students will not achieve the desired learning outcomes if ESD and GCED have not been identified as priorities in education policies or laws, if curricula do not specifically include the themes and sub-themes of ESD and GCED, and if teachers are not trained to teach these topics across the curriculum.

This indicator aims to give a simple assessment of whether the basic infrastructure exists that would allow countries to deliver quality ESD and GCED to learners, to ensure their populations have adequate information on sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature. Appropriate education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment are key aspects of national commitment and effort to implement GCED and ESD effectively and to provide a conducive learning environment.

Each component of the indicator is assessed on a scale of zero to one. The closer to one the value, the better mainstreamed are ESD and GCED in that component. By presenting results separately for each component, governments will be able to identify in which areas more efforts may be needed.

## **Data Sources and Collection Method**

Information collected with the questionnaire for monitoring the implementation by UNESCO Member States of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms is used for the construction of the global indicator. For each of the four components of the indicator (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment), a number of criteria are measured, which are then combined to give a single score between zero and one for each component. Only information for primary and secondary education will be used for calculation of this indicator.

## **Method of Computation and Other Methodological Considerations**

### ○ Computation Method

The index for each component (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment) is the simple mean (or average) of the standardised score for each question that contributes to that component. This means that each question within a component is given equal weight.

For most questions, the possible responses are:

- 0 = no
- 1 = yes
- 9 = unknown

For questions A2, A5 and B3, an additional response is possible:

99 = not applicable

For question E1, the possible responses are:

- 0 = not at all
- 1 = partially
- 2 = extensively
- 9 = unknown
- 99 = not applicable

Question scores are based on all possible responses except 'not applicable' which are ignored. Where 'unknown' or blank responses represent no more than 50% of all responses to a given question they are treated as zeros in the calculation of the question score. This is to avoid giving an unfair advantage to unknown responses by ignoring them entirely. Where the majority (i.e. more than 50%) of responses to a given question are blank or 'unknown', the question score is not calculated and neither is the component index.

Each question contains multiple elements to be scored. The overall score for a question is the simple mean or average of the scores in the ranges 0-1 (for yes/no/unknown questions) and 0-2 (for question E1); 'not applicable' responses are ignored.

In order to ensure that each question contributing to a given component carries equal weight in the calculation of the component index, the score for question E1 is divided by 2 to give a value between zero and one.

The component index is then calculated as the simple mean of the questions scores for that component.

(a) Laws and policies

The following questions are used to calculate the policies component of the indicator:

A2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national laws, legislation or legal frameworks on education.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) and two levels of government (national and sub-national) = 16 responses.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

A4. Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

A5. Please indicate whether national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives on education provide a mandate to integrate GCED and ESD.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) and five areas of integration (curricula, learning objectives, textbooks, teacher education, and student assessment) = 10 responses.

Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

E1a. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (laws and policies) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and

education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed in education laws and policies in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses. Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Policy component score = simple mean of the scores for questions A2, A4, A5 and E1a. Where a question score could not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated and is reported as not available.

(b) Curricula

The following questions are used to calculate the curricula component of the indicator:

B2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are taught as part of the curriculum.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

B3. Please indicate in which subjects or fields of study GCED and ESD are taught in primary and secondary education.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) and twelve subjects in which they may be taught (arts; civics, civil or citizenship education; ethics/moral studies; geography; health, physical education and sports; history; languages; mathematics; religious education; science; social studies and integrated studies) = 96 responses.

Note that responses to 'other subjects, please specify' in the question are

ignored. If appropriate, during quality assurance answers in this category may be recoded to one of the other 12 subjects.

B4. Please indicate the approaches used to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses

E1b. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (curricula) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed in curricula in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses. Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Curricula component score = simple mean of the scores for questions B2, B3, B4 and E1b. Where a question score could not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated and is reported as not available.

(c) Teacher education

The following questions are used to calculate the teacher education component of the indicator:

C2: Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach GCED and ESD during initial or pre-service training and/or through continuing professional development.

There are two types of training (initial/pre-service and continuing professional development) and two types of teachers (of selected subjects in which ESD/GCED are typically taught, and of other subjects) = 4 responses.

C3. Please indicate on which GCED and ESD themes pre-service or in-service training is available for teachers, trainers and educators.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

C4. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach the following dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses.

C5. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to use the following approaches to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses.

E1c. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (teacher education), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed in teacher education in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses. Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Teacher education component score = simple mean of the scores for questions C2, C3, C4, C5 and E1c. Where component question score could not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated and is reported as not available.

(d) Student assessment

The following questions are used to calculate the student assessment component of the indicator:

D2: Please indicate whether the GCED and ESD themes below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

D3: Please indicate which of the dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses.

E1d. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (student assessment), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed in student assessment in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses. Note that 'not applicable' is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Student assessment component score = simple mean of the scores for questions D2, D3 and E1d. Where component question score could not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated and is reported as not available.

#### Comments and limitations

The indicator is based on self-reporting by government officials. However, countries will be asked to provide supporting evidence in the form of documents or links (e.g. education policies or laws, curricula, etc.) to back up their



responses. In addition, UNESCO will compare responses with available information from alternative sources and, if appropriate, raise queries with national respondents. At the end of the reporting cycle, country responses and the supporting documents will be made publicly available.

As for question B3 about religious education, Japan, in consultation with UNESCO secretariat, chose “not applicable” though it was not an original response option because religious education does not exist as a specific subject in the Basic Act on Education (national curriculum standard) of Japan and has not been conducted in schools established by the national and local governments.

### **Data Disaggregation**

N/A

### **References**

Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.

[http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL\\_ID=13088&URL\\_DO=DO\\_TOPIC&URL\\_SECTION=201.html](http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=13088&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html)

### **Custodian Ministries of Data**

Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

### **Custodian Ministries of Related Policies**

Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology

Japan Sports Agency

Agency for Cultural Affairs

### **International Organizations**

UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UNESCO-UIS)

UNESCO Education Sector, Division for Peace and Sustainable Development, Section of Education for Sustainable Development (UNESCO-ED/PSD/ESD)