United Nations Security Council Reform

March 2022

Necessity of Security Council Reform

The basic structure of the UN Security Council, which has the primary responsibility for the maintenance of international peace and security, has remained almost unchanged since its foundation more than 75 years ago. Today, with profound changes in the realities of the global community, the Security Council is being questioned in terms of its legitimacy, effectiveness, and representativeness.

Changes in the Role of the Council

- The issues that the Security Council deals with have diversified over the past 75 years including: peacebuilding, conflict prevention, non-proliferation, counter-terrorism and protection of civilians.
- The UN needs a Security Council which can come up with effective resolutions and implement its decisions in a timely and efficient manner.



Size and Regional Representation

- Although the number of the Member States has nearly quadrupled and the regional composition of the membership has changed, the size and the composition of the Council have remained virtually unchanged since its foundation.
- For instance, Africa (54 members, 0 permanent seat), Asia (54 members, 1 permanent seat) and Latin America and Caribbean States (33 members, 0 permanent seats) remain underrepresented.



1

More than 25 years have passed since the open-ended Working Group was officially established and the discussion over the Security Council Reform has started. Yet divergent positions of Member States have made it difficult to come up with a common plan.

Japan, as a member of G4 (Brazil, Germany, India and Japan), supports the expansion of both permanent and non-permanent categories of the Council.

| | G4 (Group of Four) (%position presented in the IGN document in 2015) | AU (African Union) (%position presented in the draft resolution by Africa in 2005) | CARICOM (Caribbean Community) | L69 | UFC (Uniting for Consensus) |
|----------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|
| Member | Brazil, Germany, India and Japan | 54 African countries | 14 CARICOM member states | India, Jamaica, PNG, Saint Vincent, etc. | Italy, Republic of Korea, Mexico, etc. |
| Permanent Seats | 11 (+6) Africa(2) , Asia-Pacific(2), Latin America and Caribbean(1), Western Europe and other(1) | | | | 5 (status quo) |
| Non- Permanent Seats | 14 or 15 (+4 or +5) Africa(1 or 2) , Asia- Pacific(1), Eastern Europe(1) Latin America and Caribbean(1) | 15 (+5) Africa(2) , Asia- Pacific(1), Eastern Europe(1) Latin America and Caribbean(1) | 16 (+6) Africa(2), Asia-Pacific(1), Eastern Europe(1) Latin America and Caribbean(1), SIDS (Small Island Developing States)(1) | | Up to 21 (+11) increase of non- permanent seats and creation of new category of membership based on longer term non- permanent seats |
| Veto | The new permanent members shall not exercise the veto-right until a decision has been taken during a review (15 years after the reform) | The veto should be abolished but so long as it exists, it should be extended to all members including the new permanent members | Same as the left In addition, efforts must be made to limit its use | | Ready to consider formulas on how to best limit its use |

*G4 expressed its support to the Common African Position (CAP) in the G4 Ministerial Joint Press Statement (September 2021).

Issues to be discussed:

- Categories of Membership
- Regional Representation
- Question of the Veto

- Size of an Enlarged Council and Working Methods of the Council
- Relationship between the Council and the General Assembly

Road to Security Council Reform

Security Council Reform entails the amendment of the UN Charter, which requires:

- Adoption by a vote of at least 2/3 of the members of the General Assembly (129 countries)
- Ratification by at least 2/3 of the members including all SC permanent members.

Therefore, collaboration among the Member States is essential in achieving the reform.

After the Cold War: Rise in the awareness of the need to reform the Security Council in order to reinforce its function Dec.1993, UN General Assembly established the **Open-ended Working Group** to consider all 1993 aspects of the question of increase in the membership of the Security Council and other matter related to the Security Council (A/RES/48/26). The Security Council's response to the Iraq war in 2003 rekindled the discussion on the Reform of the Council Sept. 2003, Secretary General Kofi Annan set up a High Level Panel to analyze future threats to peace and security and recommend measures for ensuring effective collective action. 2003 Sept. 2004, Japan, Brazil, Germany and India launched a G4 group after meeting on the fringes of the UN General Assembly in New York. 2004 March 2005, based on the report by the "High Level Panel on Threats, Challenges and Change", Kofi Annan argued that the Security Council should be broadly representative of the realities of power in today's world and proposed two reform models (model A and model B) in his report "In Larger Freedom". 2005 July 2005, the G4 proposed a draft resolution on Security Council Reform and sought the way to cooperate with other Member States. However, it was not put to vote along with two other drafts by the AU and UFC. The **IGN** commenced in the General Assembly and majority of the Member States expressed the 2009need for reform through rounds of negotiations (A/62/557). Series of discussions did not lead to convergence.

Intergovernmental Negotiations (IGN)

| 2015 | Following the request by the Chair of the IGN, H.E. Mr. Rattray (PR of Jamaica), President of the General Assembly H.E. Mr. Sam Kahamba Kutesa presented a text that summarizes the positions and proposals of around 120 Member States. The Member States agreed that the text will be used as the basis of the negotiation through the adoption of a Roll-over decision. |
|--------------|---|
| 2016 | H.E. Ms. Lucas (PR of Luxembourg) was appointed as Chair of the IGN and several meetings were held. She summed up the "elements paper", which covers the two keys issues (the relationship between the Council and the General Assembly and the size of an enlarged Security Council and working methods of the Council). |
| 2010 | H.E Mr. Ion Jinga (PR of Romania) and H.E. Mr. Mohamed Khaled Khiari (PR of Tunisia) were appointed as Co-Chairs of the IGN. The meetings were held from February to June and discussed about the three remaining key issues (categories of membership, the question of veto, and regional representation). A roll-over decision was adopted without voting by the General Assembly in July. |
| 2017 | H.E. Mr.Kaha Imnadze (PR of Georgia) and H.E. Ms. Lana Zaki Nusseibeh (PR of the UAE) were appointed as Co-Chairs of the IGN. Many groups such as G4, CARICOM, L69, Northern Europe, and several African countries supported the launch of text-based negotiations. A decision to roll-over the past papers with emphasis on the paper created during the 72 nd session was adopted without voting by the General Assembly in June. |
| 2019 | H.E. Mr. Christian Braun (PR of Luxembourg) was appointed as Co-Chair of the IGN, and H.E. Ms. Lana Zaki Nusseibeh (PR of the UAE) was reappointed. Throughout the five IGN meetings in 2019, fewer countries made remarks promoting text-based negotiations compared to previous sessions. Revision of the papers included additional mention on improved representation of Africa and other developing states. In June only the texts created during the 73 rd session and "Revised Elements of Commonality and Issues for Further Consideration" were rolled over to the next session. |
| | H.E. Ms. Joanna Wronecka (PR of Poland) was appointed as Co-Chair of the IGN, and H.E. Ms. Lana Zaki Nusseibeh (PR of the UAE) was reappointed. |
| 2020 2021 | H.E. Ms. Alya Al-Thani (PR of Qatar) was appointed as Co-Chair of the IGN, and H.E. Ms. Joanna Wronecka (PR of Poland) was reappointed. Five meetings were held in 2021. In June, a roll-over decision was adopted without a vote, which included the commitment of all Heads of State and Government to "instill new life in the discussions on the reform of the Security Council", as mentioned in the Declaration on the commemoration of the 75th anniversary of the United Nations (A/RES/75/1). |
| | H.E. Mr. Martin Bille Hermann (PR of Denmark) was appointed as Co-Chair of the IGN, and H.E. Ms. Alya Al-Thani (PR of Qatar) was reappointed. Meetings were held after January 2022. |

Group of Four (G4)

The G4 (Brazil, Germany, India and Japan) was created in 2004 and has been promoting Security Council reform. The G4 calls for the enlargement of both permanent and nonpermanent categories as well as supporting each other's bids for permanent seats on the Council.

- In September 2015, the G4 Summit was held in New York for the first time in 11 years in order to add momentum to the Security Council Reform.
- The G4 leaders stressed that a more representative, legitimate and effective Security Council is needed more than ever to address the global conflicts and crises.
- Since 2010, G4 Ministerial Meetings have been held every year on the margins of the UN General Assembly.
- In September 2020, the ministers confirmed their intention to continue aiming for improvement in the IGN process as well as launching substantial text-based negotiations and stressed that the increased representation of countries with the capacity and willingness to contribute to the maintenance of international peace and security and of Africa is indispensable to enhance the capacity of the Security Council to deal with contemporary global challenges.
- In September 2021, the ministers shared their current understanding on the reform, exchanging views on their collective efforts to bring about concrete progress on the reform, and also reaffirmed their solidarity and resolve as the G4. The ministers agreed to support the President of the General Assembly so as to see progress in the Intergovernmental Negotiations. The Ministers also expressed support to the Common African Position and agreed to cooperate to push forward the reform process such as the early commencement of text-based negotiations.





Appendix

UN Member States by region



6

UN Charter and Resolution related to Charter amendments

Article 108 of the UN Charter

Amendments to the present Charter shall come into force for all Members of the United Nations when they have been adopted by a vote of two thirds of the members of the General Assembly and ratified in accordance with their respective constitutional processes by two thirds of the Members of the United Nations, including all the permanent members of the Security Council.

General Assembly Resolution 53/30, November 1998

...Mindful of Chapter XVIII of the Charter of the United Nations and of the importance of reaching general agreement as referred to in resolution 48/26 of 3 December 1993, *determines* not to adopt any resolution or decision on the question of equitable representation on and increase in the membership of the Security Council and related matters, without the affirmative vote of at least two thirds of the Members of the General Assembly.