In-depth Analysis on Sector Specific Issues: Practical Lessons for Development of New Seaports

The 16th ODA Evaluation Workshop
January 30th, 2019

Chika KAWAGISHI
Evaluation Officer, Evaluation Department
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)
1. Categories of evaluation
2. Examples of ex-post evaluation
3. Objective of the analysis
4. Lessons learned
Categories of JICA’s Evaluation

Project evaluation
  Ex-ante evaluation
  Ex-post evaluation

Comprehensive evaluation and analysis
  Thematic evaluation, etc.
  Process analysis
  Statistical analysis etc.
Categories of JICA’s Evaluation

Project evaluation
  Ex-ante evaluation
  Ex-post evaluation

Comprehensive evaluation and analysis
  Thematic evaluation, etc.
  Process analysis
  Statistical analysis etc.
Beyond individual project

Thematic evaluation


Identification and Analysis of Lessons

Meta-Analysis in the Energy Sector (2016)
A Cross-sectoral Analysis of Lessons Learned for Financial Intermediary Loans (2017)
Evaluation Example (1) Philippines Batangas Port Development Project (II)

«Project Description»
- **Disbursed amount:** 14,527 million yen
- **Loan agreement:** September 1998
- **Final disbursement date:** January 2008
- **Objective:** to raise the logistical efficiency of the Philippines by improving the Batangas Port in the Calabarzon region as an international trade port capable of handling container cargo for foreign trade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Effectiveness and Impact</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>①</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>③</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>②</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>②</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Evaluation year:** 2011
Evaluation Example (2) Philippines Mindanao Container Terminal Project

«Project Description»
- **Disbursed amount:** 8,265 million yen
- **Loan agreement:** April 2000
- **Final disbursement date:** September 2007
- **Objective:** To harmonize cargo handling and activate logistics in Northern Mindanao by constructing a container terminal in the PHIVIDEC industrial park, which is located in the northwest area of Mindanao Island.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectiveness and Impact</th>
<th>②</th>
<th>Overall</th>
<th>A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>③</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>③</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>③</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evaluation year: 2009
Evaluation Example (3) Philippines Subic Bay Port Development Project

«Project Description»
- Disbursed amount: 15,683 million yen
- Loan agreement: August 2000
- Final disbursement date: December 2010
- Objective: to increase cargo handling capacity for the Subic Port, and facilitate and promote distribution in the Central Luzon including the Subic area by constructing a new container terminal and rehabilitating existing port facilities in the Subic Bay Freeport Zone.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectiveness and Impact</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evaluation year: 2014
Evaluation Example (4) El Salvador La Union Port Development Project

«Project Description»
- **Disbursed amount:** 11,207 million yen
- **Loan agreement:** October 2001
- **Final disbursement date:** August 2010
- **Objective:** Meeting the increased demand for maritime cargo transportation through an increase of El Salvador’s port capacity by means of constructing La Union Port along the Gulf of Fonseca in the eastern part of the country.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness and Impact</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evaluation year: 2015
Objective of Analysis

Issues Identified in the ex-post evaluation results

Refine lessons learned to be more practical for JICA’s future projects

By conducting the analysis with an in-house expert having extensive technical knowledge and experience of the sector
# Projects Included in Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Start of Operation (year)</th>
<th>Background</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Laem Chabang Port Project</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Batangas Port Development Project (II)</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subic Bay Port Development Project*</td>
<td>2008/2012</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mindanao Container Terminal Project</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>Cai Mep – Thi Vai International Port Construction Project</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>○</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Salvador</td>
<td>La Union Port Development Project</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In Subic Bay Port Development Project, operation of New Container Terminal 1 and 2 commenced in 2008 and 2012, respectively.*
Background of New Seaport Development

1. Problems with the port existing near populated cities or industrial centers in metropolitan areas.

2. Expectation to contribute as a logistical infrastructure to support a new industrial zone in view of promoting regional economic development.
1. **Forecasting Demand**
   - Surveying the needs and business risk of port users such as cargo owners and maritime carriers
   - Ensuring all parties involved in the project understand all the preconditions for the manifestation of latent demand

2. **Policies for Promoting the Use of New Ports**
   - Announce the social significance of new port development and commit themselves to take actions.
   - Execute policies to which the government authorities have committed and secure steady implementation of related projects and measures

3. **Operation and Maintenance**
   - If a new port is to be operated and maintained by a private company, examine whether the business will be sufficiently profitable to encourage private companies to participate in.
For more details

Please refer to our **Annual Evaluation Report 2016**.

[Image of report cover for 2016 and 2017]

Thank you for your attention.